

週邊語言作為小說對話中的隱義： 以《純真年代》中聲音特質的中譯為例

吳怡萍*

摘 要

週邊語言在小說中作為重現人物對話聲音特質的標識，在《純真年代》這部作品中，伊迪絲·華頓大量運用週邊語言來呈現人物對話時所展現的說話語氣或態度，本研究將週邊語言視為小說對話中的隱義，強調譯者在翻譯時需作不同程度的詮釋。本研究目的有二：（一）探究週邊語言在《純真年代》這本小說中的使用與其所建構出特殊的語境與語用特質，（二）分析作者與譯者塑造人物週邊話語風格及語用差異。研究結果顯示，譯者在語意的詮釋與表達常無法準確形構出人物的聲音表現，因此無法將人物的特質及性情巨細靡遺的呈現在讀者面前。文中建議，若要將週邊語言的豐富樣貌及內涵的展現在譯文之中，譯者對於週邊語言做為敘述聲音的特質及功能需有一定程度的關注及認知，文中也透過重譯方式來探討週邊語言的翻譯手法。

關鍵詞：週邊語言、文學翻譯、伊迪絲·華頓、《純真年代》

* 國立高雄第一科技大學應用英語系

Paralanguage as Conversational Implicature: A Study of Vocal Features in the Chinese Translation of *The Age of Innocence*

Wu, Yi-Ping *

Abstract

Paralanguage as intonational markers have become for Edith Wharton an effective narrative strategy and engaging medium for characterizing various speech acts that surround the conversations. This vocal orchestration by means of paralinguistic description serves as conversational implicatures and presents translator with rich potential for interpretation. The purpose of this paper has twofold: (1) to classify the particular linguistic features of paralanguage encoded in *The Age of Innocence* and their pragmaticstylistic functions in constructing the diegetic voices, (2) to investigate how the translators in Taiwan transcribe the paralinguistic vocal features. As the findings show, the paralinguistic vocal features, when transcribed into Chinese, appear to sound unnatural and uncorrelated. The inappropriate renderings are likely to prevent the target readers from making sense of the characters' vivid phonic articulation and emotional reaction. This paper suggests that the paralinguistic vocal features can be lively and dynamically transcribed if translator pays consistent attention to the interactive and task-performing functions of paralinguistic vocal features employed to evoke a special narrative voice. Retranslation is also provided to illustrate how to evoke the particular qualities of verbal sounds and non-verbal expressions.

* Department of English, National Kaohsiung First University of Science and Technology.

Keywords: paralanguage, literary translation, Edith Wharton, *The Age of Innocence*

Paralanguage is defined as “the nonverbal voice qualities, modifiers, and independent sound constructs we use consciously or unconsciously supporting, contradicting or accompanying the linguistic, kinesic or proxemic messages” (Poyatos, “Aspects, Problems and Challenges” 42). As the intonational and attitudinal markers, paralanguage, has become for Edith Wharton an effective narrative strategy and engaging medium for characterizing various speech acts that surround the conversations. In *The Age of Innocence*, Wharton has shown much initiative for depicting the nonverbal communicative activities through which the complexity of psychological state and the subtlety of speech act are configured to portray her characters’ particular attributes, motives or attitudes. This vocal orchestration by means of paralinguistic description serves as conversational implicatures and presents translator with rich potential for interpretation. Nevertheless, Basil Hatim indicates that this graphic representation “constitutes both an important aspect of linguistic communication and a particular problematic area in the work of translator” (50).

This paper¹ aims to investigate into how the translators in Taiwan oralize the paralinguistic components encoded in *The Age of Innocence*. A pragmaticstylistic study is conducted to elicit attention to Wharton’s characterization of verbal sounds and the characters’ intention to communicate with each other via non-verbal expressions. Six types of paralinguistic vocal features and two types of verbal language-paralanguage combination are identified and foregrounded for further analysis. Then a scene-and-frame analysis is carried out to study the phonic effect of paralinguistic vocal features

¹ This research has been funded by grants from Nation Science Council (NSC99-2410-H-327-038-).

used in the conversations between the characters and the narrator's audible oralization, followed by an analysis of how effectively the verbal and paralinguistic components are handled by the translators² in Taiwan, whether the translators are capable of transcribing the conspicuous "paralinguistic component of an expression," in particular its "meaningful voice characteristics," to convey expressively the characters' personality traits and emotional states (Poyatos, *Textual Translation* 56, 55). Retranslation is also provided to illustrate how to evoke the particular qualities of verbal sounds and non-verbal expressions.

1. Foregrounding the Paralinguistic Means

Verbal and nonverbal components are realized in combination when certain voice characteristics are portrayed, corresponding to the verbal expressions. Fernando Poyatos categorizes two types of paralinguistic behaviors: verbal language-paralanguage and paralanguage-verbal language. According to Poyatos, verbal language is a rather neutral expression, "not conspicuously qualified by any meaningful paralanguage or kinesics" (*Textual Translation* 55). Verbal language-paralanguage combination refers to the meaning "conveyed primarily by the verbal part" with "meaningful voice characteristics" (*Textual Translation* 55). Paralanguage-verbal language is a combination in which the paralinguistic component of an expression is much

² *The Age of Innocence* is translated by Er YanYu, Ya Hui Wu, and Ai Li Er. Their translation works are published respectively by Crown Publishing Ltd, Han Fong, and Sin Sih Lu in 1993, 1997, 2007.

more conspicuous and meaningful than the verbal part (Poyatos, *Textual Translation* 56).

Six types of paralinguistic vocal features are identified: (1) vocal modality, (2) phonetic feature encoded, (3) attitude feature encoded, (4) non-verbal feature encoded, (5) paralinguistic comments encoded, (6) narrator's paralanguage. Features 1 and 2 contain the voice types and sound effects that are visually described or transcribed in the text. According to Poyatos's classification, vocal modality and phonetic feature convey the primary qualities and qualifiers of human speech that can be verbally described or orthographically transcribed. The vocal qualities includes "timbre, resonance, loudness, tempo, pitch, intonation range, syllabic duration, and rhythm" (Poyatos, "Aspects, Problems and Challenges" 42). The qualifiers, as Poyatos observes, "characterize physiological (many of a reflex nature) as well as psychological states and emotional reactions, produced naturally (mostly uncontrollably) or voluntarily" ("Aspects, Problems and Challenges" 42). What the qualifiers denote in discourse depends on how they are expressed in the physical world and external situational context. For instance, laughter which can be taken as weak implicature may denote joy, anxiety, or aggression. Therefore, circumstantial conditions may affect the way a qualifier is interpreted.

Features 3, 4, 5 and 6 belong to the non-verbal components which are implicitly present in the text to connote how the characters and narrator express themselves. In the process they become more complex and dialogic when there are other nonverbal behaviors involved. According to Poyatos, the added up visual behaviors may serve the following functions: (1) adding information, (2) supporting what is said verbally, (3) duplicating what has been

said verbally, (4) emphasizing the words, (5) weakening what is said verbally, (6) contracting it, (7) masking words, (8) anticipate words, (9) verbal deficiency (*Textual Translation* 59, 60). Seen in this light, the speech components, if combined with a particular nonverbal behavior such as eye contact or facial expression, may be taken as strong implicatures since the reader can deduce specific implicated assumptions, premises, or conclusions according to the characters' utterances and nonverbal behaviors.³

For translation analysis conducted in the following section, Charles Fillmore's concept of "scenes-and-frames" is applied to analyze the stylistic use of paralinguistic vocal features in Wharton's novel and to evaluate the translator's oralization of the six types of paralinguistic vocal features and two types of verbal language-paralanguage combination. The analysis starts by investigating the frame(s), the paralinguistic components inherent in the source text, and particular scenes evoked. Then the particular scene(s) constructed and activated by the translators will be assessed against the frame established in the source text by which particular paralinguistic components are employed to trigger certain acoustic effects or to build up a mental attitude. As Hatim notes, "Failure to imagine the scene of a particular aspect of [vocal] behavior described in the source text, or failure to render this adequately in some target text, invariably leads to communicative difficulties" (57).

³ As implicatures vary with the degree of strength, Diane Blakemore writes, "A speaker who constrains the interpretation of his utterance so that the hearer takes very little responsibility in the choice of contextual assumptions and contextual effects is said by Sperber and Wilson to be engaging in *strong communication*" (157, emphasis original). In other words, for an utterance to achieve relevance in strong communication, the hearer who engages in strong communication requires to recover the full range of strong implicatures associated with utterances.

2. Translator's Oralization of Paralinguistic Means

Written language oralization or mute oralization, as Poyatos calls it, often appears in “a conversational encounter between characters or any of [the narrator's] masterful descriptions and comments” (Poyatos, *Textual Translation* 75). In terms of the oralization between characters, it is not what they say but how they say it that “has a decisive bearing on their interactions” (Poyatos, *Textual Translation* 73). As for the “masterful descriptions and comments” generated by the writer's “choice of words and word constructions,” how the author's or narrator's utterances sound can have an effect on reader's imagining of the character's speaking face and bodily features, which are sometimes supplemented by the author's visual, audible or mental oralization (Poyatos, *Textual Translation* 73). Table 1 shows the frequency of five types of paralinguistic vocal features in each chapter:

Table 1⁴

Chapter	Paralinguistic Vocal Features	Frequency of Occurrence	Total
I.	Vocal modality(S.+Report Verb)	1	2
	Phonetic feature encoded	0	
	Attitude feature encoded	0	
	Non-verbal feature encoded	0	
	Paralinguistic comments encoded	1	

⁴ In calculating the frequency for narrator's paralanguage, only the number of italics, parenthesis, and quotation mark in use is counted

	Narrator's Paralanguage	0	
II.	Vocal modality(S.+Report Verb)	7	18
	Phonetic feature encoded	3	
	Attitude feature encoded	2	
	Non-verbal feature encoded	1	
	Paralinguistic comments encoded	2	
	Narrator's Paralanguage	3	
III.	Vocal modality(S.+Report Verb)	2	14
	Phonetic feature encoded	0	
	Attitude feature encoded	6	
	Non-verbal feature encoded	5	
	Paralinguistic comments encoded	1	
	Narrator's Paralanguage	0	
IV.	Vocal modality(S.+Report Verb)	1	13
	Phonetic feature encoded	0	
	Attitude feature encoded	2	
	Non-verbal feature encoded	0	
	Paralinguistic comments encoded	10	
	Narrator's Paralanguage	0	
V.	Vocal modality(S.+Report Verb)	11	44
	Phonetic feature encoded	1	
	Attitude feature encoded	16	
	Non-verbal feature encoded	4	
	Paralinguistic comments encoded	6	
	Narrator's Paralanguage	6	

By calculating the frequency of occurrence, it is found that attitudinal vocal features take up the largest proportions. In what follows, particular utterances from the first five chapters are selected to evaluate how graphically the three translators transcribe particular verbal and paralinguistic language conceived by Wharton to preserve vivid phonic articulation and evoke emotional reaction.

2.1 Vocal Modality

Vocal modality refers to the utterances with and without paralinguistic markers. While the utterances with paralinguistic markers indicate the tone and voice quality of speech, those without paralinguistic markers contain only the neutral reporting verb or illocutionary verb to signal the beginning and end of a verbal utterance without “any additional explicit description of the way the characters ‘say’ something” (Nord 111). As Nord suggests, when the neutral reporting verb such as *say* is used to introduce a verbal utterance, “It is up to the reader to fill in the gap, imagining the tone or quality of voice” in the circumstances described (Nord 111). The following examples represent the different use of vocal modality in the first five chapters.

Example 1 is what Nord calls “zero-representation of paralanguage,” in which the verb to *say* is used to introduce a verbal utterance of a character (111). The verb is literally translated into “說” :

Example 1	Chinese Translation of <i>Say</i>
Wharton	There was a general laugh, and the young champion said:

	“Well, then----?” (II. p. 9)
Yu	一陣哄笑，年輕護花使者說：「唔，後來——？」(p. 16)
Wu	這些話引來一陣哄笑，年輕的護花使者說：「唔！後來——？」(p. 13)
Ai	這話引出一陣哄堂大笑，那位年輕的護花使者說：「唔，可是——」(p. 34)

Such a rendering is quite inappropriate if we take the verbal part into consideration. It is apparent that a young champion is inquiring about Ellen Olenska's past in the middle of conversation. It is better to translate the verb say into “繼續問道” or “接著又問” (literally: to continue asking) to stress everyone's curiosity about Ellen's love affair after she divorced her husband while anticipating more questions to come.

In example 2, the utterance is introduced by the neutral verb say, but the tone is indicated in the verbal expression with an exclamation mark:

Example 2	Chinese Translation of Say
Wharton	“My God!” he said ; and silently handed his glass to old Sillerton Jackson. (I. p.5)
Yu	「我的天！」他 說 ；一聲不吭將望遠鏡遞給老席勒頓·傑克遜。(p. 11)
Wu	「天啊！」他 才說完 便一聲不響地將望遠鏡遞給老席勒頓·傑克遜。(p. 8)
Ai	「我的上帝！」他 說 ，接著默默地將望遠鏡遞給了老席拉頓·傑克遜。(p. 28)

The three translators again render the word *say* literally, and such a rendering hardly expresses the speaker's astonishment of seeing Ellen appear in the opera house. The word *say* can be rendered into “他（語帶）驚訝的說” (literally: to say with surprise) to highlight what is seen by Lawrence Lefferts is unbelievable.

The word of *exclaim* instead of *say* is also used by Wharton to describe Lefferts's surprise of seeing Ellen. When used in the speech act, the tone of this verb is more explicit than the neutral reporting verb *say*. While Yu and Wu employ the same expression “輕呼” (literally: to call with low voice), Ai renders the word into “喊道” (literally: to shout):

Example 3	Chinese Translation of <i>Exclaim</i>
Wharton	“Well—upon my soul!” exclaimed Lawrence Lefferts, turning his opera-glass abruptly away from the stage. (I. p. 4)
Yu	「唔——我的天！」勞倫斯·李佛 輕呼 ，猝而將他的歌劇望遠鏡自舞台移開。(p. 11)
Wu	「噢——我的天！」勞倫斯·李佛 輕呼 ，猝然將歌劇望遠鏡拿下，不再望向舞台。(p. 7)
Ai	「哎呦——我的老天！」勞倫斯·萊佛茨 喊道 ，忽然把他的小望遠鏡從舞台的方向移開。(p. 28)

Similar to the speech act presented in example 2, the use of verb *exclaim* tends to emphasize the appearance of Ellen is beyond Lefferts's anticipation. The renderings only specify that the speech is uttered by Lefferts. To strengthen

the illocutionary force, it is suggested to translate exclaim into “低聲咕噥著。” “咕噥” (gu nong) means saying something in a low or barely audible voice in dissatisfaction or irritation. As the setting is in the opera house, the speaker cannot speak out loud to express their dissatisfaction or irritation.

In examples 4-7, Wharton uses particular descriptive verbs such as continue, laugh, cry, murmur to depict what and how the character is saying something. In example 4, Wharton’s deliberate use of verb continue rather than ask implies the speaker’s intention of speech act, that is, to share the information he knows with others while searching for confirmation by using reflexive question in the verbal part:

Example 4	Chinese Translation of <i>Continue</i>
Wharton	"He's an awful brute, isn't he?" continued the young enquirer, a candid Thorley, who was evidently preparing to enter the lists as the lady's champion. (II. p. 9)
Yu	「他是個粗暴的傢伙，不是嗎？」詢問者又問，他是個坦誠的索萊氏，顯然打算躋身那位女士的護花使者之列。(p. 15)
Wu	「他是個粗暴的傢伙，不是嗎？」詢問者又問，他是坦誠的索萊家族的一員，顯然打算躋身那位女士的護花使者之列。(p. 13)
Ai	「他是個可怕的畜牲，不是嗎？」年輕人接著說，他是索利家族中一位直率的人，顯然準備加入那位女士的護花使者之列。(p. 34)

All the three translators tend to explicitate the meaning of “continue” by adding to ask or to say. In doing so, what “continue” denotes in the speech

act is not correctly interpreted. It is suggested that “continue” should be rendered into “年輕男士反問” to direct the reader attention to the reflexive question presented in the verbal part that also shows the speaker’s intention to safeguard Ellen.

In example 5 and 6, the verbs laugh and cry indicate manner of speech and a particular emotion accompanying the utterance. Again, literal meaning of each verb is reproduced in the translation:

Example 5	Chinese Translation of <i>Laugh</i>
Wharton	"Oh, that's part of the campaign: Granny's orders, no doubt," Lefferts laughed . "When the old lady does a thing she does it thoroughly." (II. p. 9)
Yu	「哦，這是擁護行動的一部分：外婆的命令，無疑，」李佛 大笑 。「老太太做事向來徹底。」(16)
Wu	「哦，這是保護行動的一部分。無疑是外婆的命令，」李佛特 大笑著說 ：「老夫人做事向來貫徹到底。」(14)
Ai	「噢，這是運動的一個組成部分嘛——肯定是老祖宗的命令，」萊佛茨 笑著說 ，「老夫人要是做一件事，總要做得完全徹底。」(35)

Yu and Wu’s rendering “大笑” (literally: laugh out loud) is not suitable to transcribe Lefferts’s manner of speech. Ai’s rendering “笑著說” (literally: to speak with laugh) may be better than Yu’s and Wu’s rendering “大笑”, but it fails to convey Lefferts’s laugh-it-off attitude towards the doubt brought up in the conversation. The translation can be reformulated as “莞爾一笑” to denote Lefferts’s attitude encoded in his manner of speech.

2.2 Phonetic Feature Encoded

Description of voice qualities introduced by adverbial specifications of the neutral or illocutionary verbs is aimed at specifying the sound, especially the degree of its loudness and pitch, and the speaker's emotional change. In example 6, 7, and 8, sound quality is transcribed or specified to indicate manners of speech. In example 9 and 10, verbs such as cry and murmur are used to denote specific sound quality. As Nord notes, "Often, the description of voice quality cannot be separated from the indication of emotions" (113).

In example 6, the line "M'ama ... non m'ama" sung by the prima donna in Italian means "he loves me ... loves me not" in English. How the prima donna sings this line is specified by the narrator's remark. How the three translators render this line deserve our attention:

Example 6	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"M'ama ... non m'ama ..." the prima donna <i>sang</i> , and "M'ama!", with a final burst of love triumphan..... (I. p. 2)
Yu	「媽媽.....不媽媽.....」首席女歌星高唱，「媽媽！」終於迸出愛情的勝利..... ° (p. 8)
Wu	「他愛我——他不愛我——」首席女伶高唱著，「他愛我！」終於她並唱出愛情的勝利.... ° (p. 8)
Ai	「姆啊嘛.....嚶姆啊嘛.....」首席女演員唱道，她以贏得愛情後的最後爆發力唱出「姆啊嘛！」..... ° (p. 25)

Among the three translations, Yu mistranslates the meaning of “M’ama ... non m’ama” while Ai intends to transcribe this line phonetically, which does not make any sense. In addition, their transcriptions of the narrator’s remark give reader a wrong impression of emotion expressed by the prima donna. Wu may do a better job on translating the line, but her transcription of the narrator’s comment lacks for cohesion. To vividly transcribe the ecstatic emotion expressed by the prima donna, the narrator’s remark can be rendered into “在最後唱出「他愛我」的瞬間欣喜若狂”.

In example 7, voice quality is expressed through adverbial specification “in a low tone.” Literally speaking, this specification refers to loudness of the voice. But Yu’s and Wu’s renderings transcribe well the voice quality. However, Ai’s rendering “悄悄地說” (literally: quietly, silently) alters the locutionary act:

Example 7	Chinese Translation
Wharton	“Well – it’s queer to have brought Miss Welland, anyhow,” someone said in a low tone , with a side-glance at Archer. (II. p.9)
Yu	「唔——無論如何，帶威蘭小姐同行倒是有點怪異。」 有人低聲說 ，斜睨亞契。(p. 16)
Wu	「嗯——不過無論如何，帶威蘭小姐同行倒是有點不妥。」 有人低語 ，斜睨著亞契。(p. 14)
Ai	「唔——不管怎麼說，把韋蘭小姐帶來總是令人費解。」 有人悄悄地說 ，一面斜視了亞契爾一眼。(p. 34-35)

In example 8, the narrator’s remark “with her trailing slightly foreign accent” describes Ellen’s voice quality. The trailing voice articulated by Ellen is complemented by expressive use of dash:

Example 8	Chinese Translation
Wharton	“Ah, how this brings it all back to me — I see everybody here in knicker-bockers and pantalettes,” she said, with her trailing slightly foreign accent , her eyes returning to his face. (II. p.10)
Yu	「啊，這兒讓我想起當年的一切——我發現此地每個人都穿了長內褲和燈籠短褲。」她用 拖曳的，略帶異國腔的口音說 。她的眼神轉向他。(p. 17)
Wu	「哦，這兒讓我想起當年的一切——我發現這裏每個人都穿起燈籠褲和寬鬆長褲。」她 說話的聲音慵懶且帶點異國腔調 。並將眼睛轉向他。(p. 15-16)
Ai	「啊，這種場面多讓我想起過去的一切啊——我發現這裡人人都穿燈籠褲。」她 帶著略微拖長的異國口音說 ，目光又回到他的臉上。(p. 36)

Yu’s and Ai’s rendering of “trailing” into “拖曳的” or “拖長的” fails to characterize Olenska’s overstated manner of speech. To highlight her overstated manner, “trailing” that denotes a particular voice quality should be transcribed explicitly. It is suggested to render this remark into “帶著些微的異國口音，她語重心長的說” (literally: to speak with foreign accent and sincerity).

In example 9, literal translation of verb cry fails to denote a particular emotion expressed by the character. In this affectionate conversation between Newland and May, Newland boldly expresses his love for May:

Example 9	Chinese Translation of <i>Cry</i>
Wharton	"Oh, dearest --always!" Archer cried . (III. p. 15)
Yu	「哦，親愛的——永遠如此！」亞契 輕喊 。(p. 22)
Wu	「哦，親愛的——直到永遠！」亞契 輕喊著 。(p. 22)
Ai	「哦，最親愛的——永遠！」亞契爾 喊道 。(p. 42)

Rendering the verb cry into “輕喊” or “喊道” (literally: to call out or to shout) hardly convey Newland’s passionate feeling shown at the moment. It is suggested to render cry into “熱情的回應” (literally: to respond with passion) to make explicit Newland’s feeling.

In example 10, Wharton uses the verb murmur to convey Mrs. Welland wishes to speak something but being interrupted by Newland. Among the three translations, Ai’s rendering “囁嚅” (literally: to speak haltingly in formal situation) sounds better than Yu’s and Wu’s rendering:

Example 10	Chinese Translation of <i>Murmur</i>
Wharton	"Oh--" Mrs. Welland murmured , while the young man, smiling at his betrothed, replied: "As soon as ever it can, if only you'll back me up, Mrs. Mingott." (IV. p. 18)
Yu	「哦——」威蘭太太 低呼 ，年輕人則含笑望著他的未婚妻，回答，「愈快愈好，只要妳肯支持我，明格太太。」

	(p. 26)
Wu	「哦——」威蘭太太 低呼 ，亞契則含笑地望著未婚妻，回答道，「愈快愈好，只要妳肯支持我，明格老夫人。」(p. 28)
Ai	「哦——」韋蘭太太 囁嚅道 。年輕人卻朝未婚妻露出笑顏，回答說：「越快越好，明戈特太太，只要您肯支持我們。」(p. 47)

2.3 Attitude Feature Encoded

Specific verbs and adverbial phrases used in an utterance may contain the explicit indications of the speaker's attitude. In example 11, the verb "hazard" refers to the young inquirer's speculation on why Ellen shows up at the opera house. The conjecture is offered with an intention of making double-entendre:

Example 11	Chinese Translation of <i>Hazard</i>
Wharton	Perhaps," young Thorley hazarded , "she's too unhappy to be left at home." (II. p. 9)
Yu	「或許，」年輕的索萊氏 大膽推測 ，「她不太快樂，不適用於留在家中。」(p. 16)
Wu	「或許，」年輕的索萊 大膽推測 ，「她鬱鬱寡歡，所以不適用於獨守家中。」(p.13)
Ai	「也許，」那位小索利 冒險地說 ，「她太不快活了，不會願意一個人被晾在家裡。」(p. 34)

The three translators' renderings fail to characterize the speaker's joking attitude. The verb "hazard" is better translated into "貿然臆測" (literally: blunt conjecture) to show young inquirer's bluntness.

In example 12, adverbial phrase is added to describe attitude towards Olenska's nonappearance in the ball. The collocation "happy indifference" conveys Newland's dual attitudes, showing his nonchalance for Ellen's nonappearance and at the same time his reserved admiration for May's upbringing:

Example 12	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Oh, well--" said Archer with happy indifference . (III. p. 16)
Yu	「噢——」亞契爾無所謂地說。(p. 43)
Wu	「唔，哦——」亞契淡淡應聲，心中不由升起一絲喜悅。(p. 23)
Ai	「哦，唔——」亞契的口氣透著一種欣悅的淡漠。(p. 23)

While Yu's and Wu's translations fail to characterize Newland's ambivalent feeling, Ai's translation intends to convey the dual attitudes expressed by Newland. But by merging two different kinds of emotion, her rendering "欣悅的淡漠" (literally: indifference of joy) results in odd collocation unheard of in target language expression. This dual attitude can be rendered into "亞契爾淡淡道，不讓喜悅之情溢於言表" (literally: to hide one's emotion without speaking too much).

In example 13, Newland's sister Janey her acerbic attitude towards Ellen in the conversation around the subject of Ellen going out with Julius Beaufort.

She suggests that maybe Julius goes out with Ellen because he doesn't know much about Ellen's past:

Example 13	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Perhaps the Beauforts don't know her," Janey suggested, with her artless malice. (V p. 24)
Yu	「也許畢佛家不認識她，」珍妮表示，毫無技巧地顯露出她的惡意。(p. 33)
Wu	「也許畢佛不認識她，」珍妮直言無諱地披露出她的惡意。(p. 38)
Ai	「也許博福特夫婦不認識她。」珍妮帶著不加假飾的敵意推測說。(p. 54)

Through the remark “with her artless malice,” we know that Janey’s speech contains acrid tone. All three translations do well in delivering the literal meaning but fail to stress the tone expressed in this pungent remark. It is better to render Janey’s locutionary act into “珍妮出言不遜，惡意表露無遺” (literally: making impertinent remarks, revealing antagonism).

In example 14, Newland defends Ellen by arguing that her bad marriage is mere a bad luck. His attitude is remarked by the manner of “broke in” and then the argument made with a defensive tone:

Example 14	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Why not?" broke in her son, growing suddenly argumentative. "Why shouldn't she be conspicuous if she

	chooses? Why should she slink about as if it were she who had disgraced herself? She's 'poor Ellen' certainly, because she had the bad luck to make a wretched marriage; but I don't see that that's a reason for hiding her head as if she were the culprit." (V, p. 25)
Yu	「為什麼？」她兒子 插口道 ， 突然想與人爭辯似的 。「她若願意又為何不該引人注意？她何必躲躲藏藏好像是她自取其辱似的？她是可憐的伊蓮，沒錯，因為她運氣不好，遇人不淑；不過我不認為因此她就該像個犯人似的躲躲藏藏。」(p. 34)
Wu	「為什麼不？」亞契 插口想與人爭辯似的 ：「她若想出眾、引人注目，又有何不可？她何必受人冷落，好像她敗壞門風似的？她是可憐的伊蓮，沒錯，她的確運氣不好，遇人不淑。不過，我不認為她因此就該像個犯人似的見不得人。」(p. 39)
Ai	「為什麼不？」兒子 插言道 ，他 突然變得好爭辯 。「如果她願意，為什麼就不能引人注意？她為什麼就該閃閃躲躲，彷彿做了什麼丟人現眼的事似的？她當然是『可憐的艾倫』，因為她不幸結下了悲慘的婚姻；但我不認為她因此就得像罪犯一樣見不得光。」(p. 56)

It is worth noting that Yu's and Wu's renderings add “似的” (literally: alike) which gives a tone of uncertainty. Ai's rendering “變得好爭辯” (literally: fond of dispute) did specify Newland's emotional change, but such a rendering fails to show Newland's defensive attitude that indicates his disagreement with his mother. To manifest Newland's attitude in the translation, we can render

this line into「有何不可？」亞契反駁，當下立刻為伊蓮解套”。 The phrase “反駁” (literally: to retort) and “解套” (literally: off the hook) are used to overtly express Newland’s defensive attitude.

2.4 Non-verbal Feature Encoded

It is found that in the novel Wharton lets the characters exchange information through non-linguistic means. The examples provided below show eye contact as a direct form of non-verbal communication to communicate approval or disapproval. This non-linguistic way of communication reveals a tacit understanding or unspoken consensus (examples 15 and 17). But sometimes eye contact is used for making appeal or inspection (examples 16 and 18). In example 15, Newland and May show they can communicate with each other without words. Exchanging eye contact reveals their tacit understanding:

Example 15	Chinese Translation
Wharton	Her eyes said: “You see why Mamma brought me,” and his answered: “I would not for the world have had you stay away.” (II p.10)
Yu	她的眸子說，「你明白媽媽為什麼帶我來了，」而他的眼神回答，「再大的代價我也不會要妳避開。」 (p. 17)
Wu	她的眼眸彷彿說著：「你知道媽媽為什麼帶我來了。」而他的眼神則回道：「無論如何我絕不會離開你。」 (p.15)

Ai	她的眼睛在說 ：「你明白媽媽為什麼帶我來。」 他的眼睛則回答 ：「無論如何我都不會讓妳離開。」(p. 35)
----	--

“Eyes” are rendered literally into “眸子”, “眼神”, “眼眸”, “眼睛” to indicate eyes can speak. Such renderings fail to show that eye contact may serve as a hint, especially when the speaker wants to say something but can’t. In this case, May’s part can be rendered into “她看著亞契, 彷彿在暗示他” (literally: She looked at Archer, hinting at him) and Newland’s part “亞契則以充滿愛意的目光回應” (literally: Archer responds with his eyes full of love).

In example 16, May gives an eye contact to Newland for seeking a tactic understanding:

Example 16	Chinese Translation
Wharton	Her eyes fled to his beseechingly, and their look said: "Remember, we're doing this because it's right." (III p. 14)
Yu	她的眸子飄向他, 央求似地說, 「記住, 我們這樣做是因為這樣做是對的。」 (p. 21)
Wu	她的眼睛看向他, 央求似地說, 「記住, 我們這麼做是因為這樣做是對的。」 (p. 21)
Ai	她用眼睛向他投來懇求的目光, 彷彿是在說: 「別忘記, 我們這樣做是因為它符合常理。」 (p. 41)

Both Yu and Wu turn eye contact into a locutionary act. In other words, their renderings may mislead the reader to think that May speaks beseechingly instead of using eye contact. Ai’s rendering is more suitable but not concise.

The rendering can be reformulated as “她懇求的看著亞契，似乎在提醒他” (literally: She looks at him beseechingly, which seems to remind him).

In example 17, Newland and Ellen achieve a tacit understanding by exchanging eye contact. Unlike example 16, the eye contact is made after the verbal utterance:

Example 17	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Of course you know already--about May and me," he said, answering her look with a shy laugh. (IV p. 19)
Yu	「妳必然已經知道了——梅和我的事，」他 靦腆 一笑， 回答她的目光。 (p. 27)
Wu	「想必妳已經知道了——湄和我的事，」他 靦腆 一笑， 回答她的眼光。 (p. 27)
Ai	「當然妳已經知道了——我和梅的事，」他說， 並靦腆一笑回應她的注視。 (p. 48)

Among the three translations, only Ai's rendering conforms to the original verbal-paralanguage representation. Yu's and Wu's rendering may cause the reader to wonder whether Newland speaks or not in this situation. In addition, the phrase “靦腆一笑” is used to transcribe Newland's bashfulness expressed by shy laugh. To denote the tone in Newland's utterance, the line can be rendered as “他害羞的說，靦腆的以微笑來回應詢問的目光” (literally: He was abashed; smiled shyly at the inquirer's look).

In example 18, Old Sillerton Jackson gossips about Mrs. Struthers in the conversation with Mrs. Archer and Janey. After telling what he knows about Mrs. Struthers, he glances at Janey to see her reaction:

Example 18	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Out of a mine: or rather out of the saloon at the head of the pit. Then with Living Wax-Works, touring New England. After the police broke <i>that</i> up, they say she lived--" Mr. Jackson in his turn glanced at Janey , whose eyes began to bulge from under her prominent lids. (V p. 22)
Yu	「出自一個礦場；或者該說是礦坑外的一間酒館。而後跟著蠟藝團巡迴新英格蘭表演。警方查獲該團之後，據說她住在——」這下子傑克遜先生瞟一眼珍妮，她的眼珠正從厚厚的眼瞼下突張。(p. 31)
Wu	「出自一個礦場，或者該說是礦坑外的一間酒館。其後跟著蠟藝團在新英格蘭作巡迴表演。警方查獲該團之後，據說她住在——」這下子輪到傑克遜先生瞟一眼珍妮。珍妮厚重眼鏡下的眼珠，正張得斗大。(p. 35)
Ai	「她來自礦區，或者不如說來自礦井口上一間酒館。後來跟隨『活蠟像』劇團在新英格蘭巡迴演出，劇團被警方解散之後，人們說她住在——」這次輪到傑克遜先生朝著珍妮瞥了一眼，她的兩眼在突起的眼瞼底下張得鼓大。(p. 52)

In the translation, the verb “glance” is translated into “瞟一眼” or “瞥了一眼” to denote Mr. Jackson casts a brief and careless look at Jenny. These renderings fail to denote Mr. Jackson actually glance at Jenny on purpose. Another Chinese word “瞧” may be more suitable for indicating that Mr. Jackson dart a purposeful glance at Jenny for seeing her facial expression.

The line can be translated as “這次換傑克遜先生瞧珍妮一眼” (literally: this time it is Mr. Jackson’s turn to dart a purposeful glance at Jenny).

2.5 Paralinguistic Comments Encoded

Paralinguistic comments accompanying the utterance are non-verbalized clues which contain a rich repertoire of attitudinal references or statements. In example 19, Newland is supposed to hide his surprise, but repeating May’s word reveals his astonishment. The paralinguistic comment tells the reader why Newland acts so surprised:

Example 19	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"At the last minute?" he echoed, betraying his surprise that she should ever have considered the alternative possible. (III p. 15)
Yu	「臨出門？」他不由自主洩漏出他沒想到她竟會真以為那是可行之舉。(p. 23)
Wu	「臨出門？」他重複她的話，一時難掩驚訝之情，無法想像她竟會如此的率性而為。(p. 23)
Ai	「最後一刻？」他重複道，她竟然會改變主意，這使他十分驚訝。(p. 42-43)

Among the three translations, the verb “echo” which serves as an indicator of voice quality is not transcribed in Yu’s translation. Wu’s and Ai’s rendering of “echo” as “重複” (literally: to repeat) transcribes particular locutionary act performed by Newland. In addition, “the alternative” that refers to the decision Ellen has made is interpreted differently by the three translators.

Only Ai's rendering “竟然會改變主意” (literally: to change idea unexpectedly) is close to the situational context. Whereas Ellen decision of not to attend the party is beyond Newland's expectation, it is necessary to stress Newland's surprise and his intention to hide his astonishment in the translation: “他機械式地重複梅說的話，平淡的語氣中對伊蓮改變心意一事難掩驚訝”。

In example 20, the paralinguistic comment “with the proper affectation of reluctance” shows Mrs. Welland's reluctant attitude towards Newland's eagerness to marry May as soon as possible. However, she can only show her reluctance or unwillingness in front of others “with the proper affectation”:

Example 20	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"We must give them time to get to know each other a little better, mamma," Mrs. Welland interposed, with the proper affectation of reluctance... (IV p. 18)
Yu	「我們得讓他們有時間進一步了解彼此，媽媽。」威蘭太太 插口道，帶著適度的不捨。 (p. 26)
Wu	「我們得讓他們更進一步了解彼此，媽媽。」威蘭太太 插口道，露出適度的難捨之情。 (p. 28)
Ai	「媽媽，我們得給她時間，讓他們彼此多瞭解一點。」韋蘭太太 插話說，同是又恰如其分地裝出一副不情願的樣子。 (p. 47)

Besides “插口”, “插話” or “插嘴”, another verb “打岔” (literally: to interrupt) can be used to describe Mrs. Welland who suddenly cut in on a conversation. All three translators' rendering of “proper affectation” denotes that Mrs.

Welland did show her reluctance instead of hide her feeling. In fact, such a rendering fails to take the cultural factor into consideration. With the presence of Mrs. Manson Mingott, Mrs. Welland is not allowed to express her opinion. Therefore, the line should be rendered as “威蘭太太打岔道，強忍不將自己反對的神情表現出來” (literally: Mrs. Welland interrupts and hides her look of disagreement).

2.6 Narrator's Paralanguage

In the novel, the narrator's paralanguage is expressed through the use of italics (example 21), parenthesis (example 22), and quotation mark (example 23) to provide extra information, give emphasis, or “suggest to the reader that the narration is ‘spoken’ in a particular tone” (Nord 115). It is found in the translation that the use of parenthesis and quotation mark is preserved, but the words in italics are not marked as focused word (see example 21):

Example 21	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"But this Mrs. Struthers," Mrs. Archer continued; "what did you say <i>she</i> was, Sillerton?" (V p. 22)
Yu	「可是這位史諸塞太太，」亞契太太繼續說，「你說她以前是什麼出身，席勒頓？」(p. 31)
Wu	「可是這位史諸塞太太，」亞契太太繼續說：「你說她以前是什麼出身，席勒頓？」(p.35)
Ai	「不過那位斯特拉瑟斯太太，」亞契爾太太接著說，「你說她是做什麼的，席拉頓？」(p. 52)

In example 22, parenthesis is used to emphasize Mrs. Mingott's "odd foreign way" of addressing the male guest by their surname. Only Ai's rendering conveys that Mrs. Mingott has an exotic way of calling the male guest by their surname. Yu's and Wu's rendering instead emphasizes that calling surname is quite a unique way to address the male guests. All three translations are too vague to transcribe Mrs. Mingott's unique way of addressing people. To avoid literal translation, the line can be translated into "她以姓氏來直呼男性賓客的方式獨樹一格":

Example 22	Chinese Translation
Wharton	"Ha! Beaufort, this is a rare favour!" (She had an odd foreign way of addressing men by their surnames). (IV p. 18)
Yu	「哈!畢佛，真是稀客!」(她對男士均以姓氏稱呼，方式特異。)(p. 26)
Wu	「哈!畢佛，真是稀客!」(她對男士均以姓氏稱呼，方式特異。)(p. 28)
Ai	「哈!博福特，這次難得大駕光臨!」(她用奇特的異國模式直呼男士的姓。)(p. 47)

In example 23, quotation marks are used to put emphasis on the word "draw" to stress how Mrs. Archer's revenge is done:

Example 23	Chinese Translation
Wharton	Her revenge, he felt – her lawful revenge – would be to “draw” Mr. Jackson that evening on the Countess Olenska

	(V p. 24)
Yu	他認為，她的報復之舉——她合法的報復之舉——大概就是這天晚上向傑克遜先生「套取」歐林斯加伯爵夫人的秘辛 (p.32)
Wu	亞契認為，母親的報復之舉——她名正言順的報復之舉——大概就是這天晚上向傑克遜先生「套出」歐林斯加伯爵夫人的秘辛(p. 37)
Ai	他覺得，她的報復——她的合法報復——就是要在今晚從傑克遜先生口中「引出」奧藍斯卡伯爵夫人的事。(p. 54)

Since the purpose of having dinner with Mr. Jackson is to gossip and exchange information about Ellen Olenska, all three translators' renderings create a wrong impression that Mrs. Archer who seems to know little about Olenska tends to lure Mr. Jackson to speak out Olenska's secrets. The word "draw . . . on" means to entice, and thus a more appropriate translation can be "就是在今晚「慫恿」傑克遜先生談論歐林斯加伯爵夫人的是是非非" (literally: to instigate Mr. Jackson to talk about Ellen Olenska's right and wrong).

In example 24, the adjective *sad* suggests to the reader that the narrator speaks in a stressed tone. The word "sad" is used to describe the particular look of one butler. Despite the translators' literal rendering, only Ai's translation attends to the use of definite article "the" in the original which specifies that Mr. Jackson is particularly speaking to the butler with "somber look":

Example 24	Chinese Translation
Wharton	Mr. Jackson glanced over his shoulder to say to the sad butler:

	"Perhaps . . . that sauce . . . just a little, after all --" (V p. 25)
Yu	傑克遜扭頭對愁容滿面的司膳說，「唔……那個醬料……還是來一點好了——」 (p. 35)
Wu	傑克遜先生扭頭對面容陰鬱的男管家說：「嗯——那個調味醬——還是來一點好了——」 (p. 40)
Ai	「傑克遜先生從肩頭斜視了一眼那位臉色憂沉的男僕說：「也許……那個佐料……只要一點，總之——」 (p. 56)

Based on the findings, it can be concluded that the paralinguistic means, when transcribed into Chinese, appear to sound unnatural and uncorrelated. Three problems can be identified among the three translations investigated: the translator (1) decodes the literal meaning of paralinguistic vocal feature without paying much attention to its referential or expressive function of vocal quality encoded (see discussion in 8.2.1 & 8.2.2), (2) decodes the literal meaning of verbal expression without attending to the particular attitude that accompanies with it (see discussion in 8.2.3), (3) decodes the literal meaning of paralinguistic vocal features but which may lead to wrong impression or misrepresentation (see discussion of examples 15, 16, 17, 18 in 8.2.4; examples 19, 20 in 8.2.5; examples 22, 23, 24 in 8.2.6). Inappropriate descriptions and transcriptions of paralinguistic vocal features and behaviors inevitably hinder the target readers from making sense of the verbal utterances that accompany particular paralinguistic characteristics, which denote particular voice quality, manner of speech, discourse intention and state of emotion.

3. Iconization of the Paralanguage in Translation

As the act of oralizing can take place during the course of reading and translation, reader and translator are considered to “be ‘oralizers’ of their own text as they produce their words and sentences” by reading aloud or transcribing on paper (*Textual Translation* 73). Since sensitive reader is capable of oralizing the paralinguistic components denoting particular phonic effect, it takes a sensitive translator to transcribe the sound of the original as close to the sensible images conceived by the author. As the analysis shows, translation of paralinguistic in the conversation is handled rather carelessly and loosely. Voice quality and ways of speaking, in particular, are rarely specified with contextually appropriate prosody of oral language which specifies a speaker’s vocal feature in an utterance. In my retranslation, the illocutionary verbs and specific verbs are carefully chosen to represent paralinguistic phenomena. Adverbial phrases expressing voice quality or emotional state of a character are added to increase comprehensibility and to deliver an impression of greater precision.

The transcription of paralinguistic contour demonstrated in my retranslation is determined particularly by the analyst who intends to foreground the paralinguistic vocal features as iconic signs while taking into account their expressivity. In other words, paralinguistic vocal features are perceived as “valid representations of their object -- in fact they are signs because of this representative capacity -- and highly stylized” (Johansen 384). They are perceived as iconic “only if the perceiver possesses the necessary knowledge and necessary skills” (Tabakowska 363). Although the concept of iconization is quite useful in selecting appropriate verbs or adverbial phrases to represent paralinguistic phenomena, there is a possibility that the iconic signs

perceived by the translator may or may not attract the attention of the reader. Moreover, the pragmatic effect intended by the translator may fail to direct the reader's interpretation of particular paralinguistic vocal features that accompany the verbal utterance. Some translators may employ superfluous stress markers such as italics, quotation marks or parentheses to achieve iconizing effect. As Nords contends, "From a functional perspective, it is not the italics that constitute a translation unit but the function they are intended to accomplish in the source text. The same function can be achieved by various linguistic or paralinguistic means" (127). Therefore, it is the translator's choice of verbs or adverbials with specific illocutionary forces that affect the reader's perception and interpretation of the interaction between the characters.

Nevertheless, how to iconize paralinguistic vocal features in translation remains a problematic issue in translation practice. As Elzbieta Tabakowska notes, "iconicity may become problematic only when it constitutes (an element of) a particular goal-oriented strategy . . . i.e. when it becomes instrumental in achieving a particular communicative purpose. In other words, it has to be intentional, thus going beyond the scope of mere communicative functionality" (364). This concept of iconicity seems quite useful in the reading and rendering of paralanguage particularly conceived by the author. In the course of reading paralinguistic description or representation of particular character's way of speaking, the first step is to recognize, identify, and iconize the paralinguistic elements represented in the text. Then through "imaginative iconization," a term coined by Johansen to emphasize "imagination in linking the symbolic signs of the text with iconic ones," mental images are triggered, depending on the paralinguistic selected for iconization (385, 386). When it comes to translating a character's vocal quality or manner of speech, the verbal

transcription should be matched “with the imagined iconic representation it calls forth” (Johansen 387). During the translation process, translator is fully conscious and emotionally involved in investigating, recalling and creating the characters’ images particularly linked to verbal description and transcription of paralinguistic vocal features. Translator-as-reader, using partly the text’s instructions, partly their own memories and fantasy, actually see, with the mind’s eye, i.e., imagine a character, a scene, a piece of action (Johansen 387).

4. Conclusion

It is illustrated in this paper that the paralinguistic vocal features can be fully displayed in translation if translator is capable of iconizing the paralinguistic phenomena, processing particular mental images triggered by the paralinguistic vocal features, and translating them with precision. With a purpose to provide readers with more lively and dynamic depiction of the characters’ voice qualities and manners of speech, the translator as sensitive reader should carefully evaluate whether his or her renderings are capable of characterizing the character’s vocal qualities and transforming paralanguage into conversational explicature. As Tabakowska contends, intentional iconization “adds to the overall meaning of the text. And ‘the unsaid’ must be rendered in translation along ‘the said’” (373). Whereas paralanguage contains certain speech characteristics conceived to evoke a particular narrative voice, attitude or behavior, translator should evaluate the paralinguistic phenomena and interpret each phenomenon with caution and discretion. In doing so, not only the linguistic evoking vocal qualities but also the implicit meaning of paralanguage can be transcribed and elicited

appropriately to evoke the audible quality and intention of particular speech utterance. By reading the verbal expressions evoked through the paralinguistic vocal features, the target reader can picture in their mind that particular vocal qualities or nonverbal behaviors to which they apprehend correspond to some extent the character's personality and state of mind.

參考書目

- Hatim, Basil. "Discourse Features in Non-verbal Communication: Implications for the Translator." In *Nonverbal Communication and Translation: New Perspectives in Literature, Interpretation and the Media*. Ed. Fernando Poyatos. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1997. 49-66.
- Johansen, Jørgen Dines. "Iconizing Literature." *From Sign to Signing: Iconicity in Language and Literature 3*. Fischer, Olga and Müller, Wolfgang G. (Eds.). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Pub., 2003. 377-410.
- Nords, Christiane. "Alice Abroad: Dealing with Descriptions and Transcription of Paralanguage in Literary Translation." In *Nonverbal Communication and Translation: New Perspectives in Literature, Interpretation and the Media*. Ed. Fernando Poyatos. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1997. 107-29.
- Poyatos, Fernando. *Textual Translation and Live Translation: The Total Experience of Nonverbal Communication in Literature, Theater and Cinema*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, 2008.
- . *Nonverbal Communication across Disciplines*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, 2002.
- . "Aspects, Problems and Challenges of Nonverbal Communication in Literary Translation." In *Nonverbal Communication and Translation: New Perspectives in Literature, Interpretation and the Media*. Ed. Fernando Poyatos. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1997. 17-48.
- Tabakowska, Elzbieta. "Iconicity and Literary Translation." *From Sign to*

Signing: Iconicity in Language and Literature 3. Fischer, Olga and Müller, Wolfgang G. (Eds.). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Pub., 2003. 361-76.