

Discourses of Citizenship Compared: Junior High School Knowledge in Mainland China and Taiwan*

THOMAS KWAN-CHOI TSE

Configurations of citizenship are often reflected in school knowledge which contains normative and pedagogical discourses. Changes in the citizenship curriculum also capture the socio-political transition of a society. Drawing on textual and content analysis, this article presents a comparative analysis of the relevant textbooks at the junior high level in Mainland China and Taiwan in the late 1990s with regard to the portrait of a good citizen. It is concluded that the mainland's materials, combining socialist and republican models of citizenship, tend to teach their students to be patriots with good psychological quality, legal compliance, moral integrity, lofty ideals, an enterprising spirit and a distinguished sense of social responsibility for "socialist modernization construction" and national revival, while Taiwan's materials, more in a manner of liberalism and communitarianism, emphasize personhood, human rights values, public spiritedness, and civic competence, which lay a foundation for sustaining a budding democracy and civil society.

THOMAS KWAN-CHOI TSE (謝均才) is an associate professor in the Department of Educational Administration and Policy, Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong. His current research focuses on civic and moral education in Chinese societies. He can be reached at <kctse@cuhk.edu.hk>.

*The author expresses his heartfelt gratitude to the helpful comments and criticisms made by two anonymous reviewers and the journal editor on an earlier version of the article. He also acknowledges the funding provided by the University Grants Council of Hong Kong for the project "Politics and Discourses of Good Children: Moral Education Curriculums at Basic Education Stage in the Greater China Region" (CUHK 4675/06H 2007) on which this paper is based. Special thanks are due to Ms. Anais So and Ms. Wen-wen Zhang for their excellent and efficient research assistance.

©Institute of International Relations, National Chengchi University, Taipei, Taiwan (ROC).

KEYWORDS: citizenship; curriculum; school knowledge; China; Taiwan.

* * *



The formal curriculum in schools deserves special concern because it is the official transmission agent of social norms and legitimate culture by setting the goals and content of learning and by serving as the basis for textbook-production, instruction and assessment. It is also a contested terrain where competing discourses about civic virtues are at work. Such school knowledge, in particular that related to social subjects, not only provides factual knowledge, but also defines the appropriate attitudes, values and behaviors of an ideal citizen, which are often strongly under the control of the powerful, and penetrated by ideologies that favor the establishment.¹ Thus, they are the central objects of controversies and are subject to ideological critique.

Following societal changes at large, curricular change is often the complex interaction of endogenous and exogenous forces. A curriculum is a selection of cultural traditions and national philosophies embedded in a particular socio-cultural context. Recent rapid socio-political changes have significantly influenced the shaping of citizenship education across the Taiwan Strait, and have been a focus of recent discussion.² In the past, formal schooling in mainland China and Taiwan placed a heavy emphasis on training students in their obligations and responsibilities as members of families and of society.³ Formal education has also been characterized by hyper-ideologization and politicization in the divided China for many

¹Michael F. D. Young, ed., *Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the Sociology of Education* (London: Collier-Macmillan, 1971); Geoff Whitty, *Sociology and School Knowledge: Curriculum Theory, Research and Politics* (London: Methuen, 1985); Michael Apple, *Ideology and the Curriculum*, 2nd ed. (London: Routledge, 1990).

²Maosen Li, Monica J. Taylor, and Shaogang Yang, "Moral Education in Chinese Societies: Changes and Challenges (editorial)," *Journal of Moral Education* 33, no. 4 (December 2004): 405-28.

³Richard W. Wilson, "Conformity and Deviance Regarding Moral Rules in Chinese Society: A Socialization Perspective," in *Normal and Abnormal Behaviour in Chinese Culture*, ed. Arthur Kleinmann and Tsung-Yi Lin (Dordrecht: D. Reidel, 1980), 117-36.

years.⁴ Their relevant school curricula, full of officially-prescribed doctrines and values, served to reinforce political conformism, national solidarity and the authority of government.⁵

Since the late 1970s, however, communist China has undertaken economic reconstruction as the central task of national policy, maintaining the policy of reform and opening China to the outside world, while upholding the four cardinal principles with respect to party leadership, guidance of Marxism-Leninism and Mao Zedong's Thought, people's democratic dictatorship, and the socialist road. With the progress of the four modernization program and the establishment of a market economy, and under the wave of globalization, the super-stable mode of the traditional ideological-political system has been faced with great challenges.⁶ Accordingly, the school curricula and teaching materials have been reformed in recent years, which have not only ushered in a new socialist culture but have also actively perpetuated aspects of tradition.⁷ While it remains inseparable from ideological-political education during the last twenty years, there has been a shift towards a more liberal approach to *de yu* (德育, moral education), an umbrella term containing a spectrum of elements.

In Taiwan, in the late 1980s the Nationalist government's authoritarian rule over the island came to an end and a movement for education reform developed in parallel with democratization.⁸ The related curriculum reform is now moving towards a greater emphasis on learning Taiwanese

⁴Barry Sautman, "Politicization, Hyperpoliticization, and Depoliticization of Chinese Education," *Comparative Education Review* 35, no. 4 (November 1991): 669-89.

⁵Roberta Martin, "The Socialization of Children in China and Taiwan: An Analysis of Elementary School Textbooks," *China Quarterly* 16, no. 2 (June 1975): 242-62; Gregory Fairbrother, "Citizenship Education in a Divided China, 1949-1995," *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 24, no. 1 (July 2004): 29-42.

⁶Feng Chen, *Economic Transition and Political Legitimacy in Post-Mao China: Ideology and Reform* (Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1995); and Wei-Wei Zhang, *Ideology and Economic Reform under Deng Xiaoping, 1978-1993* (New York: Kegan Paul, 1996).

⁷Wing-On Lee, ed., "Moral Education Policy: Developments since 1978," special issue, *Chinese Education and Society* 29, no. 4 (July-August 1996): 5-102.

⁸John Copper, *Taiwan: Nation-State or Province?* (Boulder, Colo.: Westview, 2002).

culture and history, as well as a new-born pluralistic democratic system. Another new emphasis is being placed on individuality and the public good, together with an eradication of the official ideology embedded in the “Three Principles of the People” (三民主義).

Obviously, the progress of democratization and globalization has also been linked to the international climate of the time. The third wave of democratization since the 1970s has subsequently changed the course of political development in the Greater China region, and the intensive interconnections and interdependence among countries, led by advancements in technology and the rise and spread of neo-liberalism, has been accelerating over the past three decades.

These recent changes in Chinese societies have inevitably led to divergent patterns of citizenship. In a seminal work on changing citizenship in the Region, Alvin So argues that Mainland China’s socialist citizenship in the earlier years has been replaced by market citizenship in the post-1978 reform period; and Taiwan has switched from “Chinese citizenship” in the past to “Taiwanese citizenship” since the late 1990s.⁹ So focuses mainly on the institutional dimension of citizenship, and it is interesting to explore whether these changes also spill over to the domain of school knowledge.

While there has been no lack of studies on civic education curricula or textbooks in individual Chinese societies, relatively few have been comparative ones.¹⁰ With the complicated interplay of traditions and po-

⁹Alvin Y. So, “One Country, Three Systems? State, Nation, and Civil Society in the Making of Citizenship in the Chinese Triangle of Mainland-Taiwan-Hong Kong,” in *Remaking Citizenship in Hong Kong: Community, Nation and the Global City*, ed. Agnes Ku and Ngai Pun (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004), 235-53.

¹⁰Martin, “The Socialization of Children,” 242-62; Jeffrey F. Meyer, “A Subtle and Silent Transformation: Moral Education in Taiwan and the People’s Republic of China,” in *The Revival of Values Education in Asia and the West*, ed. William K. Cummings, Saravanan Gopinathan, and Yasumasa Tomoda (Oxford: Pergamon, 1988), 109-30; Fairbrother, “Citizenship Education in a Divided China, 1949-1995,” 29-42; Yasemin Nuhoglu Soysol and Suk-ying Wong, “Educating Future Citizens in Europe and Asia,” in *School Knowledge in Comparative and Historical Perspective: Changing Curricula in Primary and Secondary Education*, ed. Aaron Benavot and Cecilia Braslavsky (Dordrecht: Springer, 2006), 73-88.

litical ideologies at the cultural level, and the different paths of development at the social level, it would be interesting to examine prevailing citizenship discourses in these education systems and the values and behaviors promoted by the respective authorities, as well as the similarities and differences among these societies.¹¹ Fundamental differences may also exist between the Chinese and Western liberal-democratic views of individual-political community relationships with regard to issues such as human rights, democracy and nationalism.

To this end, this comparative study reports the composite images of “good citizens” portrayed by the relevant textbooks at the junior high school level (aged 12-15), the final stage of compulsory education, in each society at the turn of the new century. This is also to reveal the similarities and differences between these societies in terms of the civic virtues that are promoted. As such, this article can serve to complement the single case studies conducted previously and fill the vacuum in the field of comparative studies. While the textbooks collected are not the currently-used ones, the changing context of the late 1990s stated above was a significant turning point in the remaking of school knowledge across the Taiwan Strait. Furthermore, the choice of the 1990s’ materials also renders the comparison across the two societies more workable and meaningful—at that time we could easily locate a specific school subject and a single and uniform set of textbooks devoted to citizenship for analysis in each society. However, under the current curricular reforms highlighting curriculum integration, the subject boundary has become very blurred, spreading the elements of citizenship across a broad learning area called “Social Studies.”

Models of the Good Citizen

After providing the background information to the emergence of the texts in the previous section, this section will provide an overview of

¹¹Lee, ed., “Moral Education Policy.”

changing conceptions of citizenship. The meaning and connotation of contemporary citizenship is no longer confined to conventional legal definitions of membership and rights. It has become an integration of traits and qualities including knowledge, attitudes, values, virtues and abilities expected for a fully-competent citizen.

The connotations and priorities of citizenship can be understood from six distinct schools of thought in political philosophy, namely, civic republicanism, liberalism, communitarianism, multiculturalism, socialism, and cosmopolitanism.¹² The ancient civic republicanism emphasizes the attainment of the public good. It stresses patriotism, the ability and the will to participate in public affairs, as well as fostering civic virtues such as loyalty and bravery. Instead of exclusivity, universality of membership is endorsed by the school of liberalism. Liberalists cherish individual liberty and rights, and recognize pluralistic values. They prioritize protection of individuals over the accomplishment of the public good. Respect and tolerance towards others are amongst the cardinal virtues to be advocated. With the inheritance of the sense of public good from civic republicanism, communitarianism has revised the idea of “right comes first” that has been upheld by liberalists and stresses instead the importance of community by recognizing and strengthening communal identity through the nourishment of a communal spirit and the promotion of volunteering services. Multiculturalism, which best represents the interests of various disadvantaged cultural and ethnic groups, pays more attention to the reality of a heterogeneous society. It seeks to eliminate the conditions of oppression and deprivation, appealing to positive discrimination towards the underprivileged such as women, and gender and ethnic minorities.

In addition, “socialist citizenship” or communist morality is class-loaded and is entirely subordinated to the interests of the proletariat’s class struggles.¹³ The core of communist moral education is to denounce

¹²Will Kymlicka, *Contemporary Political Philosophy: An Introduction*, 2nd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002); John W. Morgan, “Marxism and Moral Education,” *Journal of Moral Education* 34, no. 4 (December 2005): 391-98.

¹³Vladimir I. Lenin, “The Tasks of the Youth Leagues,” in *Collected Works of Lenin*, vol.

and overturn concepts and habits of egoism and privatism so as to bring up a new generation with ideal communist qualities. To unite all the laborers, the significance and value of communist morality lies in discipline and laboring habits. The essence of education is to build a society in which everyone should devote his or her labor and efforts to the cause of communism.

Contemporary citizenship also displays multi-levels of attributes which show the continuum of citizenship from local, national to the world, as well as a concern with ecology. People can no longer hold onto their identities as national members since the escalating pace of globalization grants to all inhabitants of the “global village” with the perspective of cosmopolitanism.¹⁴ “World citizens” should care about international issues, in addition to their local matters. As environmental protectionism and the Green Movement have been sweeping through every part of the globe, traditional national borders have been shattered when people’s attention is drawn to various alarming global environmental issues and ecological preservation. The notion of “ecological citizenship” has modified and helped further develop the conventional notion of citizenship.

The above pure models could be viewed as ideal types and actual configurations of citizenship in various societies often hybridized and eclectic, mixing features of various schools of thought together. And apart from the above discussion mainly developed in the western societies, the complex local contexts for citizenship education development also deserve special consideration. Lee Wing-on highlighted the differences between the East and the West when summarizing the Asia-Pacific experience (including several Confucian societies).¹⁵ Unlike the western

31, 4th English edition, ed. Vladimir I. Lenin (Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1966 [1920]), 283-99.

¹⁴Richard Falk, “The Making of Global Citizenship,” in *The Condition of Citizenship*, ed. Bart van Steenberg (London: Sage, 1994), 127-39; Bart van Steenberg, ed., *The Condition of Citizenship* (London: Sage, 1994).

¹⁵Wing-On Lee, “Conceptualizing Citizenship and Citizenship Education: A Trajectory of Exploring Asian Perspectives” (Chair Professors Public Lecture Series, Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong, June 30, 2009), <http://www.ied.edu.hk/cplectures/include/>

focus on the individual—state relationship, Asian citizenship is rather “relationalistic” in terms of expanding social relationships from the self, others, and society to Nature. Asian citizenship education is also characterized more by conceptions of moral virtues and personal values than by civic and public values as conceived in the West. With a strong emphasis on self-cultivation and social harmony, a good citizen is commonly also seen as a good person. Accordingly, there is a close relationship between moral education and civic education or even an overlap of them. Lee also emphasized the dynamic and fluid nature of Asian citizenship, featuring eclecticism and substantial tensions due to various value orientations. Lee’s regional perspective could serve as a heuristic tool for analyzing citizenship curricula in other Asian societies. It is crucial to find whether there are significant “Asia-Pacific” features in citizenship education. If so, this could broaden the framework of citizenship (education) and enrich the international literature.

Materials and Methods of Analysis

A discourse, usually manifested as a text, is a system of meanings or a set of signifying practices mediating assumptions, ideology and cognition. The role of a discourse is crucial, as our worldview is interpreted through languages and a variety of rhetorical devices through which meanings are given to social realities and making sense of ourselves.¹⁶ These patterned representations can be analyzed in terms of certain textual forms, imagery, linguistic features, and modes of address to convey meaning. Discourses also carry political effects via the ways in which power is exercised.

getFile.php?file=prof_lee_wing_on_090623(1).pdf&filepath=resource&filename=prof_lee_wing_on_090623(1).pdf; Wing-On Lee, “Citizenship Education in Asia,” in *Encyclopedia of Diversity in Education*, ed. James A. Banks (Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE, 2012), 370–75.

¹⁶Basil Bernstein, *The Structuring of Pedagogic Discourse* (London: Routledge, 1990); Thomas S. Popkewitz and Marie Brennan, eds., *Foucault’s Challenge: Discourse, Knowledge, and Power in Education* (New York: Teacher College Press, 1998).

Following the logic of the above analysis, the content of curricular messages in general, or the very conception of civic virtue itself in particular, is value-laden and should be subjected to reflection and critique. The textbooks “Thought and Politics” in Mainland China, comprising five volumes altogether, were compiled and published in 1997 and 1998 by the People’s Education Press in Beijing in accordance with curricula standards drawn up by the former State Education Commission.¹⁷

For Taiwan, there have been four volumes of textbooks “Civics and Morality” edited and printed by the National Institute for Compilation and Translation in Taipei from 1998 to 2000. They generally follow the guidelines drawn by the Ministry of Education in 1994.¹⁸

Concerning the framework and procedures of data analysis, the theories of citizenship presented above were admittedly used as a guide to interpreting and classifying the school knowledge. The textbooks were read closely, and against the various models of good citizens stated above, relevant sections and paragraphs containing normative prescriptions on the qualities of a citizen were selected and marked for further analysis. To ascertain the meanings of particular sentences or paragraphs, and their contributions to the overall discourse, the syllabus and teachers’ handbooks for the related volumes were also referred to when needed. Some direct quotations were cited for illustration based on the considerations of typicality, salience, and richness. Typicality refers to the frequency of appearance; salience to importance or emphasis; and richness to essential details. These are indicated by the frequency counts produced by NVivo 8. Still further, a comparison added strengths of the quality of interpretations. Comparing discourses could help to differentiate the meanings of special terms as well as the distinctive discursive configurations. Therefore, constant comparisons across the two societies were made and the

¹⁷State Commission of Education, People’s Republic of China, *Xiaoxue zhongxue sixiang zhengzhi kecheng biao zhun* (Curricula standards of elementary school’s and junior high school’s thought and politics [Trail]) (Beijing: People’s Education Press, 1997).

¹⁸Ministry of Education, Republic of China, *Guomin zhongxue kecheng biao zhun* (National high school curriculum standards) (Taipei: Ministry of Education, 1994).

findings of one place were utilized to shed light on our understanding of others.

Concerning content analysis and the quantitative part, the coding scheme was largely modeled on previous studies as well as the major theories of citizenship stated above, and utilized to examine the textbooks around the themes of morality in the personal, interpersonal, group, society, nation, and international domains.¹⁹ Table 1 provides a glimpse of the coding scheme for related virtues or values covered in the textbooks. The coding unit is the section of each book chapter. As the focus is on the expectations for students to behave or display, so only sections containing aspects of virtue or character are included for analysis. There are altogether 96 sections related to virtue in mainland textbooks, and 102 sections in the Taiwan textbooks. Furthermore, each section may contain more than one virtue, so multiple coding is allowed. While the Taiwan textbooks outnumber their counterparts in terms of sections, the mainland textbooks mention much more about virtues in their sections. After multiple counting, there are altogether 944 relevant ones in China, and 295 in Taiwan. The task of coding was performed with the aid of the computer software NVivo 8, a research package designed for organizing and analyzing rich text-based non-numerical qualitative data. The software allows the researcher to classify, sort and arrange the textual data; and identify patterns as well.

Mainland China: A New Generation of Patriots for “Socialist Modernization Construction” and National Revival

In Mainland China, education itself is considered to be an essential part of spiritual civilization construction, and it explicitly plays an ideological

¹⁹Mandy Yuen-Yee Au, “Value Orientations in Junior Secondary (S1-S3) Chinese Language Curriculum of Hong Kong” (master’s thesis, University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong, 1994); Lai-yung Leung, “Value Orientations in Junior Secondary Social Studies Curriculum” (master’s thesis, University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong, 1999).

Table 1
Content Analysis of Textbooks (%)

Main Categories	Sub-categories	Mainland	Taiwan
A. Self-oriented values or personal virtues	A1 General personal well-being	1.91	0.34
	A2 Intellect and cognitive strengths: love of learning, curiosity, creativity, critical thinking/ judgement, respect truth and reasoning, knowledgeable, rationality, science, logic and technology, problem-solving, decision-making	7.42	6.44
	A3 Physical: health, vigor, appearance	0.64	1.36
	A4 Aesthetic: beauty appreciation	1.48	3.39
	A5 Spiritual: faith & higher purposes about the meaning of life	1.8	0
	A6 Emotional: hope and optimism, zest, courage	4.34	1.36
	A7 Competence/ effectiveness: diligence, efficiency, perseverance, decisiveness, prudence, independence, prompt, concentration, realism, leadership, progressive, adventure, acquisitive of opportunity, time-management, self-determination or foresightedness, confidence	14.3	3.05
	A8 Self-regard: awareness, self-respect and self-esteem, self-control/ discipline, temperance/ contentedness, upright, honesty, plainness, thrift, decency, willingness to correct mistakes, conscience	7.52	2.03
	A9 Others	0.74	0.68
Sub-total		40.15	18.65
B. Small group-oriented or interpersonal morality	B1 General values towards others: kindness/ benevolence, respect others, tolerance, empathy, sincerity, modesty, courtesy, broad-mindedness, generosity, altruism, helpfulness, harmony, cooperativeness, communicate, conflict resolution, trust	11.76	16.95
	B2 Kinship: familial love, parent-child, marital, sibling, and relatives	2.12	4.41
	B3 Teachers/ elders: respect and obedience	0.42	0.68
	B4 Friendship	0.85	0.34
	B5 Neighborhood	0.21	0.68
	B6 Small group and class	0.85	1.02
Sub-total		24.08	16.21

Table 1 (Continued)

Main Categories	Sub-categories	Mainland	Taiwan
C. Society-oriented values	C1 General political ideas concerning human rights: equality, liberty, justice, peace, human rights, respects and values cultural diversities	1.91	5.76
	C2 Social order: observation of social norms or laws/ law-abiding behaviors	5.61	5.76
	C3 Social responsibilities: social consciousness and willingness to serve/ volunteering, active involvement in public affairs, for public good/ public spiritedness	5.19	6.78
	C4 Local community or native place	0.74	1.02
	C5 Proper exercise of rights, eliminate oppression and deprivation, defending justice and protection of the rights of the underprivileged	3.5	5.08
	C6 Gender relations	0.64	1.69
	C7 Consumer ethics	0.32	1.02
	C8 Media ethics	0.11	0.34
	C9 School	0.64	1.02
	C10 Laboring habits or work ethics	1.38	1.69
	C11 Solidarity and social cohesiveness: gregariousness	0.21	0.34
	C12 Economic values: entrepreneurship	0.42	0.34
	C13 Others: adoption to society	1.17	2.37
Sub-total		21.95	33.21
D. Nation-oriented values	D1 Patriotism: loyalty to, love and support for country and national security, achievement and prosperity; readiness to protect one's country or make contributions, help enhance country's greatness and glory	6.99	2.03
	D2 Love one's fellow nationals/ people	1.38	0.34
	D3 Fond of national history and culture	1.69	3.39
	D4 Recognition/ admiration of government's work, support the authority, or adoration of particular political ideologies	3.07	0
	D5 Democracy: participation in public affairs, critic of the state, discernment/ deliberativeness, election, monitoring the government	3.07	9.83
	D6 Others	0.32	0
Sub-total		16.52	15.59

Table 1 (Continued)

Main Categories	Sub-categories	Mainland	Taiwan
E. International-oriented values	E1 Global concern and betterment of human kind: world perspective and international issues, Cosmopolitanism	0.85	1.69
	E2 Interdependence/ mutual cooperation	0.32	0.34
	E3 Appreciation of foreign cultures/ recognition of cultural diversities	0.42	1.02
	E4 Environmental conservation/ substantial development/ ecological morality	2.54	5.08
	E5 Others	0.32	0
Sub-total		4.45	8.13
F. Others	F1 Other general descriptions	0.74	0.34
Sub-total			
Total % (Number of sections with multiple counting)		100% (944)	100% (295)
(Number of sections without multiple counting)		(96)	(102)

Note: The percentages in the table are calculated based on the “total number” in brackets in the second last row.

role in socializing the younger generation as socialist people in the direction set by the ruling party.²⁰ The guiding principle of education is to help construct and realize socialist modernization. Labor and production can be facilitated by education in order to nurse all-round and fully-developed successors and steadfast constructors of socialism.²¹ Since *de yu* has been accorded the top priority with broad moral viewpoints, its coverage is extraordinarily extensive across the five volumes, with fundamental guidelines drawn by the State on the education of socialist morals:

²⁰People’s Education Press, *Sixiang zhengzhi* (Thought and politics), Vol. 2A (Beijing: People’s Education Press, 1997), 49-54; Vol. 3, 174-82.

²¹Ibid., Vol. 1A, 105; Vol. 2B, 38.

The morality of our people shares the greatness of the socialist morality of our country, which is regarded as the most noble and lofty morality among all in history. It embraces magnificent manners of life: love for the fatherland, love for people; respect and care for collectives and enthusiasm for the public good; love to help especially those in desperate need and poverty; respect and care for public utilities; education in environmental morality and occupational morality; honesty and trustworthiness with devotion to serve the people, society and the country; respect and love for the elderly and the children; filial piety, frugality and communal solidarity as family virtues. All the above are remarkable highlights of socialist morality. The core of socialist morality is to serve the people with collectivism as the guiding principle.²²

The tone of presentation in the textbooks is also advising and reprimanding, which is coupled with the advocated state-centered citizenship throughout the texts. According to this set of socialist morals, the role of an individual is defined and identified solely by the collective or society because of the social nature and connectedness of individual members.²³ This worldview also serves to justify requests and demands placed on the people as qualified and desirable social members.²⁴ The ways individuals make themselves valuable and practical for collective interests are to raise their personal qualities and try their best to adapt to and fulfill the needs of social development.²⁵ Moreover, an individual should pay the least regard to self-interest on his or her own initiative inasmuch as being self-restrained and behave satisfactorily in accordance with social needs, and top priority should always be given to national or collective interests when they are in conflict with personal ones.²⁶

The textbooks specify expectations on exemplary socialist citizens in various aspects of desirable psychological quality, sound moral integrity, modern legal sense, noble ideals, arduous enterprising spirit and a strong sense of social responsibility, which are all agreeable to the new generation of socialist people with lofty ideals, morality integrity, good

²²Ibid., Vol. 2A, 13-14.

²³Ibid., Vol. 1A, 10-11; Vol. 3, 174-75.

²⁴Ibid., Vol. 1A, 11, 17-18, 24-25.

²⁵Ibid., Vol. 1A, 22.

²⁶Ibid., Vol. 1A, 24-25.

education and culture, and a strong sense of discipline as envisioned by Deng Xiaoping (鄧小平).²⁷

Education in good psychological quality includes psychological health, cultivation and training of a strong will along with harmonious interpersonal relationships. There is also pedagogical and behavioral guidance in adolescent psychological health, as well as the fostering of fine moral traditions and the essential qualities for talents needed in the twenty-first century.²⁸ Even personal psychological health is also guided by the collective goals, therefore “good personalities” refer to:

fervent love for the fatherland, care for the collectives, passion for life, self-strengthening, ambition for success, an enterprising spirit, pursuit of perfection, frugality, thrift, sincerity and honesty, cautiousness with humbleness, courtesy and politeness, respect for others, generosity in helping others, diligence, being earnest and down-to-earth, as well as a strong sense of responsibility.²⁹

Moreover, every student should behave on his or her own initiative with high self-consciousness and strict standards in pursuit of excellence in the aspects of morality, intelligence and physical fitness so as to honor the class in school, the collective and the fatherland.³⁰ Among various collectives, one’s nation (國家民族) is considered to be the most cardinal and crucial, and repeatedly stated under the notion of “fatherland” (祖國). The calling to serve the fatherland is regarded as common, correct and honorable. Furthermore, the young generation ought to put their shoulders to the wheel in constructing a mighty, democratic and civilized socialist modernized China. They should develop a willingness to repay the fatherland and a devotional spirit to serve the masses, so as to be valuable to the fatherland and the people.³¹ It is said that social identity overrides personal identity, and students should strive to sublime their self-esteem and self-

²⁷Ibid., Vol. 1B, 87, 105; Vol. 2A, 49; Vol. 3, 1, 152; Vol. 3, “Foreword.”

²⁸Ibid., Vol. 1A, 3-5.

²⁹Ibid., Vol. 1B, 25.

³⁰Ibid., Vol. 1A, 71.

³¹Ibid., Vol. 1A, 110-14.

respect into pride and glory for the collective and the nation. Hence the national pride and ethnic esteem can be strengthened and reinforced.³² They should also act self-consciously for the sake of the protection and upholding of glory for their fatherland and national dignity.³³ For instance:

Along with the progress of the reform and open door policy, as well as modernization construction, [...] increasing encounters and interactions between countries and between Chinese and foreigners become inevitable. We are obliged to inherit and glorify the honorable traditions of the Chinese nation and to ensure that our words and moves are in the interests of our fatherland. We must show self-respect and self-esteem, being neither haughty nor humble with regard to our encounters with foreigners. We should not endanger the honor of our state and dignity of our nation in every single way. This is the national dignity and self-confidence that every Chinese should possess.³⁴

Contents in the textbooks define moral behavior with respect to the standard of “socialist morality.” Fervent love for the homeland, care for the collective, pleasure in helping others, readiness of service, diligence and honesty at work and school, and so on are considered to be the concrete and ideal performance of moral integrity.³⁵

A special chapter also instructs students about patriotic sentiments.³⁶ Patriotism has been universalized, naturalized and sanctified throughout the texts. The relationship between the country and people has been expressed in the form of metaphors such as mother and son, or grandparents and grandsons. For instance:

Patriotic sentiments are universal ones. Indeed people from different nations all over the world, without exception, show the loftiest and most noble spirits towards their homeland. By viewing their homeland as the most noble and dearest mother, people are dedicated to devoting their best to their homeland without hesitation, either intelligence or power, or whatever they possess. Patriotic sentiments are commonly found in the human soul, and are sufficiently evidenced in long histories of different peoples.³⁷

³²Ibid., Vol. 1B, 3, 16.

³³Ibid., Vol. 1B, 18-19.

³⁴Ibid., Vol. 1B, 18.

³⁵Ibid., Vol. 1A, 36-37.

³⁶Ibid., Vol. 1B, 72-89.

³⁷Ibid., Vol. 1B, 75-76.

Patriotic sentiment in the textbooks is considered to be the most significant and noble part of morality, which includes full awareness, strong attachments, and steadfast and determined acts. Students should be fully aware of the inextricable complexity of their destiny and future, together with that of their country, as well as their innate duties and mission with regard to the betterment and independence of their great nation.³⁸ Their determination to make their nation prosperous and wealthy as a steadfast attitude then becomes an insistent principle.³⁹ They ought to put their words into practice through active participation in all kinds of development and construction that work for the glorious national prosperity.⁴⁰ Other acts like adoration of patriotic heroes, intense hatred towards vicious invaders and despising traitors who despicably betray their country and country-fellows out of selfishness are also found to be honorable and respectable.⁴¹

The practice of fervent love for the nation is also defined as a legal duty that everyone should abide by, and not just as a flashy passion or feeling of bonding.⁴² Specific patriotic acts include unquestionable opposition to any malicious intention to divide the country, sturdiness in fulfilling the historical mission of ethnic solidarity and territorial integrity.⁴³ In practice, patriotic sentiments should be fully transformed into ever-inspiring forces and honorable acts,⁴⁴ with a number of patriotic role models for students to follow.⁴⁵

Moreover, a good citizen needs to live up to the legal norms with emphases on self-consciousness and a law-abiding spirit. Therefore, a

³⁸Ibid., Vol. 1B, 73.

³⁹Ibid., Vol. 1B, 79-80.

⁴⁰Ibid., Vol. 1B, 80.

⁴¹Ibid., Vol. 1B, 81.

⁴²Ibid., Vol. 1B, 85.

⁴³Ibid., Vol. 2B, 79-85.

⁴⁴Ibid., Vol. 1A, 121-22; Vol. 1B, 83-84.

⁴⁵Ibid., Vol. 1A, 16, 24-26, 37, 74-75, 80, 87, 101, 107, 110; Vol. 1B, 60; Vol. 3, 176, 167-68.

citizen should fulfill his or her legal duties and follow the obligations for which he or she is liable. Every citizen should strive to live up to a high standard of legal rule and observation, understanding, use and maintenance of the law and discipline are the core of the concept of legal rule.⁴⁶

Parts of the patriotic discourse are lofty and noble ideals, which are equal to an aspiration of self-devotion to the fatherland.⁴⁷ The logic is that the realization of individual ideals can never take place without consideration of social ideals, and personal development and social prosperity are tightly intertwined.⁴⁸ Every citizen should then fulfill his or her own social responsibility: to work hard, to strive for the lofty social ideals and to advance the enterprising spirit along with a strong sense of social responsibility.⁴⁹ For instance:

At the primary stage of socialism, we strive to make our socialist modernized country wealthy, strong, democratic, and civilized, which is the very present goal that is commonly recognized by every individual of all peoples of our country. This shared ideal is also concordant to the principles of social development and the basic conditions of our socialist country which is at the primary stage of development. [. . .] The shared ideal completely represents the common interests and wishes of all peoples in our country. [. . .] Any successful career and realization of that ideal is a process of hardships and determination. We are all ready to shoulder this arduous task as lofty ideals and great causes could never be achieved without hardships and determination.⁵⁰

Aside from a teleological account of historical progress, the texts also ascertain that China is now right at the primary stage of socialist development where economic and cultural achievement is comparatively backward, and thus enhancing societal productivity should be the focus of development. An enterprising spirit with assiduity is much needed as an excellent virtue of the Chinese people,⁵¹ which would enable everyone in this great country to aspire to the strenuous mission of accomplishing

⁴⁶Ibid., Vol. 2B, 128.

⁴⁷Ibid., Vol. 1B, 92, 97, 105.

⁴⁸Ibid., Vol. 3, 2.

⁴⁹Ibid., Vol. 3, 174-75.

⁵⁰Ibid., Vol. 3, 169.

⁵¹Ibid., Vol. 3, 170.

socialist modernization and great Chinese revival.⁵²

The texts also raise demands on students' personal qualities and career aspiration in the name of social development and the tides of historical advancement.⁵³ Individual destiny and the rise and fall of their fatherland or nation are always bound by extricable fate, for good or for bad. The calling for patriotism is made by stressing that individual fate and development could never be realized without the upholding of national pride, ethnic esteem and a flourishing fatherland.⁵⁴ Consequently, undertaking a mission to revive and prosper national achievement and glory becomes the most essential and vital social responsibility.⁵⁵ Since it takes the whole generation to struggle and strive for the socialist ideal and national cause, all should unite to work hard toward the accomplishment of the historical task by attaining national prosperity and peoples' common affluence. Therefore:

Let's aspire to become the talented who are required by our country: Technological progress is critical to economic development and science and technology is the primal productivity in the future. Competing for the talented is the ultimate measure to increase national competitiveness, which is becoming more and more intense. In parallel to the strategy of sustainable development, our national policy has given the same weight to the strategy of blooming scientific-technological education in the hope of inducing remarkable economic and social development, and that ever-improving labor quality and distinguished technological progress will become a regular channel that leads to economic success. We, being the second generation, have to seize the golden opportunities in the global world and advance our country in every respect. This has become our sole task, and requires our aspiring spirits, lofty ideals and steadfast determination to make a contribution to socialist modernization.⁵⁶

Post-national concern has been found in the textbooks, notwithstanding its emphasis on the socialist ideal. While there is no special chapter explicitly dealing with the notion of "world citizens," yet on one occasion

⁵²Ibid., Vol. 3, 172.

⁵³Ibid., Vol. 1A, 28-29; Vol. 3, 175.

⁵⁴Ibid., Vol. 3, 177.

⁵⁵Ibid., Vol. 3, 178.

⁵⁶Ibid., Vol. 3, 180.

it makes the following remarks:

Our modern world has become “smaller and smaller.” Interpersonal connection has never been so close in human history, as well as exchange activities between countries. Mutual cooperation and connection become so vital and important that the living and social arena of people on the Earth is now known as the “Global Village.” This phenomenon further consolidates our goal of raising personal qualities in order to become a competent citizen who can survive the progressively transforming social development.⁵⁷

Moreover, in the chapter on protecting the home of human beings in accordance with the law, students should also view the Earth as “the home of all.”⁵⁸ There is only one planet which is the one and only “home” for human beings. Environmental issues have become a global concern and we need to protect our home for the sake of human survival and sustainable development.

Taiwan: Public Spiritedness for Democratic Consolidation

Compared to the emphasis on collectivism in Mainland China, individualism glares in the textbooks of Taiwan. For instance:

What is the best way of living in a pluralistic modern society? No single answer is derived that can be approved by the whole of humankind. We can only search for a generally approved principle: basic norms have to be set in order to maintain order and harmony between people; and personal freedom and dignity must be respected to promote and motivate cultural creativity.⁵⁹

In addition, the text affirms that every individual determines and possesses his or her own meaning of life. Modern people need to regulate time for work and leisure in hustling life so as to achieve a well-balanced

⁵⁷Ibid., Vol. 1A, 22.

⁵⁸Ibid., Vol. 2A, 59.

⁵⁹National Institute for Compilation and Translation, *Gongmin yu daode* (Civics and morality), Vols. 1-4 (Taipei: National Institute for Compilation and Translation, 1998-2000). For the citation here, please see Vol. 4, 4.

cultural living.⁶⁰ One should do one's best at work to make a living for oneself and one's family. The value of work also lies in its contribution to self-realization both as a means and a process.

Civic virtues are the core of civic education in a democratic society and "public morality" (公德) has been strongly promoted as the sixth ethical pillar (第六倫) in the texts. They are highlighted against the inadequacy of and bias incurred in traditional morality as promoted in the former authoritarian era. Two examples worthy of quotation at length are as follows:

The new teaching materials have adjusted the concept of citizen in accordance with the imminent need to build up a contemporary society with the concept of "public" as the main axis. A citizen is a social being of "public" nature. In a modern democratic society, all citizens are born to be citizens who are entitled to enjoy basic human rights, and thus they are known as citizens. The definition is made broad since there is a need to establish the concept of "public sphere." Compared to the past, people in democratic societies come into contact in very different public arenas and with personal connections that could never exist before. Everyone bears the responsibility to participate in the society and to administer the country. So everyone ought to equip himself or herself with civic awareness and a concept of public-ness. That means active participation in and care for public affairs, protection of the public environment and realization of one's own roles and responsibilities are highly expected apart from an understanding of one's rights and duties in a modern society. Moreover, civic education should emphasize a fostering of citizenship. Various advocacies and opinions are heard in a democratic pluralistic society which makes some personal qualities valuable and necessary: respect for plurality, appreciation of others, tolerance of differences, rational communication, pursuit of justice and self-reflection. These basic virtues have been put into the teaching materials in as detailed a way as possible, aiming to cultivate the students with public spirit, to have civic awareness strengthened and civic culture enhanced.⁶¹

One can never be regarded as a qualified citizen if one lives without the sense of "public-ness," irrespective of one's endeavors to protect one's family and love for one's clansmen and friends. It is because one's ignorance of civic significance makes one become a "loner" in a society when one enjoys all the entitled rights but neglects public affairs. One does not fulfill one's duty

⁶⁰Ibid., Vol. 4, 24-25.

⁶¹National Institute for Compilation and Translation, *Guozhong gongmin yu daode jiaoshi shouce* (Teacher's handbook of national high school civics and morality), Vol. 1 (Taipei: National Institute for Compilation and Translation, 1998-2000), 4.

of participation in social management. We must spread the love and concern to our family and friends beyond. We ought to give consideration to public affairs and cherish public property as well as the environment. We should also abide by the norms and laws that regulate our relationships with other unrelated individuals and other groups in the society. A genuine “democratic society” can only be accomplished by our concerted efforts in this regard.⁶²

Particular consideration has thus been given to the design of various teaching activities related to students’ real life situations when editing the teaching materials. Activities like group discussion, values clarification, role play, interviews, surveys and action theatres are introduced for after-class sections, in the hope that students will realize what they have learnt in their daily life and to facilitate rational communication and social interaction. Furthermore, with these experiences, students are expected to appreciate the various roles in modern society, and to foster appropriate manners and attitudes towards others. The values of a democratic society can thus be consolidated with students’ enhanced awareness of social participation.⁶³

Under these central principles, the texts emphasize three qualities that a modern citizen should possess: (1) Respect and tolerance towards others;⁶⁴ (2) Active participation in public affairs, high regard for public morality and the common good, and the pursuit of justice and rights, especially for those underprivileged including minorities, the disabled and those in poverty;⁶⁵ and (3) Love and concerns for the natural environment as well as to protect and treasure nature.⁶⁶

In treating others, the texts affirm the notion of “gender equality,” with a new topic “Gender Relationship and Ethics” added to the syllabus and textbooks. Guidance in the texts is an effort to cultivate a sense of equality between the sexes and appropriate ways to communicate between women and men. The section purposely highlights an understanding of the meaning and significance of gender equality by shattering the existing

⁶²*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 6.

⁶³*Guozhong gongmin yu daode jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 4.

⁶⁴*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 6.

⁶⁵*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 7-8.

⁶⁶*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 9.

gender stereotypes.⁶⁷ Alongside gender equality, particular chapters also cover interpersonal communication and the ways dealing with conflicts.⁶⁸ They give students ideas on how to reconcile disputes among people and ways to acquire harmonious and agreeable interpersonal relationships such as pacification, intermediation and lawsuits.⁶⁹ On another occasion, “respect and tolerance” and “peace and rationality” are cited as the critical temperament a citizen should have.⁷⁰ In addition, students are reminded to show respect and tolerance towards different religions.⁷¹

Regarded as essential elements of civic literacy from the social aspect, civic morality and “democratic literacy” (民主素養) are repeatedly stressed in the textbooks. Students are encouraged to actively nurture their will to participate in public affairs starting from home.⁷² They are also given an opportunity to learn self-government at school inclusive of its meanings, scope and means that put it into practice. The teaching of self-government aims at acquainting students with the significance of autonomy and the means and extent of the concerned action.⁷³ They will consequently know how to participate in the management and decision-making of public affairs. They are also expected to understand that the acquisition of a common consensus through thorough discussion and deliberation among divergent voices is indispensable in the public affairs management of a democratic society. Out of this concern, the principles and limitations of majority rule are introduced with an emphasis on the indefeasibility of basic rights for the minorities.⁷⁴

Concerning “democratic literacy,” two relevant elements “majority rule with regard towards minority” and “enthusiastic participation” are

⁶⁷*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 104-5.

⁶⁸*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 35; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 72.

⁶⁹*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 124-25.

⁷⁰*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 2, 44.

⁷¹*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 4, 33-34; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 4, 87.

⁷²*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 27; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 60.

⁷³*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 88.

⁷⁴*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 48; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 88.

cited as the critical temperament a citizen should have.⁷⁵ Additionally, “enhancement of democratic knowledge and competence,” “learning democratic demeanor,” and “involvement in the community” are suggested as three ways to achieve the aforementioned missions in daily life.⁷⁶ This is to familiarize students with democracy by incorporating democratic and legal subjects into class activities, group discussions and club activities in schooling life. This strategy is further reinforced by cultivating habits of respect, communication, compromise and tolerance in the public sphere so as to create a democratic life and culture.⁷⁷

The discussion also shifts from school to local community with an introduction to the importance of community involvement. Students are expected to be equipped with a willingness and an ability to get actively involved in community affairs since an ideal community is the prerequisite for an ideal home.⁷⁸ A good community life is made up of the enthusiastic involvement of everyone.⁷⁹ Additionally, various forms of communal involvement including united communal struggles are mentioned with incidents including the Muzha dumping site in Taipei, the disposal of nuclear waste on Orchid Island, and oil pollution in the Port of Kaohsiung as examples.⁸⁰

Much attention is also given to collective life—a crucial element in a democratic polity and lifestyle.⁸¹ Students are to become aware of the democratic composition of an organization as the operational principle and so the importance of their knowledge of democracy along with their enthusiastic involvement. The text further elaborates on the freedom to form and to participate in organizations.

⁷⁵*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 2, 44.

⁷⁶*Ibid.*, Vol. 2, 46-47.

⁷⁷*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 2, 99.

⁷⁸*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 67.

⁷⁹*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 70, 74.

⁸⁰*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 71.

⁸¹*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 79-80; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 154.

The defense of individual freedom and rights in a modern democratic system implies certain immunity from government interference in people's affairs. Social groups that are formed voluntarily by people under the principle of upholding democracy become very significant. Social groups composed of people can facilitate the enthusiastic participation in both private and public affairs while they can voice out their opinions to influence the people and government. These groups can also fulfill people's expectations and public interests by effective monitoring of the authority for the enhancement of its administrative efficiency.⁸²

In addition, the meaningfulness and significance of "volunteers" (義工) to organizations and societies are addressed,⁸³ with a view to shaping the students into dedicated and helpful citizens by fostering a volunteering spirit among them.⁸⁴

A pursuit of distributive justice, especially that concerned with the rights of those underprivileged, is also highlighted in the texts,⁸⁵ therefore.

In the time of rapid social change, principles of social justice and social welfare measures should then be given attention, and disadvantaged groups should be positively protected. Any intentions to weaken or erode the dignity and rights of the disadvantaged in the disguise of competition or adaptation should be guarded against.⁸⁶

Cherishing rights and fulfilling duties are pivotal topics in citizenship.⁸⁷ There are four main points illustrating the concepts of rights and a sense of responsibility applied to a modern citizen: (1) to make an ultimate effort in fulfilling obligations and duties for organizations; (2) to abide by the organizational norms with resolution; (3) to respect the rights of other individuals and parties; and (4) to be determined to cherish the common interests of organizations.

The forging of character by an appreciation of culture and civilization has become a vital part in democratic life in modern times. Other

⁸²*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 79.

⁸³*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 155.

⁸⁴*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 82.

⁸⁵*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 4-5; 45, 90.

⁸⁶*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 90.

⁸⁷*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 1, 38-39.

than enjoying one's own private life, people should pursue desirable life goals as civilized members of the society by the maintenance of a democratic temperament and the determination to abide by law and discipline. The enhancement of civic morality, concern for public welfare and participation in environmental programs are also desirable for such an ideal cultural life.⁸⁸

In tandem with the above discussion, further elaboration of the discourse of democracy from a legal perspective is found in the section "Democratic literacy for modern citizens."⁸⁹ It explains that the nature of democratic politics facilitates the realization of autonomy and ideals with the manifestation of human dignity outbalancing its inefficiency and inadequacy. The collapse of East European Communism and the Soviet Union sufficiently proves the irresistibility of democracy as a dominant polity.⁹⁰

Special chapters further elaborate the meaning and importance of "political participation."⁹¹ They serve to denounce the political attributes such as detached and alienated political attitudes among the masses that resulted from long-term compliance to authoritarian rule. It obviously helps to rekindle enthusiasm and passion among people, as masters of a country, and to involve them in politics, so as to consolidate people's autonomy, to realize the spirit of the people's sovereignty, and to protect and guard their rights.⁹² In this regard, the text suggests three forms of political participation: concern for political issues, discussion of political issues and voting.⁹³ Particular emphasis is then given to guide students to be "rational voters," with additional paragraphs explaining the meaning and implications of voting.⁹⁴

⁸⁸*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 4, 7.

⁸⁹*Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 2, 5.

⁹⁰*Ibid.*, Vol. 2, 98.

⁹¹*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 2, 31-34.

⁹²*Ibid.*, Vol. 2, 34.

⁹³*Ibid.*, Vol. 2, 35-36.

⁹⁴*Ibid.*, Vol. 2, 40-41; Vol. 3, 83.

Regarding the relationship between democracy, freedom and legal rule, the text ascertains that

[d]emocracy and freedom are the way of that living people aspire after, yet they must be founded on the rule of law for the protection of everyone's rights and freedom. The rule of law sets norms and laws that both people and the government have to abide by. Basic principles of "equality before the law" and "the capacity of individual freedom allows no infringement of others' rights" are to be followed. Everyone, from a young age, is responsible to abide by the law, for which they should be proud.⁹⁵

Media literacy is also introduced along with the aforementioned democratic politics and democratic literacy.⁹⁶ The text especially suggests the status of mass media as the "Fourth Estate" along with the executive, the legislative and the judicial. The introduction of the right of access to the media and right of privacy are to give students ideas of the protection of their entitlement. Further guidance to students includes tips for a rational audience that can differentiate good media from bad media.⁹⁷

Unlike its mainland counterpart, patriotism is not a prominent or explicit theme in Taiwan's textbooks.⁹⁸ National identity is mainly about a historical-cultural one. However, given Taiwan's diplomatic difficulties in recent years and her consequent policies to sustain her international position, a special chapter "National diplomacy and etiquette of the nationals" is included to serve this diplomatic purpose of establishing friendships with foreigners by ordinary citizens.⁹⁹

Last but not least, the final focus of civic literacy comes as love and concern over the natural environment which matters with the legacy and future of all human beings. For instance,

A modern citizen should be concerned about not merely the well-being of his or her own society or country, but also various species and the environment all over the planet. The earth is a place that all human beings rely on. Every single species

⁹⁵Ibid., Vol. 2, 56.

⁹⁶Ibid., Vol. 4, 51-52.

⁹⁷Ibid., Vol. 4, 53-54.

⁹⁸Ibid., Vol. 2, 3; Vol. 4, 60-64.

⁹⁹Ibid., Vol. 4, 45; *Jiaoshi shouce*, Vol. 4, 110.

on the Earth is susceptible to the future of the entire human race. Arbitrary and vicious destruction of the natural environment will certainly lead the entire human race to a disastrous doom. Nothing would be left to our future generations but murky air, filthy water and numerous amounts of toxic waste.¹⁰⁰

Issues of related to the preservation of the environment or resources are raised. For example, the scarcity and importance of environmental resources are noticed, and students are exhorted to cherish the existing resources and protect the environment in order to achieve sustainable development for there is only one Earth for their survival.¹⁰¹

Under the notion “being close to each other though physically far apart” (天涯若比鄰),¹⁰² the texts again remind students of the efficient international communication and transportation that makes possible contacts with any part of the world at any minute—the emergence of a global village. They should be well-prepared to adapt to the speedy evolvement of the world culture, constant social change as well as to catch up with the frequent exchange of information.¹⁰³ International cultural exchange becomes frequent and common in the age of the global village, and students have no choice but to exhibit mutual respect and cultural harmony.¹⁰⁴

When talking about international cultural exchange, the texts also stress the inheritance and promotion of culture¹⁰⁵ as well as the understanding and approval of native culture.¹⁰⁶ The texts particularly point out three aspects that deserve human efforts, including (1) advocacy of the concepts of equality and gregariousness (合群) that originated in the Western culture; (2) cultivation of the spirit of democracy and legal rule, and the learning of the westerners for their emphasis on discipline and a legal spirit; as well as (3) the development of ideas related to logic and science.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁰*Gongmin yu daode*, Vol. 1, 9.

¹⁰¹*Ibid.*, Vol. 3, 71, 90.

¹⁰²*Ibid.*, Vol. 4, 39.

¹⁰³*Ibid.*, Vol. 1, 91-92.

¹⁰⁴*Ibid.*, Vol. 4, 5-6; 73.

¹⁰⁵*Ibid.*, Vol. 4, 60-62.

¹⁰⁶*Ibid.*, Vol. 4, 73.

¹⁰⁷*Ibid.*, Vol. 4, 63-64.

Two Societies in Comparison: A Summary

The above textual analysis has presented each society one by one and narrated the discourse mainly on its own right. The juxtaposition and comparison of some major themes in terms of quantitative analysis could further deepen our understanding of the similarities and differences between the two societies. Table 1 summarizes the coverage and frequency (percentages) of the various main categories in textbooks. For mainland texts, self-oriented values occupy the largest proportion (40.15%), followed by small group-oriented values (24.08%), society-oriented values (21.95%), nation-oriented values (16.52%), and internationally-oriented ones (4.45%). On the other hand, society-oriented values (33.21%) are dominant in Taiwan texts, followed by self-oriented values (18.65%), small group-oriented values (16.21%), nation-oriented values (15.59%), and finally internationally-oriented ones (8.13%). With regard to the self-oriented category, the proportion for the mainland is more than twice that for Taiwan. On the other hand, Taiwan has nearly two times more than its mainland counterpart in the international category. Furthermore, Taiwan has also far more weight than the mainland in the society-oriented categories.

As concerns the specific sub-categories, for the mainland, the eight most frequent ones are personal competence or effectiveness (14.3%), general values towards others (11.76%), self-regard values (7.52%), intellect and cognitive strengths (7.42%), patriotism (6.99%), social order (5.61%), social responsibilities (5.19%), and emotional ones (4.34%). And for Taiwan, the list runs as general values towards others (16.95%), democracy (9.83%), social responsibilities (6.78%), intellect and cognitive strengths (6.44%), general political ideas concerning human rights (5.76%), social order (5.76%), proper exercise of rights (5.08%) and environmental conservation (5.08%).

While both societies place similar emphases (in terms of percentages) on intellect and cognitive strengths, social order, social responsibilities, work ethics, solidarity and social cohesiveness, economic values, and interdependence or mutual cooperation among nations, the results also

show that Taiwan has richer content in the aspects of kinship, neighborhood, local community or native place, the proper exercise of rights, gender relations, consumer ethics, media ethics, economic values, democracy, as well as post-national and cosmopolitan citizenship. On the other hand, patriotism and recognition/admiration of the government's work, support for the authority, or adoration of particular political ideologies are more salient in the mainland's materials.

These findings illustrate a great ideological discrepancy between the two places. It becomes clear that Mainland China, more in the fashion of socialist and republican citizenship, puts more emphasis on shaping individuals' ideals, and psychological and moral qualities so as to make adaptation to the collectives in general and the state in particular. This phenomenon is evident with her constant attention to nurturing "patriots" with the promotion of national revival, the socialist ideal, and the noted virtue of giving up one's individuality for collectivism. An upholding of patriotism is seen as the primary means to foster builders and successors for the socialist cause. At the same time, the proper use of rights and keen fulfillment of duties under the tutelage of the ruling party becomes the focal issue concerning civic awareness.

Socialism interpreted as Deng Xiao-ping Theory has been the pillar in Mainland China's education and incorporating students with a correct political standpoint is still the most pivotal task in the curricular materials. The pursuit of political ideals explains why its content puts an emphasis on "self-cultivation" and collectivism. Plenty of the texts praising collectivism, socialism, and patriotism as desirable moral guidance serve to enhance the legitimacy of the ruling political party. Citizenship presented in this way hence confers a paternalist mode with notions of individuality and rights understood in a collectivist fashion. This top down party-state-centered concept of citizenship also implies the override of citizenry by the nation under collectivist imperatives. This presentation and understanding of citizenship is distinctly different from those cherished by the western democratic traditions.

In a time of economic reconstruction and transition to a market economy, and with a heavier involvement in a global economy, the Com-

munist government in recent years has been more accommodating toward individual rights than previously and there has been some progress toward the enlargement and protection of citizens' rights, at least in institutional frameworks. However, in a Leninist party-state with the philosophy of a vanguard leading the people in the direction of historical development, the Communist party assigns itself a pivotal role in guiding national efforts to carry out the historical mission of communism in general, and the modernization program in particular with the appeal of glorious national revival. The beneficial role of the paternalist state and the grand direction of national policy are taken for granted, and good citizens are defined as patriots and a mobilized populace in support of a powerful party-state. Patriotism and participation, while being endorsed by the authorities, are interpreted as strong and necessary attachments to the nation-state, but not the sharing of power among citizens. Even when "democracy" and "participation" are mentioned, the texts simply take these terms for granted and subsume them under the will of the state with the appeal of patriotism.

Going to the opposite extreme, when speaking also the language of "public" and communitarianism, Taiwan is more concerned with building up a civil society and empowering citizens in political life. It stresses the importance of societal or national affairs and puts efforts into raising generations to view community life and a public spirit as being vital. With the precondition of identifying Taiwan as a modern pluralistic society, Taiwan's materials firmly uphold a number of liberalist civic virtues, which are best illustrated with the appreciation of personal freedom and individual choice. Taiwan highlights democracy and a legal spirit in her education, with an inclusive focus on nurturing the values or virtues like democracy, freedom, respect, tolerance and compromise. Moreover, although the theme of patriotism is less explicitly-mentioned, some elements of republican citizenship like participatory and deliberate democracy are still found. Taiwan claims that national masterhood applies to all citizens who are in possession of sovereignty. In such a way, every citizen is due to be participatory in society and active in managing the nation. That also means active participation in and care for public affairs, the protection of the public environment and a democratic pluralistic society.

Students are thus to be cultivated with relevant competencies and values—most notably democratic attributes (including self-governing organizations and societies) and media literacy. Other necessary personal qualities include respect for plurality, appreciation of others, tolerance of differences, rational communication, pursuit of justice and self-reflection. Taiwan is richer in the aspects of gender equality and democratic spirit, particularly the principle of popular sovereignty. In addition, while both places have a strong emphasis on law-abidingness, their expectations of civic qualities with respect to law are different. In Taiwan, law-abidingness is associated more with democratic literacy and the spirit of the rule of law. Finally, as for post-national concerns, Taiwan puts forth her emphasis on environmental protection as being one of the upheld civic virtues as compared to her mainland counterpart.

Further Discussion

Returning to the models of citizenship furnished in an earlier section, the findings from the detailed data analysis suggest that we need a broader integrated model to understand the configurations in the Greater China region and also other places. To a certain extent, the two cases lend partial support to Lee's thesis on Asian citizenship as previously mentioned—an emphasis on personal virtues or values, particularly self-cultivation and interpersonal harmony; and a strong “relationalistic” orientation. For both Chinese societies, personal and interpersonal traits have a significant weight in terms of coverage (64.23% for China and 34.86% for Taiwan). Furthermore, the attributes like intellectual and cognitive strength, and general personal traits towards others are their common emphases. Interestingly enough, these personal and interpersonal elements are also utilized to promote citizenship or sustain public virtues.

These findings could also help us to refine the general theoretical models. As can be seen above, apart from the group, society, nation, and international domains conventionally related to citizenship, the personal and interpersonal domains are very crucial when making sense of the

private/ public division or intersection. The coding scheme, taking into account both western citizenship theories and Asian features, could also be utilized as an instrument for comparing the curricular materials of other societies in future studies.

Since 2001, the two places have been undergoing a new round of curriculum reforms with new curricula materials being published. Further comparison and analysis of the latest syllabi and textbooks are keenly expected and a diachronic perspective should be adopted to track the continuity and change. Finally, there are on-going controversies, debates and changes in citizenship education within the political realm and academic circles. These changes will open many new issues for further studies, such as, for example, the relation between morality and citizenship; the notion of Asian citizenship; and reforms in curriculum, pedagogy and assessment.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Apple, Michael W. 1990. *Ideology and the Curriculum*. 2nd ed. London: Routledge.
- Au, Mandy Yuen-Yee. 1994. "Value Orientations in Junior Secondary (S1-S3) Chinese Language Curriculum of Hong Kong." Master's thesis, University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong.
- Bernstein, Basil. 1990. *The Structuring of Pedagogic Discourse*. London: Routledge.
- Chen, Feng. 1995. *Economic Transition and Political Legitimacy in Post-Mao China: Ideology and Reform*. Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press.
- Copper, John. 2002. *Taiwan: Nation-State or Province?* Boulder, Colo.: Westview.
- Fairbrother, Gregory. 2004. "Citizenship Education in a Divided China, 1949-1995." *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 24, no. 1 (July): 29-42.
- Falk, Richard. 1994. "The Making of Global Citizenship." In *The Condition of Citizenship*, edited by Bart van Steenberg, 127-39. London: Sage.

- Kymlicka, Will. 2002. *Contemporary Political Philosophy: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Lee, Wing-On, ed. 1996. "Moral Education Policy: Developments since 1978." *Chinese Education and Society* 29, no. 4 (July-August): 5-102.
- _____. 2009. "Conceptualizing Citizenship and Citizenship Education: A Trajectory of Exploring Asian Perspectives." Chair Professors Public Lecture Series, Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong, June 30. [http://www.ied.edu.hk/cplectures/include/getfile.php?file=prof_lee_wing_on_090623\(1\).pdf&filepath=resource&filename=prof_lee_wing_on_090623\(1\).pdf](http://www.ied.edu.hk/cplectures/include/getfile.php?file=prof_lee_wing_on_090623(1).pdf&filepath=resource&filename=prof_lee_wing_on_090623(1).pdf).
- _____. 2012. "Citizenship Education in Asia." In *Encyclopedia of Diversity in Education*, edited by James A. Banks, 370-75. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE.
- Lenin, Vladimir I. 1966 [1920]. "The Tasks of the Youth Leagues." In *Collected Works of Lenin*, Vol. 31, 4th English edition, edited by Vladimir I. Lenin, 283-99. Moscow: Progress Publishers.
- Leung, Lai-yung 1999. "Value Orientations in Junior Secondary Social Studies Curriculum." Master's thesis, University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong.
- Li, Maosen, Monica J. Taylor, and Shaogang Yang. 2004. "Moral Education in Chinese Societies: Changes and Challenges (editorial)." *Journal of Moral Education* 33, no. 4 (December): 405-28.
- Martin, Roberta. 1975. "The Socialization of Children in China and Taiwan: An Analysis of Elementary School Textbooks." *China Quarterly* 16, no. 2 (June): 242-62.
- Meyer, Jeffrey. F. 1988. "A Subtle and Silent Transformation: Moral Education in Taiwan and the People's Republic of China." In *The Revival of Values Education in Asia and the West*, edited by William K. Cummings, Saravanan Gopinathan, and Yasumasa Tomoda, 109-30. Oxford: Pergamon.
- Ministry of Education, Republic of China. 1994. *Guomin zhongxue kecheng biao-zhun* (國民中學課程標準, National high school curriculum standards). Taipei: Ministry of Education.
- Morgan, John W. 2005. "Marxism and Moral Education." *Journal of Moral Education* 34, no. 4 (December): 391-98.
- National Institute for Compilation and Translation (國立編譯館). 1998-2000. *Gongmin yu daode* (公民與道德, Civics and morality), Vols. 1-4. Taipei:

National Institute for Compilation and Translation.

- National Institute for Compilation and Translation (國立編譯館). 1998-2000. *Guozhong gongmin yu daode jiaoshi shouce* (國中公民與道德教師手冊, Teacher's handbook of national high school civics and morality), Vols. 1-4. Taipei: National Institute for Compilation and Translation.
- People's Education Press (人民教育出版社). 1997 and 1998. *Sixiang zhengzhi* (思想政治, Thought and politics), Vols. 1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, and 3. Beijing: People's Education Press.
- Popkewitz, Thomas S., and Marie Brennan, eds. 1998. *Foucault's Challenge: Discourse, Knowledge, and Power in Education*. New York: Teacher College Press.
- Sautman, Barry. 1991. "Politicization, Hyperpoliticization, and Depoliticization of Chinese Education." *Comparative Education Review* 35, no. 4 (November): 669-89.
- So, Alvin Y. 2004. "One Country, Three Systems? State, Nation, and Civil Society in the Making of Citizenship in the Chinese Triangle of Mainland-Taiwan-Hong Kong." In *Remaking Citizenship in Hong Kong: Community, Nation and the Global City*, edited by Agnes Ku and Ngai Pun, 235-53. London: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Soysol, Yasemin Nuhoglu, and Suk-ying Wong. 2006. "Educating Future Citizens in Europe and Asia." In *School Knowledge in Comparative and Historical Perspective: Changing Curricula in Primary and Secondary Education*, edited by Aaron Benavot and Cecilia Braslavsky, 73-88. Dordrecht: Springer.
- State Commission of Education, People's Republic of China (中國國家教委). 1997. *Xiaoxue zhongxue sixiang zhengzhi kecheng biao zhun* (小學中學思想政治課程標準, Curricula standards of elementary school's and junior high school's thought and politics [Trail]). Beijing: People's Education Press.
- Van Steenberg, Bart, ed. 1994. *The Condition of Citizenship*. London: Sage.
- Whitty, Geoff. 1985. *Sociology and School Knowledge: Curriculum Theory, Research and Politics*. London: Methuen.
- Wilson, Richard W. 1980. "Conformity and Deviance Regarding Moral Rules in Chinese Society: A Socialization Perspective." In *Normal and Abnormal Behaviour in Chinese Culture*, edited by Arthur Kleinmann and Tsung-Yi Lin, 117-36. Dordrecht: D. Reidel.

ISSUES & STUDIES

Young, Michael F. D, ed. 1971. *Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the Sociology of Education*. London: Collier-Macmillan.

Zhang, Wei-Wei. 1996. *Ideology and Economic Reform under Deng Xiaoping, 1978-1993*. New York: Kegan Paul.