

# 霍譯本《紅樓夢》的語域變幅、社群分野與英語文學成規

洪濤\*

## 摘 要

本文探討《紅樓夢》霍克思 (David Hawkes) 譯本中的特殊語言現象，並嘗試了解這些現象與英國文學成規之間的關係。文章首先描述譯本內部的語言變異現象，然後嘗試了解英國文學的寫作成規（外緣）以及這些成規對霍克思的影響。霍克思運用英語特點構建出逼真的藝術世界，但是，霍氏「無中生有的譯法」未獲某些中國學者的諒解，因為後者稟持的是另一種文學成規。

**關鍵詞：**《紅樓夢》英譯、霍克思、翻譯行為、社群分野、文學成規、譯作的受容

---

\* 香港中文大學文學院

## The Language Register and Social Stratification in David Hawkes's *The Story of the Stone* and their Relation with English Literary Conventions

Hung, Tao \*

### Abstract

This paper discusses the prominent features of David Hawkes's translation of Chinese novel *Honglouloumeng* (《紅樓夢》), also known as *The Story of the Stone* and their relationship with literary norms. The discussion starts with a detailed intrinsic study of the language variations in Hawkes's translation, then it moves on to a brief description of English writing conventions, which have an impact on Hawkes as a literary translator. Hawkes's skillful manipulation of the English language has created a vivid, realistic world of art, but his translation approach is not accepted by some Chinese scholars who confine themselves to another set of literary conventions.

**Keywords:** English translation of *Honglouloumeng*, David Hawkes, translational behaviors, social stratification, literary conventions, reception of translated literature

---

\* Faculty of Arts, Chinese University of Hong Kong

## 1. Introduction

The Chinese novel *Honglouloumeng* 紅樓夢 has long been recognized as the greatest Chinese literary work. No modern novels have hitherto been treated as its equal. As a matchless masterpiece, *Honglouloumeng* is, however, outperformed in certain artistic aspects by twentieth century translators who “rewrote” it<sup>1</sup>. Among them, David Hawkes is a standout – his translation *The Story of the Stone* is widely acknowledged as a gem in literary translation.

Outperforming the source text (ST) means the translated text or target text (TT) is no longer treated as a mere duplicate of the ST. Instead, the TT carries more, and is in some sense better than the ST. But what has stimulated the translator to present “more” in the TT? What are the reasons or factors behind the translator’s creativity?

This article will describe what Hawkes has done, what translation effect he has achieved, and will also attempt to figure out whether Hawkes was inspired by any English literary norms/conventions.

## 2. An Intrinsic Study of The Language Variation

N. F. Blake in his *Non-standard Language in English Literature* points out that “an author can use one of the several constituents of language to indicate non-standard speech: spelling (to indicate variation in pronunciation),

---

<sup>1</sup> For a discussion of translation and rewriting, see André Lefevere, “Why Waste Our Time on Rewrites? The Trouble with Interpretation and the Role of Rewriting in an Alternative Paradigm,” in Theo Hermans ed., *The Manipulation of Literature: Studies in Literary Translation* (London & Sydney: Croom Helm, 1985).

vocabulary and syntax.”<sup>2</sup> This theory is applicable to David Hawkes’s work in which language variations such as dialectal expressions, non-standard language features and so forth are used to visualize the characters in the story. In the following we will discuss the textual details of Hawkes’s translation from three aspects, namely spelling, vocabulary, and grammar (including syntax).

### 2.1. Spelling and Variation in Pronunciation

From time to time, (hereafter “HLM”) depicts how certain characters pronounce words in a particular manner. For example, Shi Xiang-yun (史湘雲) speaks with a lisp (Chapter 20), while Lin Dai-yu (林黛玉) and Grannie Liu (劉姥姥) occasionally use dialectal or old-fashioned expressions in the original story.<sup>3</sup> The actual instance of Shi Xiang-yun's lisping in the original text is:

二人正說著，只見湘雲走來笑道：「愛哥哥，林姐姐，你們天天一處頑，我好容易來了也不理我一理兒！」黛玉笑道：「偏是咬舌子愛說話，連個『二哥哥』也叫不上來，只是『愛哥哥』『愛哥哥』的。回來趕圍棋兒，又該你鬧『么愛三』了。」寶玉笑道：「你學慣了，明兒連你還咬起來呢。」<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> Norman F. Blake, *Non-standard Language in English Literature* (London: Deutsch, 1981), p.14.

<sup>3</sup> In this paper, 曹雪芹、高鶚：《紅樓夢》(北京：人民文學出版社，1964) is taken as the original (hereafter referred to as HLM). On the other hand, translation examples are cited from David Hawkes trans., *The Story of the Stone* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1973-1980).

<sup>4</sup> This case was discussed by Stephen Soong (宋淇) in his academic monograph which is entitled 《紅樓夢西遊記：細評紅樓夢新英譯》(台北：聯經出版事業公司，1976).

Here 咬舌子 and 咬起來 mean lisping.

In Chapter 21 of Hawkes's translation, Shi Xiang-yun lisps twice as in "Pleathe cousin, just this once – spare me" (Vol.1, P.414), and "Nathty habit" (Vol.1, P.417). Apparently "pleathe" refers to "please," and "nathty" refers to "nasty". In the original Chinese version, however, Xiang-yun lisps once only (in Chapter 20).

In other words, Xiang-yun lisps more often in Hawkes's translation than in the original story – the translator's manipulation is evident in this regard. Another example can be found in Chapter 31 of Hawkes's translation, where it goes:

'Thilly yourthelf!' said Xiang-yun. 'The others can decide which of us is the silly one when I have explained my reason. If I send things for you and the girls, it's assumed that they are for [...]' (Hawkes, Vol.2, P.120; emphasis added).

"Thilly yourthelf" means "silly yourself." Here we can see that Xiang-yun does not pronounce every "s" as "th": "the silly one" and "I send things for you and the girls" are pronounced properly without any phonological variation. This example shows that Hawkes does not use phonologically-varied words recklessly.

The deviant spellings "pleathe", "nathty", "thilly yourthelf" cited above are all created and put in place by Hawkes in the TT with reference to Xiang-yun's performance in Chapter 20 of the ST. In the ST, in fact, Xiang-yun pronounces normally from Chapter 21 onwards.

In a subsequent chapter of Hawkes's translation, Shi Xiang-yun says

“Thoppy, come and try thome.” (Vol.2, Chapter 49, P.485). The sentence should be, in normal pronunciation, “Soppy, come and try some.”

The approach Hawkes adopts in rendering Xiang-yun’s conversations in different contexts appears to indicate that **intra-textual coherence** had been taken into account when he was translating, and the outcome is Xiang-yun has a consistent habit to speak with a lisp, especially when she pronounces the letter “s”.<sup>5</sup>

This is not the only case of the translator’s creativity. In Hawkes’s translation, people of noble or humble origins speak with their respective characteristics which are not to be found in the ST. Feng Zi-ying (馮紫英), for instance, distinguishes himself by pronouncing “Father” as “Fahver”, and “Mother” as “Muvver”:

‘Fahver’s in good health, thank you very much,’ said Feng Zi-ying, ‘but Muvver hasn’t been too well lately. Caught a chill or somethin.’<sup>6</sup>

We also note that Feng drops the “g” sound in “something.” (i.e., g-dropping)<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> For a discussion of textual coherence in a text, see Robert de Beaugrande & Wolfgang Dressler, *Introduction to Text Linguistics* (London: Longman, 1981).

<sup>6</sup> David Hawkes trans, *The Story of the Stone* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books), vol.1, p.521.

<sup>7</sup> For a discussion of g-dropping, see Peter Trudgill, *The Social Differentiation of English in Norwich* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1974), p.92. Suzanne Romaine points out that “...the lower a person’s social status, the more likely he or she is to use a higher percentage of alveolar rather than nasal endings [...] It is a well-known marker of social status over most of the English-speaking world.” See Suzanne Romaine, *Language in Society: an Introduction to Sociolinguistics* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.69.

The speeches of old women (e.g., Grannie Liu, Nannie Zhao, etc) deviate from the norm as well. Readers can easily identify some tiny "flaws" in their pronunciation. For example, in Hawkes's translation, "one" is pronounced by Grannie Liu as "un":

“今兒索性作個老風流！”

‘Tis no matter: now I shall be a stylish old 'un.’

This case (Hawkes, Vol.2, P.280; emphasis added), together with other language variations, manifests a feature of dialectal speech.<sup>8</sup>

In addition, old-fashioned words such as “’Tis”, “’Twas”, “’Twill” and “’Twere” are also purposefully used by Hawkes to translate the talks of women-servants in the Jia family. Below we list some examples (emphasis added) for reference:

- (1) “’**Tis** no matter,” said GrannieLiu. (Hawkes, Vol.2, P.280)
- (2) “’**Twas** a young woman...,” said Grannie Liu. (Hawkes, Vol.2, P.270)
- (3) “As long as you don’t drink too much, ‘’**Twill** do you good,” said Nannie Zhao.
- (4) “’**Twere** no more than paying for the Emperor’s entertainment with the Emperor’s own silver,” said Nannie Zhao (Hawkes, Vol.1, P.315).

The fact that only a few senior female characters in the translated story expressed themselves using “’Tis” and “’Twas” (deviant spellings) suggests

---

<sup>8</sup> Note also that “girl” is pronounced as “gal” by another old village woman in Hawkes’s translation.

that Hawkes meticulously constructs this age-graded variation for characterization of the elderly.<sup>9</sup>

## 2.2. Vocabulary

In terms of vocabulary in Hawkes's translation, elderly female characters of humble origin have their own favorite words. "Howsomever" and "leastways" are two dialectal or vulgar language examples. Let us examine how Hawkes uses "**leastways**".

In Chapter 33, after Bao-yu was heavily beaten by his father, his maid Aroma tries to find out the reason behind the beating. Tealeaf, a page boy, informs her of what happened before: "Well, the Bijou business he probably knew about indirectly through Mr Xue,' said Tealeaf. 'Mr. Xue had been feeling very jealous, and it looks as though he may have put someone else up to telling the Master about it out of spite. And Golden he probably heard about from Master Huan – **leastways**, that's what the Master's own people told me.'" (Hawkes, Vol.2, P.153). The sentence containing "leastways" corresponds with "我也是聽見跟老爺的人說" (HLM, Vol.2, P.403) in the ST.

In Chapter 57 of Hawkes's translation, Nightingale, maid of Dai-yu, said, "There's no Lin family – **leastways**, if there is, they're very, very distant relations, and not in Soochow, either, but scattered all over the place, in different provinces. And even if one of them did come to take her away, Her Old Ladyship would never let her go." (Hawkes, Vol.3, P.99-100; emphasis added). The ST reads "林家真沒了人了；縱有，也是極遠的族中，也都不在蘇州住……" (HLM, Vol.2, P.730). It can be inferred that "leastways"

---

<sup>9</sup> For a discussion of the use of deviant spellings, see Raymond Chapman, *The Language of Thomas Hardy* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Macmillan, 1990), p.115.

represents “縱有” in Chinese.

In Chapter 67, when interrogated by Wang Xi-feng, Joker, a page of Jia Lian, said: “Her mother and her younger sister - **leastways**, the younger sister *was* living with her, but the day before yesterday she cut her throat.”(Hawkes, Vol.3, P.328; emphasis added). The corresponding line in the ST is “他母親和他妹子(住著)◦昨兒他妹子自己抹了脖子了◦” (HLM, Vol.3, P.879)

In Chapter 68, the Ning-guo women-servants begged Mrs Lian for mercy: “Mrs Lian: even though our mistress is at fault, you ought not to be too hard on her - **leastways**, not in front of us servants.” (Hawkes, Vol.3, P.347; emphasis added). This happened when the servants hoped that Xi-feng could pardon You-shi, their mistress. The ST reads “奶奶也作踐夠了，當著奴才們” (HLM, Vol.3, P.889).

Given the fact that the masters of the Jia family have never used “leastways” in their dialogues, the appearance of “leastways” in the TT stands out to function as a social marker. According to *The New Oxford Dictionary of English*, “leastways” is “dialect or informal at least.”<sup>10</sup>

In short, if there is “a standard language variety” for the Jia masters and mistresses, it is apparent that the women-servants have their own language variety.

In my article which is entitled “Grannie Liu speaking English” (劉姥姥說英語), examples are cited to demonstrate how Hawkes made Grannie Liu speak dialect. Under the section of “Grannie Liu’s vocabulary”, dialectal

---

<sup>10</sup> *The New Oxford Dictionary of English*. Edited by Judy Pearsall (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), p.1049.

words such as “anyways”, “mayhap” and “meself” are highlighted.<sup>11</sup>

Besides, words like “afeared”, “growed” (grew) and “agen” (against) in *The Story of the Stone* are dialectal and/or non-standard, all indicating that speakers who use them are not well-educated.<sup>12</sup>

### 2.3 Grammar and Syntax

In terms of grammar and syntax, there are grammatical mistakes and wrong collocations in the dialogues of some characters in Hawkes’s translation.

The mistakes are not typographical errors. Instead the “mistakes” are there to serve a special purpose.

In *The Story of the Stone*, language errors are typically made by a small boy, the You-shi sisters, Xing De-quan and so on. These characters have something in common: they have not received much formal schooling, and they are all outsiders from the Jia masters’ perspective. Below are a few examples from Hawkes’s translation.

In the story, a small boy once said: “周大媽，有個老奶子來找你呢” (HLM, Vol.1, P.71). David Hawkes translates it into “There’s an old woman come to see you!” (Hawkes, Vol.1, P.155; emphasis added.) The child language variation is evident here.<sup>13</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> 洪濤。〈劉姥姥說英語〉，《城大文學》第6期(2004年9月30日)，第122–124頁。

<sup>12</sup> 洪濤。《女體和國族：從紅樓夢翻譯看跨文化移殖和學術知識障》。北京：國家圖書館出版社，2010，第207-214頁。

<sup>13</sup> See also Julie Roberts, “Child Language Variation”, *The Handbook of Language Variation and Change*. Edited by J. K. Chambers, Peter Trudgill, and Natalie Schilling-Estes (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 2002), p.333-348.

Xing De-quan speaks faulty English as well. Mr. Xing, dubbed “Uncle Dumbo” in Hawkes’s translation, is addicted to gambling, drinking and debauchery. The wife of Jia Zhen once criticized Xing De-quan and his fellows, saying “這一起沒廉恥的小挨刀。再灌喪了黃湯，還不知嘔出些甚麼新樣兒的來呢！” (HLM, Vol.3, P.981) (Hawkes's translation: “Just listen to those animals! By the time they’ve swilled a few more cups of wine, heaven knows what filth they’ll be coming out with!” [Hawkes, Vol.3, P.496]). We can easily infer from the comment how lowly and rotten Uncle Dumbo is.

In Chapter 75, Uncle Dumbo makes fun of the boys who served him wine, saying “我這會子看着又怪心疼的了” (HLM, Vol.3, P.980). Hawkes’s version reads “‘Little dears!’ he said, ‘How I **loves** them!’” (Hawkes, Vol.3, P.495; emphasis added) Grammatically, the verb should be “love” instead of “loves”.

Similar cases can be found in English literary works. In *The Mayor of Garratt* (written by the British dramatist Samuel Foote), when Jerry Sneak speaks, the verb following the subject of first person singular always ends with an “s” or “es” (e.g., “I never does” and “I never contradicts her”).<sup>14</sup>

Similarly, in *The Hypocrite* (authored by the Irish playwright Issac Bickerstaffe), Mawworm always adds an “s” or “es” after verbs in present tense, regardless of the subjects, e.g., “I rebukes” and “we lets”.<sup>15</sup> Sociolinguist Ralph W. Fasold treats non-standard concord cases like these as hypercorrection, which means “use of -s with verbs whose subjects are not

---

<sup>14</sup> Samuel Foote, *The Mayor of Garratt* (Boston: Wells and Lilly, 1822), p.25.

<sup>15</sup> J. L. Dillard, *Black English: Its History and Usage in the United States* (New York: Random House, 1972), p.110.

third person singular and even, in a few cases, with non-finite verbs.”<sup>16</sup>

In Hawkes’s translation, dialectal words and ungrammatical expressions (i.e., non-standard concord) are mainly used by people of lower class.<sup>17</sup> Taking this into consideration, we come to a conclusion that the varied register in Hawkes’s translation contributes to accentuating the social boundaries in the world of *The Story of the Stone*.<sup>18</sup>

### 3. Extrinsic Study: English Literary Conventions

John H. Fisher has pointed out that “It is noteworthy that from the time English dialects began to appear in eighteenth-century novels and plays, they have been used chiefly as **class markers**.” (emphasis added)<sup>19</sup> Language variations and speech features were employed by Victorian novelists such as Charles Dickens, the Brontës, and Thomas Hardy to create characters (characterization).<sup>20</sup> Here is a case from Dickens’s *Hard Times*:

---

<sup>16</sup> Ralph W. Fasold, *Tense Marking in Black English: A Linguistic and Social Analysis*; with a chapter on noun plural absence by Carolyn Kessler (Arlington, Va.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1972), p.131.

<sup>17</sup> Douglas Biber, et al., *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English* (Harlow: Longman, 1999), p.190.

<sup>18</sup> J. C. Catford has pointed out that register means “a variety correlated with the performer’s social role on a given occasion.” See J. C. Catford, *A Linguistic Theory of Translation: an Essay in Applied Linguistics* (London: Oxford University Press, 1965), p.89.

<sup>19</sup> John H. Fisher, *The Emergence of Standard English* (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1996), p.147.

<sup>20</sup> Raymond Chapman, however, points out: ...there is the convention of the earlier Victorian novel that virtuous characters or those who are meant fully to engage the reader’s sympathy should speak standard English. Dickens had so treated Oliver Twist, Pip and Liaaie Hexam, among others, and Hardy gives little or no dialect to characters like Jude, Giles Winterbourne, and Diggory Venn.” See Raymond Chapman, *The Language of Thomas Hardy* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Macmillan, 1990), p.121.

‘Thquire!’ said Mr. Sleary, who was troubled with asthma, and whose breath came far too thick and heavy for the letter s, ‘Your thervant! Thith ith a bad piethe of bithnith, thith ith. You’ve heard of my Clown and hith dog being thuppothed to have morrithed?’<sup>21</sup>

In Hawkes’s translation, Shi Xiang-yun pronounces “s” in a similar way (“th”). We cannot rule out the possibility that Hawkes was inspired by the way Mr. Sleary speaks.<sup>22</sup>

In Hawkes’s translation, Grannie Liu said “‘**Tis** no matter” and “‘**Twas** a young woman”, and Nannie Zhao said “‘**Twere** no more than paying for”. This age-graded variation is also spotted in Thomas Hardy’s *The Mayor of Casterbridge* - an old woman talks in a similar way: “‘**Tis** too good for us – we can’t meet it!”<sup>23</sup>

Bernard Shaw’s *Pygmalion* is another typical example of using accents to distinguish social classes of people. For example, in the first act of the play a bedraggled Cockney flower girl scolds Freddy, saying "Nah then, Freddy: look wh' y' gowin, deah. ... There's menners f' yer! Te-oo banches o voylets trod into the mad."<sup>24</sup>

On the other hand, writers of Chinese literary classics seldom change the forms of Chinese written characters to represent speakers’ accents. This marks

Emphasis added.

<sup>21</sup> Charles Dickens, *Hard Times: An Authoritative Text, Contexts, Criticism*. Edited by Fred Kaplan, Sylvère Monod (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 2001), p.31.

<sup>22</sup> David Hawkes was a fan of Charles Dickens, according to Hawkes’s collaborator John Minford, who discussed *The Story of the Stone* at the Chinese University of Hong Kong in 2012.

<sup>23</sup> Thomas Hardy, *The Mayor of Casterbridge*. Edited by Dale Kramer (Oxford [Oxfordshire]; New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), p.44.

<sup>24</sup> Bernard Shaw, *Pygmalion* (New York: Dover Publications, 1994), p.2.

a difference between Chinese and English writing conventions.<sup>25</sup>

Chinese novelists, however, often use lexical items to denote the cultural background and social class of a character. For example, in *The Water Margin* (《水滸傳》), Lu Zhishen and Li Kui often talk abrasively. Pan Jinlian in *The Plum in the Golden Vase* (《金瓶梅》) uses a lot of vulgar curse words. In *Journey to the West* (《西遊記》), Xuanzang, or Tripitaka, frequently uses Buddhist expressions. All these lexical phenomena offer a brief glimpse of the speakers' social background.

In the case of *The Story of the Stone*, obviously David Hawkes is well versed in using the phonological, morphological and grammatical features of the English language for characterization purposes.

#### 4. Critical Reviews and Critics' Concerns

The language register that Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang adopt in their translation of *Honglouloumeng* is not critically acclaimed. Feng Qinghua 馮慶華, for example, expresses his dissatisfaction with the Yangs' choice:

The source text is about several maids and elderly women-servants, who are not likely to speak formally. However, in the Yangs' translation, '來了好些姑娘奶奶們' is translated as 'A party of ladies, old and young, have arrived', which is inappropriate. First of all, the phrase 'a party of' is generally formal. Secondly, 'old and young', a non-restrictive attribute,

---

<sup>25</sup> Chinese writers sometimes change the forms of Chinese written characters for other purposes. For a brief discussion, please read 羅青。《從徐志摩到余光中》。(臺北：爾雅出版社, 1977), 第 55-60 頁。

when placed in the middle of this short sentence, is a formal usage as well. All this made the sentence sound literary. Even Bao-yu and Dai-yu, who are well-educated, would not speak that way in everyday life, not to mention the servants.<sup>26</sup>

It is inevitable that critics have their own standards when it comes to assessment of literary translation.<sup>27</sup> And what the critics are concerned with is not necessarily a concern for the translators, who may not have given attention to stylistic details.

Hawkes's manipulative translation of the dialogues, which is often purposeful, appears to reflect that he translates with the English literary tradition and the art of novel writing in mind. Unfortunately, the creative elements in his translation are not well received by some Chinese scholars who are bound by writing conventions rooted in the Chinese literary tradition. Stephen C. Soong 宋淇, for instance, has questioned Hawkes's endeavor in representing the image of Feng Zi-ying.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> Feng Qinghua's view (in Chinese) is “原文裏描寫的是幾個小丫頭並老婆子，她們的語言不可能很正規。但是楊譯將‘來了好些姑娘奶奶們’譯成 A party of ladies, old and young, have arrived 是欠妥的，首先是 a party of 總體上來說是比較正規的，其次是 old and young 作為一個非限定性定語放在這樣一個短句的中段也顯得非常正規，這個特點都給這個句子添加了濃重的書面化色彩，別說是丫頭婆子們說不了這樣的話，就是寶玉黛玉也不可能在日常生活口語中說出這樣的話。” See 馮慶華：《母語文化下的譯者風格：紅樓夢霍克斯與閔福德譯本研究》（上海：上海外語教育出版社，2008），第180頁。

<sup>27</sup> Katharina Reiss, *Translation Criticism, the Potentials and Limitations: Categories and Criteria for Translation Quality Assessment*. Translated by Erroll F. Rhodes (Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub, 2000), p.114.

<sup>28</sup> 林以亮（宋淇）。《紅樓夢西遊記》（台北：聯經出版事業公司，1976），第8頁。

Some Chinese scholars are of the view that Hawkes has made too much effort to accommodate the English readers. Cui Yonglu 崔永祿, a translation critic, is one of them who expressed strong reservations about the Anglicized language features in *The Story of the Stone*. Cui's own view is that the translator's prime task is to promote the source culture.<sup>29</sup>

Behind this kind of critical evaluation are the literary concepts and norms developed in the Chinese literary context. Reluctant to take the translation as an individual work which has its own life, critics tend to turn a blind eye to the extra artistic effects produced by David Hawkes in *The Story of the Stone*.<sup>30</sup>

Just as conservative translators refuse to show initiatives and independence in their work, so source-oriented translation critics are not receptive of "creative deviations" in translation.<sup>31</sup>

## 5. Conclusion

From the previous parts of this article, we understand that non-standard

---

<sup>29</sup> For Cui's views, read his paper published in 劉士聰主編：《紅樓譯評》(天津：南開大學出版社，2004年10月)。

<sup>30</sup> Tao Tao LIU observed that "*The Story of the Stone* is an English novel that can be read for its own sake with pleasure." See *Style, Wit and Word-play: Essays in Translation Studies in Memory of David Hawkes*. Edited by Tao Tao Liu, Laurence K. P. Wong and Chan Sin-wai (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012), p.xi.

<sup>31</sup> Susan Bassnett, however, observes that "In the new, post-colonial perception of the relationship between source and target texts, that inequality of status has been rethought. Both original and translation are now viewed as equal products of the creativity of writer and translator, [...]" See Susan Bassnett, *Translation Studies* (London; New York: Routledge, 2002), p.5.

language has been used by lower-class characters in *The Story of the Stone* to distinguish servants from people of higher ranks. The language features that Hawkes produces (i.e. accents, style, grammar and vocabulary) in the target text are laden with social significance where the varieties of language and register serve as indicators of social stratification. We can conclude that Hawkes's choice is understandable and justifiable - if illiterate servants spoke in the same way as their highly-educated masters did, the servants would not be lifelike enough and the story would become less credible.<sup>32</sup>

As a scholar of stylistics puts it, "it is no novelty in literary criticism to study how the most skillful writers clearly differentiate the speech of their characters, while the incompetent or unpracticed make no significant variation."<sup>33</sup> We believe the **principle of differentiation** applies to translators as well.

To sum up, the variation in register of *The Story of the Stone* is in line with the English literary convention. Hawkes's mastery of the art of novel writing has produced an artistic effect which is not explicit in the ST.

---

<sup>32</sup> However, Hawkes's portrait of Shi Xiang-yun as a lisper has met with some reservations.

<sup>33</sup> Chapman, Raymond, *Linguistics and Literature: An Introduction to Literary Stylistics* (London: Edward Arnold, 1973), p.18.

## References

- Bassnett, Susan. *Translation Studies*. London & New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Biber, Douglas et al. *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. Harlow: Longman, 1999.
- Blake, Norman F. *Non-standard Language in English Literature*. London: Deutsch, 1981.
- Cao Xueqin. *The Story of the Stone*. Trans. David Hawkes, Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1973–1980.
- Catford, J. C. *A Linguistic Theory of Translation: an Essay in Applied Linguistics*. London: Oxford University Press, 1965.
- Chapman, Raymond. *The Language of Thomas Hardy*. Basingstoke, Hampshire: Macmillan, 1990.
- , *Linguistics and Literature: An Introduction to Literary Stylistics*. London: Edward Arnold, 1973.
- de Beaugrande, Robert & Wolfgang Dressler. *Introduction to Text Linguistics*. London: Longman, 1981.
- Dickens, Charles. *Hard Times: An Authoritative Text, Contexts, Criticism*. Ed. Fred Kaplan and Sylvère Monod. New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 2001.
- Dillard, J. L. *Black English: Its History and Usage in the United States*. New York: Random House, 1972.
- Fasold, Ralph W. *Tense Marking in Black English: A Linguistic and Social Analysis*. Arlington, Va.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1972.
- Fisher, John H. *The Emergence of Standard English*. Lexington: University

- Press of Kentucky, 1996.
- Foote, Samuel. *The Mayor of Garratt*. Boston: Wells and Lilly, 1822.
- Hardy, Thomas. *The Mayor of Casterbridge*. Ed. Dale Kramer. Oxford [Oxfordshire] & New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Liu, Tao Tao, Wong K.P. Laurence and Chan Sin-wai ed. *Style, Wit and Word-play: Essays in Translation Studies in Memory of David Hawkes*. Edited by (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012).
- Lefevere, André, “Why Waste Our Time on Rewrites? The Trouble with Interpretation and the Role of Rewriting in an Alternative Paradigm.” *The Manipulation of Literature: Studies in Literary Translation*. Ed. Theo Hermans. London & Sydney: Croom Helm, 1985.
- Pearsall, Judy ed. *The New Oxford Dictionary of English*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.
- Reiss, Katharina. *Translation Criticism, the Potentials and Limitations: Categories and Criteria for Translation Quality Assessment*. Trans. Erroll F. Rhodes. Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub, 2000.
- Roberts, Julie. “Child Language Variation.” *The Handbook of Language Variation and Change*. Ed. J. K. Chambers, Peter Trudgill, and Natalie Schilling-Estes. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 2002.
- Romaine, Suzanne. *Language in Society: an Introduction to Sociolinguistics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Shaw, Bernard. *Pygmalion*. New York: Dover Publications, 1994.
- Trudgill, Peter. *The Social Differentiation of English in Norwich*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1974.

林以亮(宋淇)。《紅樓夢西遊記：細評紅樓夢新英譯》。台北：聯經出版事業公司，1976。

洪濤。《女體和國族：從紅樓夢翻譯看跨文化移殖和學術知識障》。北京：國家圖書館出版社，2010。

曹雪芹、高鹗。《紅樓夢》。北京：人民文學出版社，1964。

馮慶華。《母語文化下的譯者風格：紅樓夢霍克斯與閔福德譯本研究》。上海：上海外語教育出版社，2008。

劉士聰主編。《紅樓譯評》。天津：南開大學出版社，2004年10月。

羅青。《從徐志摩到余光中》。臺北：爾雅出版社，1977。