

論霍克斯如何重塑《紅樓夢》中的微細情感戲劇

黃天琦*

摘 要

因其代表性，霍克斯的英譯本《石頭記》經常成為《紅樓夢》翻譯研究的對象。現有的專題研究主要著眼於翻譯中各方面有關文化和語言的元素，卻鮮有探討譯本如何翻譯出原著文字中細緻的情感戲劇效果。鑑於情感戲劇效果對表達原著有關「愛」的主題尤其重要，本文旨在初探這研究缺口，探討霍克斯如何運用各種修辭技巧重塑人物間微細的情感戲劇。本文利用文本分析，比較原著第八回的選段以及霍克斯的翻譯，發現霍克斯雖成功重塑大部分的情感戲劇，部分卻因兩種原因被省略。除了某些用於表達情感的細節因過於精細而被忽視外，譯本也顯然因為受到英語中內含的階級意識阻礙，無法重塑中國社會中不同階級人物間的密切關係。

關鍵詞：紅樓夢、霍克斯、翻譯、情感戲劇

* 澳洲昆士蘭大學語言及文化學院

The Reconstruction of *Honglouloumeng*'s Subtle Emotional Drama in David Hawkes' *The Story of the Stone*

Wong, Tin-kei *

Abstract

One of the most representative translations of Cao Xueqin's *Honglouloumeng*, David Hawkes' *The Story of the Stone* invites numerous thematic studies on the translation of various cultural and linguistic elements. The translation of the sophisticated emotional drama underlying the text, despite its significance in expressing the theme of love in the original novel, has not been often discussed. To redress this omission, this paper aims to examine how Hawkes employs rhetorical skills to reconstruct the subtle drama surrounding the characters' emotions. Through a textual analysis comparing an excerpt from Hawkes' translation of Chapter 8 in *Honglouloumeng* with the original, this paper shows that while most of the drama is successfully reconstructed, some dramatic effect is lost because the translator appears to have overlooked the drama contained in some subtle expressions in the original. True representation of the close relationships among characters of different classes in Chinese society is also found to be lacking in the English translation due to the effects of the inherent class-consciousness of the English language.

Keywords: *Honglouloumeng*, David Hawkes, translation, emotional drama

* School of Languages and Cultures, The University of Queensland

1. Introduction

Very often considered the greatest Chinese novel ever, Cao Xueqin's 曹雪芹 *Honglouloumeng* 紅樓夢 is honoured not only for its linguistic and ideological sophistication reflecting Chinese culture, but also for its refined depictions of universal humanity. Along with the development of "Redology" (*hongxue* 紅學), the academic interest in this masterpiece extends to its translations. Over the past few decades, beginning with the 1980s, there has been intensive research in Chinese academia focusing on the translation of such culturally and linguistically specific elements as poetry, names, idioms and chapter titles in *Honglouloumeng*.¹ Few studies, however, centre upon the dramatic quality of the original as reconstructed in the translation. To date, except for Cai's study on the dramatic scenes related to Granny Liu (Cai), there is apparently no research in China linking the concept of "drama" with the English translation. Concerning the theme of humanity in the original novel, however, the subtle drama of the characters' emotions is significant because it adds an aesthetic element to the portrayal of the theme of love through the expression of the characters' exquisite sentiments. Considering the fact that David Hawkes' *The Story of the Stone* is analysed and compared as one of the most representative translations in most of thematic discussions to date, his translation is chosen as the subject of this study.

¹ For detailed surveys on the studies of English translations of *Honglouloumeng* in China see: Wen and Ren for the period 1979–2010; and Chen and Tian for the period 2005–2015.

1.1. Method

This paper aims to examine Hawkes' approaches to reconstructing the characters' subtle emotional drama through a textual analysis comparing an extract of Chapter 8 of *Honglouloumeng* and Hawkes' translation of this chapter. The translation is examined within the context of the original story as suggested by the Red Inkstone Commentary. The commentator, Red Inkstone (*Zhi Yanzhai* 脂硯齋), is widely considered to be the most prolific and significant commentator on *Honglouloumeng*. In fact, when *Honglouloumeng* first appeared in manuscripts, the title of the handwritten copies was *The Tale of the Stone with Commentary by Zhi Yanzhai*. Despite the controversy over some of Red Inkstone's comments, the Red Inkstone commentary is still valued as a crucial reference to assist with understanding and interpreting the novel because of his unique literary analyses and his supposedly close relationship with Cao (Shi 41). Therefore, Hawkes' translation is examined within the context and interpretation of the original story suggested by this authoritative commentary.

1.2. The chosen excerpt

In this paper, an extract of Chapter 8 is selected for a focused reading of the portrayal of Dai-yu 黛玉 and the emotional drama created by this portrayal. The highlight of this extract is the depiction of the conversation between Bao-yu 寶玉, Bao-chai 寶釵, Dai-yu, Snowgoose 雪雁, Aunt Xue 薛姨媽, and Nannie Li 李嬈嬈 in Pear Tree Court 梨香院 when Bao-yu and Dai-yu coincidentally go to visit Bao-chai, who feels under the weather. For the purpose of this study, "drama" is defined as "dramatic quality or effect; colourfulness, excitement" ("drama." Oxford English Dictionary). Describing

the interaction of the characters, the emotional drama underlying this extract mainly revolves around Dai-yu's jealousy and affection for Bao-yu and the close relationship between Bao-yu and Nannie Li.

The conversation, which centres upon Bao-yu's wine-drinking issues, starts when Bao-yu asks for wine served cold rather than warm. Bao-chai then stops him from drinking cold wine by explaining the harm it does to the body. After witnessing how the obedient Bao-yu refrains from drinking cold wine because of Bao-yu's lecture, Dai-yu starts engaging in the conversation by making an implicit sarcastic remark about Bao-yu's obedience to Bao-chai, with the blame she was ostensibly attributing to her maid Snowgoose actually being directed at Bao-yu. The conversation continues, with Dai-yu's increasingly aggressive words initially defending herself, and later Bao-yu, implicitly, showing her to be a hypersensitive but defensive and proud girl who always hides her affection for Bao-yu and makes use of her quick wit for spiteful remarks about others. When conversing with Dai-yu, on the other hand, Nannie Li displays her affection for Dai-yu, an extension of her affection for Bao-yu with an affectionate nickname addressing Dai-yu.

2. Reconstructing Dai-yu's characterisation and her emotional drama

The sophisticated depiction of Dai-yu's physical and verbal responses in her interactions with other characters exemplifies the extensive use of characterisation to present and reveal characters in the storytelling of *Hongloumeng*, by which Cao creates vivid images of the fictional protagonists and hence strong foundations for emotional drama to build on. In the excerpt discussed in this paper, the subtle drama of the characters' emotions is mainly

created by the characterisation of Dai-yu. The use of characterisation, together with the drama it creates, leads the readers to better understand the development of the story.

2.1. Physical response

Back in the scene in which Bao-chai lectures Bao-yu on the harm caused by cold wine, although Dai-yu does not join the conversation verbally, she actually participates in the interaction as a listener, showing an important physical response that gives a hint to readers to anticipate her later verbal response and how to interpret it. While Bao-yu is listening to Bao-chai's lecture, Dai-yu reacts in an interesting way while sitting beside them.

Original: 黛玉磕著瓜子兒，只抿著嘴笑。(Cao and Gao 123)

Translation: Dai-yu, who sat cracking melon-seeds between her teeth throughout this homily, smiled ironically. (Hawkes 193)

While both the original and the translation render the same depiction of Dai-yu cracking melon-seeds, the descriptions of the smile she gives are different, with clear textual discrepancy found between the original and the translation. First, the lexical meaning of “smiled ironically” is different from that of “*minzhe zui xiao* 抿著嘴笑” which literally means “to have a tight-lipped smile”. The Red Inkstone commentary surmises that this suppressed smile is “sinister”, which probably suggests something crafty in Dai-yu's

mind.² From the perspective of a contemporary expert on body language, a partially suppressed smile with pursed lips and other facial parts relaxed indicates that the person has a secret plan or secret disagreement that makes him or her feel powerful in that situation (Brown). Interestingly, this interpretation explains Dai-yu's unusual smile while she was cracking melon-seeds. Her secret plan is revealed just a few lines later when she criticises Bao-yu indirectly with her words to Snowgoose. By referring to the Red Inkstone commentary, together with the interpretation of Dai-yu's non-verbal language, the additional phrase "smiled ironically" can be justified as an elaboration of Dai-yu's facial expression instead of an over-translation.

There is another addition in the translation that is used to facilitate the flow of the plot by making the drama explicit. In the original text, there are no words with the same semantic meaning as the adverbial phrase "throughout this homily". This phrase leads readers instantly to interpret Dai-yu's apparently purposeless action as a relevant response to the conversation between Bao-yu and Bao-chai in which Bao-chai is lecturing Bao-yu, who obeys her readily.

Apart from these two additional pointers rendering Dai-yu's responses explicit, the periodic sentence structure in the translation also functions to create a dramatic effect. The long median subordinate sets the stage for the short main clause "smiled ironically" to appear at the end, emphasising the action as a surprising climax (Tredinnick 72-96). This elicits readers

² The commentary reads: "Comment on the side of Jiashu manuscript: Her intricate thoughts are unknown, where do they come from? Comment of Mengfu manuscript: A sinister smile. 甲戌側：實不知其丘壑，自何處設想而來？蒙府：笑的毒。" (Zhu 146)

speculation about Dai-yu's hidden agendas and sets the stage for her consequent sarcasm intended for Bao-yu.

2.2. Verbal response

2.2.1. Use of contrastive stress

To reconstruct the sarcasm behind Dai-yu's verbal responses, Hawkes employs contrastive stress in the English translation to render the dramatic effect. The following line is Dai-yu's sarcastic verbal response to Bao-chai's lecture, the sequel to her "sinister smile" discussed above.

Original: 也虧了你倒聽他的話。我平日和你說的，全當耳旁風；怎麼他說了你就依，比聖旨還快些！(Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: I am glad you are so ready to obey her. Generally when I tell you to do anything it goes in one ear and out the other; yet anything *she* tells you to do is followed out more promptly than an Imperial Edict! (Hawkes 193)

Having no lexical meaning, the particle “*dao* 倒” in the Chinese original functions to add emphasis to the utterance. In this sentence, the particle “*dao*” places emphasis on Dai-yu's mocking surprise to find Snowgoose is so ready to obey to another person. In Chinese, it is a common practice to employ particles and adverbs to signal the main thrust of an utterance, which is “*ting tade hua* 聽他的話” (“obey her”) in this case. English, on the other hand, relies mainly on phonetic stress to represent the strength with which the idea is maintained (Pollard 222). Well aware of the distinctive difference between Chinese and English to indicate the main message, Hawkes employs the use of

italics, an effective typographical device to denote contrastive stress. Contrasting with the normal stress that falls on the last word of a sentence, contrastive stress is used when the speaker wants to signal a marked focus which usually shows comparison or correction (Gramley and Pätzold 86). The contrastive stress on “I” and “she”, then, implies a comparison between Dai-yu and Bao-chai and is hence used in the translation to indicate that Dai-yu mocks Bao-yu for obeying Bao-chai. With the contrastive stress on the two pronouns, Hawkes makes the meaning of Dai-yu’s sarcastic remark explicit.

The same technique of using contrastive stress is employed later in the dialogue between Dai-yu and Nannie Li. While Nannie Li uses contrastive stress on the pronoun “you” to indicate her acknowledgement of Dai-yu’s special place in Bao-yu’s heart, Dai-yu uses contrastive stress again in a sarcastic way. The dialogue starts when Nannie Li asks Dai-yu not to encourage Bao-yu to drink more wine.

Original: 林姐兒，你不要助著他了！你倒勸勸他，只怕他還聽些。

(Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: “Now Miss Lin,” she said, “don’t *you* go taking his part!

If *you* encourage him he’s only too likely to do what you say!”

(Hawkes 194)

Then Dai-yu responds,

Original: 我為什麼助他？我也不犯著勸他。(Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: Take his part? Why should *I* want to encourage him?

(Hawkes 194)

Dai-yu uses the particle “*ye* 也” to distance herself from Bao-yu, toning the utterance with an attitude as if she did not care about Bao-yu. In the translation, contrastive stress is placed on the pronoun “I”, showing Dai-yu’s protest, declaring herself to be individual not related to Bao-yu. Without doubt, Dai-yu’s claim is not true because Dai-yu is obviously fond of Bao-yu in the original story. This ironic speech act is only Dai-yu’s response out of jealousy, as Bao-yu takes Bao-chai’s words so seriously and obediently. With the right stress in the English translation, the tone is retained and the emotional drama is hence reconstructed.

2.2.2. Use of level shift

To portray Dai-yu as an intelligent but bitter girl who is good at persuading and blaming others by her sophistry, Hawkes deploys a level-shift between question-forms and affirmative statements to retain or even amplify the modulating effect and candidness of Dai-yu’s utterance. The following two examples show Hawkes’ deployment of the level-shift.

- (a) Original: 姨媽不知道。幸虧是姨媽這裡，倘或在別人家，人家豈不惱？好說就看的人家連個手爐也沒有，巴巴的從家里送個來。

(Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: You don’t understand, Aunt... It doesn’t matter here, with you; but some people might be deeply offended at the sight of one of my maids rushing in with a hand-warmer. It’s as though I thought my hosts couldn’t supply one themselves if I needed it. (Hawkes 193)

- (b) Original: 往常老太太又給他酒吃，如今在姨媽這裡多吃了一口，

料也不妨事。必定姨媽這裡是外人，不當在這裡的也未可定。

(Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: After all, Lady Jia often lets him drink; why should it matter if Mrs Xue lets him have a cup or two? I suppose you think he can't be trusted to drink here because Mrs Xue is not one of us?

(Hawkes 194)

In (a) Dai-yu is explaining her thoughts to Aunt Xue to legitimise the blame she attributes to Snowgoose about the hand-warmer. As discussed, the blame is actually a sarcastic remark intended for Bao-yu. What Dai-yu displays here is her quick wit and ability to compose a logical context to legitimise her remarks about Snowgoose. Hawkes changes the original rhetorical questions to affirmative statements. Although they might not be as persuasive, they give a sense of affirmation and confidence as if what Dai-yu says is logically sound and legitimate. Affirmative statements are also less imposing than rhetorical questions as Dai-yu is talking to Aunt Xue, a senior.

By contrast, in (b) the affirmative statements are converted to rhetorical questions. As Dai-yu is implicitly defending Bao-yu, she argues with Nannie Li and contends by accusing Nannie Li of being disrespectful to Aunt Xue. The use of rhetorical questions here empowers the discourse. As a figure of speech, rhetorical questions are used as a device of negative assertion without the expectation of a formal answer. In the translation, Dai-yu's strong rhetorical questions, which interrogate Nannie Li with assumptions, strengthen her image as a shrewd girl. The choice of the level-shift intensifies the liveliness and vividness of Dai-yu's image.

3. Subtle drama lost

While a large part of the drama created by Dai-yu's image as a sarcastic and jealous girl is reconstructed with semantic additions and skilful use of rhetorical devices, a part of the dramatic effect is lost due to the translator's failure to address some subtle expressions crucial to the creation of drama and his decision to preserve the class-consciousness of the English language.

3.1. A playful atmosphere: Translation of *xiaodao*

In the translated excerpt, the treatment of the verb “*dao* 道” leads to the loss of some dramatic effect. Conventionally, the invariable use of “*dao*” to introduce most speech is considered to be a limitation of Chinese fiction because of the deficiency in description of manner or tone of the speaker, compared to the wide range of verbs following speech that give emotional colour in English (Bishop 239-47). At certain points in the chosen passage, however, it is the translated form of this verb that lacks emotion.

The translation of the phrase “*xiaodao* 笑道” is used as an example for discussion. Below are three of the instances this phrase is used and the corresponding translations.

- (a) Original: 黛玉因含笑問他 (Cao and Gao 123)

Translation: Dai-yu asked her. (Hawkes 193)

- (b) Original: 黛玉一面接了，抱在懷中，笑道 (Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: (Omitted)

- (c) Original: 黛玉笑道 (Cao and Gao 124)

Translation: said Dai-yu. (Hawkes 193)

The phrase “*xiaodao*”, literally meaning “says with a smile” or “says good-humouredly”, is used frequently in the original with certain meanings. Considering the overall atmosphere of the scene, it is a light-hearted and playful moment at which Dai-yu shows off her quick wit and glib tongue. Despite her mockery, neither Bao-yu nor Nannie Li is actually offended. In fact, both Bao-yu and Nannie Li respond to Dai-yu with a laugh. Knowing Dai-yu’s words are intended for him but not Snowgoose, Bao-yu replies with “*zhi xixide xiao liangzhen bale* 只嘻嘻的笑兩陣罷了” (“only laughing good-humouredly for a while”)(Cao and Gao 124). Nannie Li, on the other hand, after hearing Dai-yu’s rhetorical interrogation accusing her for disrespecting Aunt Xue, becomes “*you shi ji , you shi xiao* 又是急，又是笑” (“anxious but at the same time laughing”) (Cao and Gao 124). Bao-yu and Nannie Li’s laugh in the original therefore suggests that they are amused rather than offended by Dai-yu. While Hawkes retains Bao-yu’s laugh in the translation which shows Bao-yu’s response as “laughing good-humouredly” (Hawkes 193), he does not show Nannie Li’s laugh with his translation of her response as “did not know whether to feel upset or amused” (Hawkes 194). With not all the laughs translated, Hawkes does not fully portray the original playful atmosphere.

In the original, Dai-yu smiles a lot to convey her amusing sarcastic remarks. Examples (a) and (b) describe Dai-yu when she asks Snowgoose about the hand-warmer. Dai-yu asks the question with a smile and comments with a smile after receiving the hand-warmer because of her plan to mock Bao-yu. Example (c) shows that Dai-yu speaks with a smile when she talks to Aunt Xue, articulating the context for the blame she lays on Snowgoose. The smiles that accompany Dai-yu’s utterances, together with numerous smiling utterances by other protagonists, suggest that playful amusement prevails in

the interaction rather than tension. The omission of the verb “*xiao* 笑” (“smile”) in the translation adds formality and decorum, and hence tension, to the dialogues. On the other hand, the verb “*xiao*” can also be read as an expression strengthening Dai-yu’s sarcastic attitude. In this way, nevertheless, the omission of this verb in the translation dilutes the drama as well. The translator seems to have missed some of the emotional subtlety created by the monosyllabic verb “*xiao*” at various points.

3.2. Dai-yu’s affection for Bao-yu: Omission of *mang*

The omission of another monosyllabic adverb “*mang* 忙” (“hastily”) in the introduction of one of Dai-yu’s utterances leads to a loss of subtle drama in the relationship between Dai-yu and Bao-yu. When Dai-yu sees the dejected Bao-yu after Nannie Li warns him not to drink anymore, Dai-yu’s response is introduced by the phrase “*mang de shuo* 忙的說” (Cao and Gao 124). The monosyllabic adverb “*mang*” subtly shows how much attention and care Dai-yu has for Bao-yu. As the Red Inkstone commentary suggests, the genuine affection Dai-yu has for Bao-yu is reflected in her response, contrary to the irony mentioned above.³ However, it is simply translated as “said Dai-yu” (Hawkes 194) without any description of this attitude. The subtle twist of Dai-yu’s emotion is then lost in the translation along with the omission of “*mang*”. Hawkes seems to have overlooked the subtle emotional drama represented by this monosyllabic adverb.

³ The commentary reads: “Comment on the side of Jiashu manuscript: This text actually shows A Pin’s [Dai-yu] real affection for Yu-qing [Bao-yu]. 甲戌側：這方是阿顰真意對玉卿之文。” (Zhu 147)

3.3. Close relationships between classes: Terms of address

A part of the emotional drama reflecting the close relationship between Nannie Li and Bao-yu in the original is lost, apparently due to Hawkes' decision to preserve the inherent class-consciousness in the English language for a domesticated translation which can be readily accepted by the Western world. Examining the translation in cultural terms, it does not fully render the Chinese value of humanity in the original because it is evidently embedded with the British class-consciousness. Class is a typical English obsession reflected in literature, prevailing to such extent that "the basis of all English literature is class" (Norbury 144). Without much debate, class exists in Chinese culture too, but values such as familial and emotional bondage are also given significant weight. Such values are exemplified by the close relationship between Nannie Li and Bao-yu in the novel, whose bond is more mother-and-son than maid-and-master.

This close relationship between Nannie Li and Bao-yu, similar to kinship, is reflected in the terms of address they use for each other. Conventionally, terms of address in Chinese reveal hierarchical distance between speakers. Within this system, an inferior has to call a superior by the vocative instead of a mere pronoun to show respect (Chao 217-41). However, Nannie Li, the wet nurse of Bao-yu, addresses Bao-yu as "*ni* 你" ("you") instead of the vocative "*shaoye* 少爺" ("Young Master"), while Bao-yu calls Nannie Li "*mama* 媽媽" ("mum") or "*hao mama* 好媽媽" ("dear mum") (Cao and Gao 123). This reflects the close bondage between them and Bao-yu's respect for Nannie Li even though she is only a maid. Even the relationship between Bao-yu and Nannie Li is so close that Bao-yu calls Nannie Li "*hao mama*" ("dear mum") (Cao and Gao 123), Hawkes translates this term of

address as “Nannie darling” (Hawkes 194) without any indication of Bao-yu calling Nannie Li a “mum” directly. Even though “darling” is used to add endearment to “Nannie”, the bondage reflected in the translation is still not as close as that in the original. This can be read as Hawkes’ consideration of the class-consciousness in the English language because the kind of pseudo-kinship existing between servants and masters in the original is relatively rare in the English world.

As an ordinary maid who does not have a close relationship with Dai-yu, Nannie Li is expected to address Dai-yu by the vocative as “*Lin guniang* 林姑娘” (“Miss Lin”) or “*guniang* 姑娘” (“Miss”) as Snowgoose does (Cao and Gao 123). However, in the original, Nannie Li addresses Dai-yu as “*Lin jieer* 林姐兒” (Cao and Gao 124). With “*jieer* 姐兒” literally meaning “darling” or “sweet young girl”, this term “*Lin jieer*” reflects much more closeness and less respect compared to “*Lin guniang*”. As Nannie Li is not a close maid to Dai-yu, this address is viewed as inappropriate, but it is a sincere and genuine utterance as the Red Inkstone commentary notes.⁴ It is probably because Nannie Li is tipsy, or she actually extends her affection for Bao-yu to Dai-yu. In spite of the subtle closeness created by this term, Hawkes translates “*Lin jieer*” invariably as “Miss Lin” (Hawkes 194), which is the same translation for “*Lin guniang*”. The translation is read to be Hawkes’ conscious choice as such an intimate form of address by a maid is likely to be unacceptable, if not transgressive, in British culture, the culture of the target readers.

It is interesting to notice that, although Dai-yu does not have a close

⁴ The commentary reads: “Comment on the side of Jiashu manuscript: Apparently not appropriate, this address is but a genuine utterance by the old woman. 甲戌側：如此之稱似不通，卻是老嫗真心道出。” (Zhu 147)

relationship with Nannie Li, Hawkes translates one of Dai-yu's terms of address for Nannie Li from "*ni zhe mama* 你這媽媽" ("You as a mum") (Cao and Gao 124) to "my dear Nannie" (Hawkes 194). A closer look into the context of the conversation suggests that Hawkes uses this term of endearment to show Dai-yu's ironic attitude and class-consciousness. When Nannie Li asks Dai-yu not to encourage Bao-yu to drink more wine, Dai-yu "smiled dangerously", telling Nannie Li that "you are over-cautious, my dear Nannie" (Hawkes 194). The originals of these two phrases are "*lengxiao dao* 冷笑道" ("says with a smirk") and "*nizhe mama ye tai xiaoxin le* 你這媽媽也太小心了" ("You as a mum are over-cautious") respectively (Cao and Gao 124). Similar to the example of the translation from "*minzhe zui xiao*" to "smiled ironically" as discussed in Section 2.1, Hawkes' translation of "*lengxiao dao*" to "smiled dangerously" foregrounds Dai-yu's sarcastic remarks about Nannie Li. As Nannie Li attempts to stop Bao-yu from drinking while Dai-yu asks Bao-yu to drink more, "my dear Nannie" acts as an ironic term of address which Dai-yu uses to mean the opposite. First of all, Nannie Li is Bao-yu's nanny but not Dai-yu's. Moreover, Nannie Li is not at all dear to Dai-yu, not to mention at this particular instance when they are having a conflict. In fact, when Dai-yu encourages Bao-yu to drink more wine before Nannie Li interrupts, Dai-yu refers to Nannie Li as "*zhe mama* 這媽媽" ("this mum") and "*na laohuo* 那老貨" ("that old woman") (Cao and Gao 124). Hawkes' translations of the two phrases as "that old Nannie of yours [Bao-yu's]" and "the old fool" (Hawkes 194) contrast sharply with "my dear Nannie". Such a contrast not only illustrates Dai-yu's irony but also her class-consciousness. The translation of "*zhe mama*" to "that old Nannie of yours" clearly shows Dai-yu's consciousness of isolating herself from any bondage with Nannie Li

by emphasising that Nannie Li is Bao-yu's nanny but not hers. "The old fool" even intensifies the disrespect for a servant which already exists in the original "*na laohuo*".

Hawkes' translation of terms of address used by Nannie Li and Dai-yu to call each other not only hides Nannie Li's affection for Dai-yu but also endows Dai-yu with a sense of irony and class-consciousness. In order to render a domesticated translation which is more reasonable for the learned British readers who are conditioned by class-consciousness, it is very likely that Hawkes consciously gives up the subtle affection but intensifies the class-consciousness created by the forms of address.

4. Conclusion

Based on the discussions above, this paper concludes that while Hawkes has successfully reconstructed most of the sophisticated emotional drama underlying the original text, some dramatic effect is lost due to two reasons. First, some emotional drama seems too subtle to be noticed and recreated by Hawkes. The second reason is Hawkes' decision to preserve the inherent class-consciousness of the English language at the expense of giving up the emotional drama created by some terms of address in the original.

While Hawkes claims that his principle of translating *Honglouloumeng* is to "translate *everything* [emphasis in the original]" (Hawkes 46), he has missed some of the subtle emotional drama, which he has apparently given less weight to than other subtleties. In the introduction to his translation, Hawkes particularly expresses his interest in the symbols, imagery, puns, and word-plays in the original and his concern that "many such subtleties will...have

vanished in translation” (Hawkes 45). Emotional drama, however, is not mentioned as a subtlety that concerns Hawkes. Therefore, although Hawkes has observed most of the emotional drama and recreated it, the less weight given might explain why he has overlooked the significance of those more implicit and sophisticated expressions related to the creation of emotional drama, as illustrated in the discussions above.

The analysis in this paper argues that Hawkes decides to preserve the inherent class-consciousness of the English language with the loss of emotional drama created by some terms of address, so that the domesticated translation can be readily accepted by the Western world. Hawkes appreciates Cao as a great artist who wrote this novel “with his very lifeblood” and has therefore assumed that whatever he finds in the novel “is there for a purpose and must be dealt with somehow or other” (Hawkes 46). It is therefore not likely that Hawkes has overlooked the obvious difference between “*Lin jieer*” and “*Lin guniang*” and the meaning of such a difference. To deal with this, Hawkes has decided to translate the terms invariably as “Miss Lin”, allowing the class-consciousness of the English language to mask the representation of the close relationships among characters of different classes in Chinese society. As postulated by André Lefevere, translators not only bestow life on the originals but could also decide what kind of life they would bestow on those originals (Lefevere 1-10). Hawkes ostensibly decides to bring this Chinese masterpiece to the Western world with the goal of preserving its universal appeal (Hegel 129) at the expense of losing some subtle emotional drama. Appreciating Cao as a great artist who devoted his life to this classic novel, Hawkes has actually devoted a similar level of commitment to convey to the readers some fraction of the pleasure this Chinese novel has given him – in the

sense that he sees the task as something that gives significance to his life (Hawkes 46). Although some literary and cultural critics criticise Hawkes for his overly domesticating approach as he incorporates British values in the translation, Hawkes draws exhaustively on his knowledge and even creativity as a Sinologist and translator, expending energy at a level probably comparable to that of Cao, to produce such a classic English translation of such a classic Chinese novel.⁵

While the argument that something is always lost in translation is a cliché, with subtle emotional drama as an example of the loss, the conclusion of this paper argues that the discussion of how and why something is lost can offer insights into a translator's agenda and purposes. The analysis illustrates that although Hawkes endeavours to remain faithful to the original due to his appreciation of Cao, he has decided to give up some of the subtle drama so as to produce a translation appealing to the English-speaking world. While the subtlety in the original illustrates the author's artistry, the subtlety in the translation lies in the translator's implicit decisions to whether or not relinquish such original subtlety at different points, revealing his approach to translation and therefore his purposes.

As pointed out by Liu and Zhang in their review of studies of the English translations of *Honglouloumeng*, most of the studies, like the current one, tend to focus upon selective passages of the long novel, and this method might lead to biased results and conclusions (99). Fully aware of the limited scope of this case study because of its focus on only a short excerpt of one chapter of the 120-chapter novel, this study attempts only to serve as a starting point to

⁵ For a detailed discussion on how various critics evaluate Hawkes' translation as overly domesticating, see Wang, Xiong, and Cheng.

address a research gap regarding the reconstruction of emotional drama in the English translation of *Honglouloumeng* and to illustrate its research potentiality. To further demonstrate how the English translations of *Honglouloumeng* can be evaluated in terms of the reconstruction of dramatic quality further systematic research is required.

References

- Bishop, John L. "Some Limitations of Chinese Fiction." *The Far Eastern Quarterly* 15.2 (1956): 239-247. Print.
- Brown, Jack. "Nonverbal Communication Analysis No. 2898." July 27, 2014. Web. 20 Dec 2016.
- Chao, Yuen Ren. "Chinese Terms of Address." *Language* 32.1 (1956): 217-241. Print.
- "drama." *Oxford English Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. <http://www.oed.com>. Web. 5 Nov. 2015.
- Gramley, Stephan, and Kurt-Michael Pätzold. *A Survey of Modern English: Second Edition*. 2nd ed. London: Routledge, 2003. Print.
- Hawkes, David. Trans. *The Story of the Stone*. By Cao Xueqin. Vol. 1: Penguin Books, 1973. Print.
- Hegel, Robert E. Rev. of *The Story of the Stone*; Vol. 4, *The Debt of Tears*; Vol. 5, *The Dreamer Wakes*, Cao Xueqin, E. Gao, John Minford. *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews (CLEAR)* 8.1/2 (1986): 129. Print.
- Lefevere, André. "Comparative Literature and Translation." *Comparative Literature* 47.1 (1995): 1. Print.
- Norbury, Paul. *Britain*. Culture Smart! Ed. Australia, S. B. S. South Yarra, Vic: Explore, 2003. Print.
- Pollard, David. "The Use of Empty Words in Chinese and English." *Interpreting Culture through Translation: A Festschrift for D.C. Lau*. Eds. Ames, Roger T., et al. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1991. 201-226. Print.
- Shi, Changyu. "Introduction." *A Dream of Red Mansions*. By Cao Xueqin and

Gao E. Trans. Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang. Vol. 1. Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1999. Print.

Tredinnick, Mark. *Writing Well: The Essential Guide*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008. Print.

王麗耘、熊誼華、程麗芳。〈「歸化」與霍克思《紅樓夢》譯本的評價問題〉。《外語學刊》182（2015年第1期）：95-100。

文軍、任艷。〈國內《紅樓夢》英譯研究回眸(1979-2010)〉。《中國外語》第9卷第1期，2012年1月：84-93。

朱一玄。《紅樓夢脂評校錄》。濟南：齊魯書社，1986年。

曹雪芹、高鶚。《紅樓夢》。北京：人民文學出版社，1996。二版。

陳丹、田志強。〈國內 2005-2015 年《紅樓夢》英譯研究〉。《科教文彙》第330期，2015年10月：182-183。

蔡新樂。〈霍克斯英譯本《紅樓夢》劉姥姥的戲劇性形像塑造的失誤〉。《外語研究》50（2015年第2期）：65-70。

劉澤權、張冰。〈新世紀《紅樓夢》英譯研究述評〉。《外語學刊》185（2015年第4期）：96-100。

Web Publication

Brown, Jack. "Nonverbal Communication Analysis No. 2898." July 27, 2014. Web. 20 Dec 2016.