

科技部補助專題研究計畫成果報告 期末報告

全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之 探討(第2年)

計畫類別：個別型計畫
計畫編號：MOST 102-2410-H-004-082-MY2
執行期間：103年08月01日至104年08月31日
執行單位：國立政治大學宗教研究所

計畫主持人：蔡彥仁

計畫參與人員：碩士班研究生-兼任助理人員：姚伊蕙
博士班研究生-兼任助理人員：葉先秦

報告附件：移地研究心得報告
出席國際會議研究心得報告及發表論文

處理方式：

1. 公開資訊：本計畫涉及專利或其他智慧財產權，2年後可公開查詢
2. 「本研究」是否已有嚴重損及公共利益之發現：否
3. 「本報告」是否建議提供政府單位施政參考：否

中 華 民 國 104 年 10 月 13 日

中文摘要：中國大陸自改革開放以來，在政治、經濟、社會、文化、民生等各層面，皆發生史無前例的巨變，而基督教之興起，特別是具有「靈恩運動」特色者，更是一個引起國內、外學者注意的重要領域。當代中國基督教的現況，與全球化潮流下其他地區或國家的基督教發展有密切關係，本二年期的研究計畫，即從比較的視野，深入探討中國當代基督徒如何在此潮流下理解其身份，並建構其信仰社群。

本二年期研究計畫主要採用文獻分析方法，另外亦輔以參與觀察與深度訪談。後者的進行選擇中國大陸華東地區，以上海、南京、杭州、福州為範圍內之「地級市」真耶穌教會的大學生團契、民工團契、商人團契、老人團契等為對象，從（一）信仰經驗；（二）《聖經》詮釋；（三）儀式崇拜；（四）組織運作四個層面著手考察。希望藉此研究一方面建立「當代中國大陸基督教研究資料庫」，另一方面則將中國當代基督教置於「世界基督教」的圖像脈絡，透過比較研究勾勒其特色，以增廣學者認識此議題之視野。

中文關鍵詞：全球化、世界基督教、靈恩運動、中國基督教、真耶穌教會、身份認同

英文摘要：Since the implementation of its open-door policy, China has undergone tremendous transformations with respect to its politics, economy, society, culture, and people's livelihood. The rapid growth of Christianity, much of which tinged with Pentecostal-charismatic features, is also an impressive one among them. From the global perspective, Christianity in China today has a close relationship with the developments of Christianity in other parts of the world. This two-year research project hence explored how Christians in contemporary China understand their religious identity and accordingly establish their church community in the context of globalization. The present project followed the method of textual analysis and, as well, adopted participant observation and personal interviews to accomplish its task. For the latter purposes, the investigator focused on the local churches of the True Jesus Church in the lower Yangtze delta that includes Shanghai, Nanjing, Hangzhou and Fuzhou and some provincial cities. There he interacted with four

types of fellowship composed respectively of college students, migrant workers, businessmen, and old people and examined their religious experience, scriptural interpretation, worship, and community operation. This research project established a databank on contemporary Chinese Christianity and depicted its prominent characteristics in the context of World Christianity.

英文關鍵詞： globalization, World Christianity, Pentecostal-charismatic movement, Chinese Christianity, True Jesus Church, religious identity

行政院國家科學委員會補助專題
研究計畫

☐期中進度報
告
☒期末報告

全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒 —
身份意識與社群建構之探討

計畫類別：☒個別型計畫 ☐整合型計畫

計畫編號：NSC 102-2410-H-004-082-MY2

執行期間：102 年 8 月 1 日至 104 年 8 月 31 日

執行機構及系所：國立政治大學宗教研究所

計畫主持人：蔡彥仁

共同主持人：

計畫參與人員：

本計畫除繳交成果報告外，另含下列出國報告，共 1 份：

☒移地研究心得報告

☒出席國際學術會議心得報告

☐國際合作研究計畫國外研究報告

處理方式：除列管計畫及下列情形者外，得立即公開查詢

☐涉及專利或其他智慧財產權，☐一年☐二年後可公開查詢

中 華 民 國 104 年 10 月 12 日

中文摘要

中國大陸自改革開放以來，在政治、經濟、社會、文化、民生等各層面，皆發生史無前例的巨變，而基督教之興起，特別是具有「靈恩運動」特色者，更是一個引起國內、外學者注意的重要領域。當代中國基督教的現況，與全球化潮流下其他地區或國家的基督教發展有密切關係，本二年期的研究計畫，即從比較的視野，深入探討中國當代基督徒如何在此潮流下理解其身份，並建構其信仰社群。

本二年期研究計畫主要採用文獻分析方法，另外亦輔以參與觀察與深度訪談。後者的進行選擇中國大陸華東地區，以上海、南京、杭州、福州為範圍內之「地級市」真耶穌教會的大學生團契、民工團契、商人團契、老人團契等為對象，從（一）信仰經驗；（二）《聖經》詮釋；（三）儀式崇拜；（四）組織運作四個層面著手考察。希望藉此研究一方面建立「當代中國大陸基督教研究資料庫」，另一方面則將中國當代基督教置於「世界基督教」的圖像脈絡，透過比較研究勾勒其特色，以增廣學者認識此議題之視野。

關鍵字：全球化、世界基督教、靈恩運動、中國基督教、真耶穌教會、身份認同

Abstract

Since the implementation of its open-door policy, China has undergone tremendous transformations with respect to its politics, economy, society, culture, and people's livelihood. The rapid growth of Christianity, much of which tinged with Pentecostal- charismatic features, is also an impressive one among them. From the global perspective, Christianity in China today has a close relationship with the developments of Christianity in other parts of the world. This two-year research project hence explored how Christians in contemporary China understand their religious identity and accordingly establish their church community in the context of globalization.

The present project followed the method of textual analysis and, as well, adopted participant observation and personal interviews to accomplish its task. For the latter purposes, the investigator focused on the local churches of the True Jesus Church in the lower Yangtz delta that includes Shanghai, Nanjing, Hangzhou and Fuzhou and some provincial cities. There he interacted with four types of fellowship composed respectively of college students, migrant workers, businessmen, and old people and examined their religious experience, scriptural interpretation, worship, and community operation. This research project established a databank on contemporary Chinese Christianity and depicted its prominent characteristics in the context of World Christianity.

Keywords: globalization, World Christianity, Pentecostal-charismatic movement, Chinese Christianity, True Jesus Church, religious identity

目錄

一、前言	1
二、研究目的	2
三、文獻探討	2
四、研究方法	7
五、結果與討論	8
六、成果報告自評表	10
七、參考文獻	11
附件一、移地研究心得報告	16
附件二、出席國際會議心得報告	18
附件三、Political Ideology and Theological Rhetoric: The Case of the True Jesus Church in Taiwan in the Cold War (1945-1990)	21
附件四、Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan	36

前言

在「中國崛起」的潮流中，大陸人民對於宗教的追求以及各類宗教活動的復甦勃興，是關心中國當代發展者經常目睹和提及的重大事件，而綜觀宗教學界對於此方面的升溫研究，或者海內、外媒體對此議題的大量報導，確實反映宗教與中國的現在與未來有密不可分的關係，有識者甚至認為大陸今後的持續變革，宗教將是其重要核心(Aikman, 2003; 蕭富元，2011；Johnson, 2011)。基督教在中國官方承認的五大宗教中(其他四個宗教為天主教、伊斯蘭、佛教、道教)發展最為快速，由於其百多年來與西方國家有特殊的因緣糾葛，因而最吸引中國和國際宗教學界的注意。不過，有別於不少學者專注意中國基督徒人數的增長，或者預測中國何時成為世界第一大基督教國家，本人認為更重要者應理解：一、當代中國基督教的發展與全球化潮流有何關係？又如何與世界其他地區亦如火如荼、快速散佈的「靈恩基督教」(Pentecostal-charismatic Christianity)進行比較？二、中國基督教是什麼類型的基督教？在「世界基督教」(World Christianity)的圖像中，到底呈現出何種色澤與特徵？三、成為基督徒的中國大陸人民，他們如何看待自己的身份？如何瞭解和建構「教會」？又如何在急遽變動的大環境中調適其宗教生活？本人在兩年的研究，已部分回答上述問題，特別是有關中國教會的建構問題，已得出初步的探討結果。

研究目的

本二年期研究計畫，係延續前一年同名稱、一年期的計畫，所欲達成的目的如下：

- 第一、 藉由探討當代中國大陸幾個具有代表性的基督徒社群，特別集中於真耶穌教會，瞭解其在全球化潮流脈絡下，如何體認其基督徒身份，形塑其基督徒社群，由此展現具有社會主義特色的中國基督教。
- 第二、 將中國基督教置入「世界基督教」的圖像脈絡，與世界其他地區類似發展的「靈恩運動」進行比較，由此擴大研究中國基督教的視野。
- 第三、 增強台灣的基督教或整體宗教研究能量，倡議跨科際整合研究，提供本計畫為參考案例。

文獻探討

有關國內、外與「全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒」之相關研究文獻難以盡列，原因在於此題目涉及全球化、改革開放之後的中國政、經發展、全球基督教與靈恩運動、中國基督教史與當代中國基督教等廣大議題，今僅就「當代中國基督教」或「當代中國基督徒」部分，扼要說明如下。

過去研究中國基督教的著作，以專注於明末天主教來華宣教史，以及十九世紀末至一九四九年止的基督新教在華宣教史為大宗，有關中國共產黨取得政權之後的宗教發展，則因強力的政治掌控而萎縮，研究方面也相對顯得乏善可陳。但是非常值得注意的是，有不少關心中國基督教發展、以香港為基地的研究中心——雖然部分具有明顯的主觀基督教信仰關懷——長久以來蒐集這個宗教在大陸的進行狀況，為我們提供了第一手的研究資料，例如《守望中華》、《橋》、《中國與教會》、《中國與福音》等期刊即是。中國官方的「三自愛國運動委員會」所出版的《天風》，亦是不可或缺的原始資料。同屬非學術類型，具有教會背景但卻有參考價值的西文書，例如 *China's Christian Millions* (Lambert, 1999) 以及 *The Church in China: Persecuted, Pentecostal, and Powerful* (Luke, 2004) 兩冊皆與本研究計畫相關。

改革開放之後，香港有不少專門研究中國大陸宗教或基督教的機構，在一九九〇年初紛紛成立，例如香港中文大學崇基學院的「宗教與中國社會研究中心」、建道神學院的「基督教與中國文化研究中心」、道風山基督教叢林的「漢語基督教文化研究所」等，皆以研究當代中國基督教為目標，定期出版期刊和叢書，累積相當重要的資訊，皆是本研究計畫需要詳細審閱熟悉者。幾乎與此同時，中國大陸幾個重點學術機構，例如中國社會科學院世界宗教研究所與人民大學宗教學系，分別出版《基督教文化評論》和《基督教文化學刊》，大量刊載當代基督教的發展記錄以及相關的研究論文。這些經常性、累積性的出版資料雖然良莠雜陳，價值不一，但其對本研究計畫的重要性則無庸置疑。

有關當代中國基督教的整體面貌描述，以西文出版的著作似乎更勝一籌。Hunter & Chan 在一九九三年率先出版廣泛介紹當代中國基督教的專書 *Protestantism in Contemporary China*。此書在西方學界評價頗高，廣為以後的學者所引用。之後同類性質的書相繼出籠，例如 Chao & Chong, *A History of Christianity in Socialist China* (1997) 即是，趙天恩、莊婉恩以中文寫作的《當代中國基督教發展史》亦是，但這兩本書的作者具有明顯的教會背景和信仰考量。Lian Xi 在 2011 年出版 *Redeemed by Fire*，從歷史的角度介紹從太平天國至今基督新教在中國約一百五十年來的發展，強調基督教在中國之所以能廣泛傳布，在於其能與本土民眾心理和文化契合，特別與民間宗教中重視神蹟和超自然層面接軌，由此導出廣受歡迎的「民間基督教」。此一論點能否成立仍有待深究，但作者的史料蒐集齊全，文筆典雅，展現頗高的學術功力則是值得肯定。這些書為本研究主題提供背

景知識，亦可供相互參照之用。

Daniel H. Bays 的近作“Chinese Protestant Christianity Today”(2003)屬於期刊論文，篇幅不長，但因其長久以來致力於現代與當代的中國基督教教派研究，提供的資訊豐富，論述亦中肯。本研究計畫特別涉及的「靈恩基督教」方面，這幾年逐漸有學者從田野調查著手，並從同情與比較的角度加以詮釋，Anderson & Tang 所編輯的 *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity* (2005) 一書即是，其中即含有兩篇與中國相關者：“Pentecostals by Default? Contemporary Christianity in China” (Oblau)以及 “‘Yellers’ and Healers: Pentecostalism and the Study of Grassroots Christianity in China” (Tang)。高晨揚(Chen-yang Kao)根據其在英國藍卡斯特大學(Lancaster University)所撰寫的中國靈恩基督教方面之博士論文，改寫題為 “The Cultural Revolution and the Emergence of Pentecostal-style Protestantism in China”之論文(Kao, 2009)，主要在追溯此一類型的基督教在文化大革命時期的發展，並考察其與中國本土宗教文化的互動融合情形，非常具有參考價值。

當代中國基督教的发展聯繫於大陸政府的宗教政策以及落實執行的程度。西方學者研究此領域者不少，且多是政治學背景者居多。D. E. MacInnis 在 1972 年出版的 *Religious Policy and Practice in Communist China* 一書(1989 的修訂本改為 *Religion in China Today: Policy and Practice*)，蒐集中共政府歷年的宗教政策與法規，書中雖然許多條文已過時，但因其仍是當今中國宗教實踐的依據，此書三十多年來廣為學界引用，頗具參考價值。Kindopp & Carol 所編的 *God and Caesar in China: Political Implications of Church-State Tensions* (2004)一書蒐集多篇論文，皆討論當代中國大陸的政、教關係。另外，Lauren B. Homer 的 “Registration of Chinese Protestant House Churches under China’s 2005 Regulation on Religious Affairs: Resolving the Implementation Impasse”一文，從法律的觀點分析當今「家庭教會」與官方「三自教會」衝突的原因，認為只有透過法條的鬆綁，採取不溯既往和「除罪化」政策，以集體登記並賦予教會團體法人身份的作法，才有可能解決當前絕大多數基督徒和基督教會的身份問題。(Homer, 2010)這些論文大都援用西方傳統的政、教對抗或分離的模式為前提，以此考察中國大陸的現況。本人對此持保留態度，認為需要進一步考察中國當前的基督教發展情形，並考慮中國社會與文化的特殊性，例如文化融合、人際關係、地方公安或宗教局的執行力等等，如此方能理解中國政、教張力的實質內涵。David Aikman 的 *Jesus in Beijing: How Christianity Is Transforming China and Changing the Global Balance of Power* (2003)則不僅探討中國國內的政、教關係，更因基督教具有普世性的特色，將其延伸至世界政治舞台上加以觀察，其與本研究計畫的相關性不言而喻。香港中文大學邢福增教授雖非政治專長，但其《當代中國政教關係》(1999)一書卻能將當代的教會與黨國兩造，自 1949 年以來的衝突、互補、相適應等過程分明敘述，點出箇中原委與癥結，對於我們剖析此一議題頗有助益。

近年來有關中國宗教，特別是基督教的研究，頗為吸引注意的是已有不少

中國或華裔學者，採取社會學方法或人類學式的田野調查，針對某個地區或特定族群進行焦點研究。這一方面的成就，對於本研究計畫而言，最有啟發性，也提供相當有價值的本土案例資料。高師寧的《當代北京的基督教與基督徒——宗教社會學個案研究》(2005)採半開放式問卷調查與訪談，進行北京市基督徒「信仰與生活」方面的研究，並據此做社會學意識的深度反思。吳梓明及其研究團隊的《聖山腳下的十字架——宗教與社會互動個案研究》(2005)則是在山東泰安對幾個天主教與新教教會進行考察，其中包含陳述其發展歷史與城鄉教會之對照，亦運用現代的社會學理論，特別採用 Rodney Stark 和 Roger Finke 所提的「理性選擇」、「宗教資本」、「社會資本」等概念加以詮釋，雖然有生硬套用之嫌，但在華人宗教學者中亦有創新之功。陳村富的《轉型期的中國基督教——浙江基督教個案研究》(2005)亦是屬於地區型的個案研究，著重浙江基督教會近幾年來因社會的急遽發展而產生的變遷概況。對比之下，梁家麟在一九九〇年中葉即對中國的鄉村教會進行調查，最後同時出版中、英文版的《改革開放後的中國農村教會》(1999; *The Rural Churches of Mainland China since 1978*. 1999)。作者的學術訓練為歷史學，故本書描繪的基督教側重歷史延續，凸顯時代變遷的前後差異。另外，Cao Nanlai 對於基督徒商人或企業家有高度的興趣，其所發表的論文(2007, 2008)與專書(2011)皆針對此一新興階級或族群加以考察，尤其對當今佔有絕高基督徒人口比重的溫州市進行研究，已引起學界的廣泛注意。他在理論上批判過去西方學者將宗教與政治對立的研究模式，主張採用「基督教人類學」進路，深入基督徒社群實際觀察這群後毛澤東時代的信徒，如何將這個外來宗教與中國的政治、社會、經濟、民俗巧妙的結合起來，由此塑造出獨特的基督徒生存空間和意義網絡。作者的立論觀點及其卓越的民族誌取材與呈現，對本計畫而言是一佳範。吳飛的《麥芒上的聖言》(2001)係採人類學蹲點的方式，長期參與觀察河北武垣縣段莊的天主教信徒，分析其如何透過各種「治理技術」，妥善處理教會組織、儀式進行、人際網絡、政教關係等，以及撫平因各種災難動亂所造成的集體記憶傷痕，就理論運用、資料排比、文筆表達等各方面，皆達高學術水平。

美國華裔學者楊鳳崗(Fenggang Yang)運用市場經濟供需理論，將當前的中國宗教發展置於全球化的脈絡下，據此討論大陸基督徒皈依的原因，其“Lost in the Market, Saved at McDonald's: Conversion to Christianity in Urban China” (Yang, 2005)以及“The Red, Black, and Gray Markets of Religions in China” (Yang, 2006)二文廣受學界肯定與徵引，所提出的紅、黑、灰「三色理論」，一方面劃分中國基督教類型，另一方面則強調當今「灰色」地帶的急速擴張，將影響未來的宗教市場生態，具有很高的參考價值。楊氏 2011 年出版的專書 *Religion in China: Survival and Revival under Communist Rule* 則更進一步綜合與細緻化其先前的理論，廣受學界讚譽。(Johnson, 2011)還有，姚新中(Xinzhong Yao)於 2004-2006 年間在大陸進行大規模的宗教經驗抽樣調查，結果有 *Religious Experience in Contemporary China* (2008)一書的發行，雖然其對象不限於基督徒，且其目的主要在論證中國宗教的融合特性，但是其所設計的問卷以及所得結果，對於本研究計畫而言仍有

密切的關連性。

以上諸多有關中國宗教，尤其是研究當代中國基督教的文獻，皆是本人熟悉和參考的對象，也是本研究計畫探索的基礎資料。

研究方法

本研究一方面致力於收集與主題相關的資料，進行耙梳、整理、歸類、詮釋的工作，另一方面也深入中國大陸的基督教團體，特別是真耶穌教會，透過參與觀察與口訪的方式進行研究，實際上結合人文學與社會科學的研究方法，藉此達到計畫所擬設的目的。

結果與討論

本人在過去兩年執行本研究計畫期間(2013 年 8 月 1 日~2015 年 8 月 31 日)，大致完成三個領域的工作：一、持續在大陸華東地區，對以真耶穌教會為主的基督教進行田野調查；二、在學校開「全球化與基督教靈恩運動」與「當代中國社會與基督宗教」兩門課程，前者深入探討中國大陸的基督宗教現況，後者則是熟悉基督教靈恩運動在當今世界不同地區之發展情形；三、完成論文兩篇，發表於兩個國際學術會議。再略敘此三個領域如下：

一、田野調查

第一階段田野調查：2013 年 8 月 21 日~9 月 1 日

日期	工作摘要	地點
8/21	搭機赴福州	台北—福州
8/22	教會田調	福州
8/23	教會田調	福州
8/24	教會田調	福州
8/25	教會田調	福州
8/26	教會田調	福州
8/27	教會田調	福州
8/28	教會田調	福州
8/29	教會田調	福州
8/30	教會田調	福州
8/31	教會田調	福州
9/1	搭機返台	福州—台北

此一田野調查集中在福州地區，教會內大學「學生團契」的組織與運作。

第二階段田野調查：2014 年 1 月 10 日~1 月 19 日

日期	工作摘要	地點
1/10	搭機赴上海	台北—上海
1/11	教會田調	上海
1/12	教會田調	上海
1/13	教會田調	上海
1/14	教會田調	上海

1/15	教會田調	上海
1/16	教會田調	上海
1/17	教會田調	上海
1/18	教會田調	上海
1/19	搭機返台	上海—台北

此一田野調查針對上海市區內與近郊的教會，因知識與職業背景不同所組成的青年團契，進行參與觀察。

三、開設課程

政大於 2012 年成立校級「華人宗教研究中心」，本人於該中心負責基督教研究方面事宜，組成「當代華人基督宗教研究」小組，除邀請國內、外知名學者來「中心」演講外，亦召開學術會議。本人並在 2014 年 2-6 月開「全球化與基督教靈恩運動」課程。本課程共有四位博士生、三位碩士生參與，由本人帶領研討許多世界不同地區對「五旬節/靈恩運動」之研究著作。另外，又於 2015 年 2-6 月開「當代中國社會與基督宗教」課程，有四位博士生、兩位碩士生參與。此門課以閱讀第一手資料為主，師生獲益匪淺，亦符合本人在計畫書中所述，意欲積極培訓研究生之目標。

三、國際會議

本人於執行計畫期間，受邀參加「東亞基督教與冷戰(1945-1990)」(The Cold War and Christianity in East Asia, 1945-1990)國際學術研討會。會議由「香港聖公會明華神學院」、「信義宗神學院」、「道風山基督教叢林」三個學術單位主辦，於 2014 年 4 月 10-13 日在香港道風山舉行。與會學者來自除香港本地者外，又有中、台、美、日、韓、德、瑞典等國。本人在會議中發表文章，題為“Political Ideology and Theological Rhetoric: The Case of the True Jesus Church in Taiwan in the Cold War (1945-1990)”，獲得不少正面回應。會議論文將以專書形式在歐洲出版。全文參考附件三。

另外，本人又在 The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars 發表論文一篇，題為：“Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan.” 此國際會議係由澳洲南部三所大學，以及荷蘭的 International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) 所主辦，但同時聯合 Asian Studies Association of Australia, Chinese Association of Australia, South Asian Studies Association of Australia 三個澳洲全國性學術團體，共同召開，場次達數百，論文上千，規模盛大。本人一方面在 7 月 8 日的 Religion Past and Present 場次中，發表個人的論文一篇。論文全文參考附件四。另一方面，本人也藉

此機會，率領政大宗教研究所三位博士生，組成一個名為 *From Missionary to Indigenization and Globalization: Transformation of Church-State Relationship in Modern Chinese Society* 的場次，自願擔任主席，協助學生們在國際場合發表論文。師生合作，一舉兩得，個人增進經驗，學生亦拓展視野，有正面的學術學習和成長的意義。

國科會補助專題研究計畫成果報告自評表

請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況、研究成果之學術或應用價值(簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性)、是否適合在學術期刊發表或申請專利、主要發現或其他有關價值等，作一綜合評估。

1. 請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況作一綜合評估

☒達成目標

☐未達成目標(請說明，以100字為限)

☐實驗失敗

☐因故實驗中斷

☐其他原因

說明：

2. 研究成果在學術期刊發表或申請專利等情形：

論文：☐已發表 ☒未發表之文稿 ☐撰寫中 ☐無

專利：☐已獲得 ☐申請中 ☐無

技轉：☐已技轉 ☐洽談中 ☐無

其他：(以100字為限)

3. 請依學術成就、技術創新、社會影響等方面，評估研究成果之學術或應用價值(簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性)(以500字為限)

中國當代基督教之研究，在國際宗教學界已經成為顯學，但礙於台灣的客觀情況，特別是此領域學術人口的侷限，截至目前為止，尚未能開展出具有規模的團隊與成績以為因應。有鑑於中國大陸的崛起，以及宗教在大陸所具有的影響力，本人認為帶動國內學界，特別是有潛力的年輕學者，積極加入國際學界，並提出台灣的研究特色，應該是刻不容緩的工作。本人此兩年期的研究計畫，僅是一開端，主要在提出「什麼是具有中國特色的當代基督教？」，並試圖以「聲音」、「政教關係」、「食物」幾項具有身體與實踐意義的主題，進行反思探索。本人深知後續尚有許多仍待完成的工程，期待在這兩年之後，仍能持續相同方向，更進一步深入其他議題的研究。

參考文獻

- Aikman, David. *Jesus in Beijing: How Christianity Is Transforming China and Changing the Global Balance of Power*. Washington, DC: Regnery, 2003.
- Bays, Daniel H. "Chinese Protestant Christianity Today." *China Quarterly* 174.2 (2003): 488-504.
- _____. "The Growth of Independent Christianity in China, 1900-1937." In Bays, H. Daniel, ed. *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996. 307-316.
- Bian, Yanjie. "Chinese Social Stratification and Social Mobility." *Annual Review of Sociology* 28 (2002) 91-116.
- Cao, Nanlai. "Christian Entrepreneurs and the Post-Mao State: An Ethnographic Account of Church-State Relations in China's Economic Transition." *Sociology of Religion* 68 (2007): 45-66.
- _____. "Boss Christians: The Business of Religion in the 'Wenzhou Model' of Christian Revival." *The China Journal* 59 (2008): 63-87.
- _____. *Constructing China's Jerusalem: Christians, Power, and Place in Contemporary Wenzhou*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2011.
- Chao, Hsing-kuang. "Conversion to Protestantism among Urban Immigrants in Taiwan." *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 24.2 (2006) 171-188.
- Chao, Jonathan and Rosanna Chong. *A History of Christianity in Socialist China, 1947-1997*. Taipei: China Ministries International Publishing, 1997.
- Duara, Prasenjit. "Superscribing Symbols: The Myth of Guandi, Chinese God of War." *Journal of Asian Studies* 47.4 (1998): 778-795.
- Dunch, Ryan F. "Protestant Christianity in China Today: Fragile, Fragmented, Flourishing." In Uhalley, Jr. Stephen and Wu, Xiaoxin, eds. *China and Christianity: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future*. Armonk, NY: ME Sharp, 2001. 195-216.
- Goossaert, Vincent and David A. Palmer. *The Religious Question in Modern China*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Homer, Lauren B. "Registration of Chinese Protestant House Churches under China's 2005 Regulation on Religious Affairs: Resolving the Implementation Impasse." *Journal of Church and State* 52,1 (2010) 50-73.
- Hunter, Alan and Kin-kwong Chan. *Protestantism in Contemporary China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Johnson, Ian. "China Gets Religion!", in *The New York Review of Books*: <http://www.nybooks.com/articles/archives/2011/dec/22/china-gets-religion>
- Kao, Chen-yang, "The Cultural Revolution and the Emergence of Pentecostal-style Protestantism in China." *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 24.2 (2009): 171-188.
- Kindopp, Jason. "Policy Dilemmas in China's Church-State Relations: An Introduction." In Kindopp, Jason and Lee, Carol eds. *God and Caesar in China: Political Implications of Church-State Tensions*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press, 2004. 1-24.
- Kindopp, Jason and Lee, Carol eds. *God and Caesar in China: Political Implications of Church-State Tensions*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press, 2004.
- Lambert, Tony. *China's Christian Millions*. London, England, and Grand Rapids, MI: Monarch Books, 1999.

- Leung, K. *The Rural Churches of Mainland China since 1978*. Hong Kong: Alliance Bible Seminary Press, 1999.
- Lian, Xi. *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011.
- Liao Yiwu. *God Is Red: The Secret Story of How Christianity Survived and Flourished in Communist China*. New York: HarperOne, 2011.
- Liu, Alan. "The 'Wenzhou Model' of Development and China's Modernization." *Asian Survey* 32 (1992): 696-711.
- MacInnis, Donald E. *Religious Policy and Practice in Communist China*. New York: Macmillan, 1972.
- _____. *Religion in China Today: Policy and Practice*. Maryknoll: NY: Orbis Books, 1989.
- Madsen, Richard. *China's Catholics: Tragedy and Hope in an Emerging Civil Society*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.
- _____. *Democracy's Dharma: Religious Renaissance and Political Development in Taiwan*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Oblau, Gotthard. "Pentecostals by Default? Contemporary Christianity in China." In Anderson, Allan and Tang, Edmond, eds. *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia*. Oxford, UK and Costa Mesa, USA: Regnum, 2005. 411-436.
- Pitman B. Potter, "Belief in Control: Regulation of Religion in China," in *Religion in China Today*, (The China Quarterly Special Issues, New Series, No.3), ed. by Daniel L. Overmyer. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.11-31,
- Starr, Chloë, ed. *Reading Christian Scriptures in China*. New York: T&T Clark, 2008.
- Tang, Edmond. "'Yellers' and Healers: Pentecostalism and the Study of Grassroots Christianity in China." In Anderson, Allan and Tang, Edmond, eds. *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia*. Oxford, UK and Costa Mesa, USA: Regnum, 2005. 467-486.
- Vala, Carsten T. and Kevin J. O'Brien. "Attraction Without Networks: Recruiting Strangers to Unregistered Protestantism in China." *Mobilization*, 12 (2007): 79-94.
- Wesley, Luke. *The Church in China: Persecuted, Pentecostal, and Powerful*. AJPS Books, 2004.
- Yang, Fenggang. "Between Secularist Ideology and Desecularizing Reality: the Birth and Growth of Religious Research in Communist China." *Sociology of Religion, A Quarterly Review* 65.2 (2004) 101-119.
- _____. "Lost in the Market, Saved at McDonald's: Conversion to Christianity in Urban China." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 44 (2005): 423-441.
- _____. "The Red, Black, and Gray Markets of Religions in China." *The Sociological Quarterly* 47 (2006):93-122.
- _____. *Religion in China: Survival and Revival under Communist Rule*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Yao, Xinzong. "Religious Belief and Practice in Urban China 1995-2005." *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 22 (2007): 169-185.
- Yao, Xinzong and Badham, Paul. eds. *Religious Experience in Contemporary China*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2008.
- 梁家麟。《改革開放後的中國農村教會》。香港：建道神學院，1999。
- 邢福增。《當代中國政教關係》。香港：建道神學院，1999。
- 劉志軍。《鄉村都市化與宗教信仰變遷》。社會科學文獻出版社，2007。

- 于建嶸。〈基督教的發展與中國社會穩定 — 與兩位「基督教家庭教會」培訓師的對話〉。《領導者》，2008 年 4 月刊。
- ___。〈中國基督教家庭教會向何處去？ — 與家庭教會人士的對話〉。《領導者》，2008 年 11 月刊。
- 高師寧。〈當代中國民間信仰對基督教的影響〉。《浙江學刊》，2005 年第 2 期，頁 50-55。
- ___。《當代北京的基督教與基督徒 — 宗教社會學個案研究》。香港：漢語基督教文化研究所，2005。
- ___。〈湖南省 CS 市基督教北堂的調查報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 習五一、鄭永華。〈湖南省 ZJJ 市 CL 縣福音堂調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 李林、楊華民。〈湖南省 CD 市基督教真光堂歷史與現狀調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 段琦。〈在全球化境遇下看中國基督教的發展〉，2008 年 7 月，未刊稿。
- 段琦、唐曉峰。〈2008 年中國基督教現況及研究 — 兼論中國教會組織的多元存在格局及張力〉，載於金澤、邱永輝 主編，《宗教藍皮書 — 中國宗教報告》。北京：社會科學文獻出版社，2009。（頁 111-143）
- 段琦、陳進國。〈江西省 YG 縣宗教文化生態調查 — 以基督教為中心〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 曾傳輝。〈雲南省 KM 市三一國際禮拜堂調研〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 唐曉峰。〈雲南省 XW 市基督教狀況調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 鄭筱筠。〈雲南省 LC 市 CY 佤族自治縣基督教調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- ___。〈雲南省 LJ 州 FG 縣基督教調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 邱永輝 執筆。〈“中國基督教研究的再研究”報告〉，載於金澤、邱永輝 主編，《宗教藍皮書 — 中國宗教報告》。北京：社會科學文獻出版社，2009。（頁 181-229）
- 陳進國 執筆。〈本土情懷與全球視野 — 贛、湘、雲三省基督教現況調查報告〉，載於金澤、邱永輝 主編，《宗教藍皮書 — 中國宗教報告》。北京：社會科學文獻出版社，2009。（頁 230-264）
- 李漢林。〈改革開放 30 年與中國單位制度的變遷 — 分析與思考〉，載於《學術動態》（研究報告版），2008 年第 18 期，總期第 1209 期。
- 卓新平。《“全球化”的宗教與當代中國》。北京：社會科學文獻出版社，2008。
- 左鵬。〈大學生中的基督教團契 — 對北京地區部分高校的調查〉，載於《當代宗教研究》，2009 年第 1 期，頁 1-7。
- 林靜。〈當代大學生宗教信仰之調查研究 — 以福建高校為中心〉，載於《當代宗教研究》，2009 年第 1 期，頁 8-16。
- 劉國鵬、李志鴻。〈一個家庭聚會處的發展史 — 江西省 XY 市 YS 區基督教調

- 查報告》，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 孫豔燕、葉濤。〈江西省縣基督教發展狀況調研報告〉，2008 年 12 月，未刊稿。
- 蕭志恬。《當代宗教問題的思考》。上海：上海市社會科學學會，1994。
- 陳村富。《轉型期的中國基督教 — 浙江基督教個案研究》。北京：東方出版社，2005。
- 李峰。《鄉村基督教的組織特徵及其社會結構性位置 — 華南 Y 縣 X 鎮基督教教會組織研究》。上海：復旦大學出版社，2005。
- 吳飛。《麥芒上的聖言 — 一個鄉村天主教群體中的信仰生活》。香港：漢語基督教文化研究所，2001。
- 吳梓明 等著。《聖山腳下的十字架 — 宗教與社會互動個案研究》。香港：漢語基督教文化研究所，2005。
- 趙天恩。《中國教會史論文集》。台北：宇宙光，2006。
- 趙天恩、莊婉芳。《當代中國基督教發展史》。台北：鍾福，1997。
- 中國基督教三自教會工作報告：〈按三自原則辦好教會，為構建和諧社會發揮積極作用〉，2008, <http://www.cctspm.org/ccc/zishen/2008/527/08112920.html>
- 福音證主協會編。《咫尺天涯：中國教會的近貌》。香港：福音證主協會，1993。
- 曹中建 編。《新中國宗教研究年鑑》(1999-2000)。北京：宗教文化出版社，2001。
- 曹中建 編。《新中國宗教研究年鑑》(2001-2002)。北京：宗教文化出版社，2003。
- 《宗教研究四十年》(上、下)。中國社會科學院世界宗教研究所編。北京：宗教文化出版社，2004。
- 曹中建、張新鷹、金澤、陳明、陳進國。〈關於福建省民間信仰問題的調研報告〉，2003 年 4 月，內部報告。
- 蕭富元，〈「宗教心靈」系列報導〉，《天下雜誌》，481 期 (2011/9/21)，頁 192-206。
- 《天風》
- 《橋》
- 《中國與教會》
- 《中國與福音》
- 《莫忘神州》
- 《文匯報》
- 《基督教文化評論》
- 《基督教文化學刊》
- 《當代宗教研究》
- 早雨教會。 <http://earlyrain.bokee.com/6803316.html>
- 基督日報。 <http://gospelherald.com>
- Center on Religion and Chinese Society / 中國宗教與社會研究中心。
<http://www.purdue.edu/crcs>

國科會補助專題研究計畫移地研究心得報告

日期：105 年 10 月 12 日

計畫編號	NSC102-2410-004-082-MY2		
計畫名稱	全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討		
出國人員姓名	蔡彥仁	服務機構及職稱	國立政治大學宗教研究所教授
出國時間	104 年 7 月 29 日至 104 年 8 月 25 日	出國地點	Boston, USA

一、移地研究過程

本人進行的兩年期專題研究，主要在探討中國大陸自 1978 年改革開放以來，相對於政治、經濟、社會、文化的巨大變動，基督宗教在該地亦是蓬勃發展，在許多層面發生重大的影響。本人從 2011 年即已著手在大陸進行田野調查，累積不少一手資料，需要從不同的學術角度進行深入的分析和詮釋。客觀而言，有關中國當代基督教的研究，無論就廣度和深度而言，仍以外文的學術著作領銜，因此實有必要移地研究，親炙國外圖書館的豐富藏書，並且與相關的學者進行切磋討論，以達攻錯精進之效。職是之故，本人在多方接觸和考慮下，在今年 7 月 29 日～8 月 25 日期間，回母校哈佛大學，進行本研究計畫的移地研究，在計畫將結束之時，對於已撰寫的論文，做修改補強的工作。

二、研究成果

本人在 Boston 的時間共有三週，所進行的工作主要有兩項：一為，將本人在 7 月於澳洲所發表的論文草稿，再進一步修改補充，尤其使用 Boston 地區許多相關的圖書資料，先行費時閱讀，再融入論文內。本人希望此篇論文，題為“Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan”能因此提升品質，期冀發表在國際期刊。（論文參考附件）

本人另外完成的工作，即是趁機會蒐集和閱讀本人將持續的科技部兩年期計畫圖書：「當代中國基督教之興起與世界基督教：內涵特徵之比較研究」（2015-17）。按，此往後兩年的計畫是目前計畫的延續和擴大，目的在將現階段的研究成果，放在更廣的世界基督教的概念框架下，進行跨地區的比較。本人有幸藉此機會，整理出一些相關書目，特別是早期基督教在羅馬帝國的背景資料，皆是在台灣不易獲得者，具有珍貴的價值。

三、建議

科技部能補助學者至海外進行移地研究，可說是一大「德政」。雖然由於網路科技發達，許多資料可藉由電子網路流通，但是對於許多需要大量閱讀以及親炙圖書的人文議題研究而言，研究者親赴一流圖書館，有較多時間浸潤其中，以便整理耙梳，此是相當重要的學術過程，對於研究成果的確定，有深刻的影響。期待以後科技部能在此方面持續嘉惠學者。

四、其他

無。

附件二

國科會補助專題研究計畫出席國際學術會議心得報告

日期：104 年 10 月 12 日

計畫編號	NSC 102-2410-H-004-MY2		
計畫名稱	全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討		
出國人員姓名	蔡彥仁	服務機構及職稱	國立政治大學宗教研究所教授
會議時間	105 年 7 月 5 日至 105 年 7 月 9 日	會議地點	Adelaide, Australia
會議名稱	The 9 th International Convention of Asia Scholars		
發表題目	Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan		

一、參加會議經過

本人過去參加過無數次的國際研討會，但所謂的「國際」，主要以歐美地區為主，卻忽略不少世界其他地域的學術團體和活動。本人在執行本計畫的第二年期間，聞悉澳洲地區人文學界將舉辦亞洲學者聯合會議，認為機會難得，值得與會，可藉機與更多不同背景的學術圈交流互動。本次的 The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars 是同性質的第九屆年會，係由澳洲南部三所大學，以及荷蘭的 International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) 所主辦，但同時聯合 Asian Studies Association of Australia, Chinese Association of Australia, South Asian Studies

Association of Australia 三個澳洲全國性學術團體，共同召開，場次達數百，論文上千，規模盛大。本人此次前往參加，一方面在 7 月 8 日的 Religion Past and Present 場次中，發表個人的論文一篇。另一方面，本人也藉此機會，率領政大宗教研究所三位博士生，組成一個名為 From Missionary to Indigenization and Globalization: Transformation of Church-State Relationship in Modern Chinese Society 的場次，自願擔任主席，協助其在國際場合發表論文。師生合作，一舉兩得，個人增進經驗，學生亦拓展視野，有正面的學術學習和成長的意義。

二、與會心得

本人所發表的論文屬於當代中國基督教研究，此一議題在澳洲尚屬於小眾興趣，還未吸引太多學者注意。不過澳洲學界因為中國大陸的崛起，目前當代大陸的政治、經濟、社會、文化的變化，已經引發相當多人的關注和研究，而宗教的發展，亦是重要議題之一。因此在會議場合，本人引介和解釋的性質多於與專家學者的具體討論。本所三位博士生的論文，所引起的反響，性質亦是如此。因此概略言之，我們師生的出席，成果在與澳洲為主的學者們進行交流，特別有數位負責中國研究的教授主管，積極邀約日後能繼續聯繫，以便進一步學術互動。

另外，本人注意到參與本次大會的成員，由中國大陸出來，或在澳洲求學，或屬於大陸大學的博士生數量相當大。他們大都踴躍發表，積極敢言，頗讓人印象深刻，值得台灣學界比較反思年輕一輩學者的國際競爭力問題。

三、發表論文全文或摘要

Abstract (全文參閱附件)

That food or eating plays an important role in religious orders, celebrations, disciplines, or believers' common life has been much discussed by many scholars, but how this dimension functions in the construction of a Chinese church is territory yet to be explored. The paper I intend to present, based on written documents, interviews, and participatory observations in church communities across the Taiwan Strait, highlights the crucial positions the kitchen and the dining hall assume in the physical setting of a Chinese church, as well as the importance of meal hours that its members cherish and observe. I argue that the Christian message of *koinōnia*, symbolized by the sacrament of the Holy Communion, is effectively materialized in food fellowship among Chinese Christians. This practice tallies well with the traditional Chinese understanding that food reigns supreme in the ordering of a community (*min yishi weitian*). I also argue that thanks to the prominence of this feature, a Chinese church becomes a family writ large. This proves especially attractive in the context of

postmodernity, wherein familial ties have been quickly disintegrating, and yet some Chinese Christian churches that manage eating well have been developing rapidly. By focusing on food fellowship, I hope to bring the contrasts between a Chinese church and its counterpart in the West into clear relief.

五、攜回資料名稱及內容

The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars, 5-9 July 2015, Adelaide, Australia (Final Program)

六、其他

附件三

Political Ideology and Theological Rhetoric: The Case of the True Jesus Church in Taiwan in the Cold War (1945-1990)

Yen-zen TSAI

Graduate Institute of Religious Studies, NCCU

“The Cold War and Christianity in East Asia, 1945-1990”
Tao Fong Shan Christian Center, Hong Kong, April 10-13, 2014

I. Introduction

Scholars interested in the rise and rapid growth of Pentecostalism in Latin America have observed that this type of Christianity is overall theologically conservative. The Pentecostals are Biblicist and moralist, fascinated with spiritual experience and personal salvation much more than this-worldly or social engagement. They are mostly non-violent and hence apolitical or even anti-political as far as their political attitude is concerned. (Cox 1995; Jenkins 2002; Martin 1990) From a historical perspective, David Martin traced Pentecostalism to Anglo-Saxon Methodism and European Pietism. He found that when the Pentecostal forebears confronted with the secular authority, they either supported the status quo or withdrew themselves into “a major regional and cultural periphery.” (Martin 1990:15)¹ This apolitical feature of church-state relationship about Pentecostal Christianity would then seem prevalent in the Western hemisphere. Is this characteristic also true in East Asia or, in our case, in Taiwan in the Cold War (1945-1990)?

The Nationalist government (KMT), as a result of being defeated by the Chinese Communist Party (CCP), retreated to Taiwan in 1949 and claimed sovereignty over the whole island. It immediately implemented a nation-wide martial law which lasted for thirty-eight years (1949-1987), a long duration overlapping a substantial part of the Cold War (1945-1990). (Mitter 2013; Taylor 2009; Tien 1989) The KMT authoritarian regime might have somewhat loosened its polity from a “hard” to a “soft” one under President Chiang Ching-kuo’s rule (1978-1988), it in general maintained watchful supervision over its subjects on almost all aspects of their life, including the citizen’s religious activities. (Kuo 2008; Winckler 1984, 1994) As a response, most religious groups refrained from political involvement. They, in order

¹ Here David Martin referred the former to German Pietism in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries and the latter to Haugean Pietism in the eighteenth-century Western Norway.

to survive, adopted “either a submissive position or a strictly isolationist attitude toward the state.” (Kuo 2008:11; Katz 2003)

Most of the Taiwanese Christian churches followed this general trend of submission during the Cold War, but a couple of them stood defiant. The Presbyterian Church, the largest Protestant denomination espousing a theology of indigenization and contextualization, issued a series of political statements in the 1970s urging the KMT regime to reform and to seek for Taiwan independence. The government responded by tightening its grip on this church, causing intermittent yet severe conflicts between them in the subsequent years. (Kuo 2008:35-36; Lin, B. 1990; Sawatzky 1981) While the Presbyterian Church, instigated by its democratic theology and ecclesiology, challenged the KMT authoritarian government and its martial law (Kuo 2008:38-45), the New Testament Church, a radical Pentecostal-charismatic sect, attacked the KMT regime owing to its millenarian theology that inveighs against the unjust autocracy. (Rubinstein 1991:143-147, 1994) Pentecostal Christianity, therefore, might choose to succumb to the state, but the submissive position is not the only way to deal with the ruling authority. Among those Protestant or Pentecostal churches that are submissive, one may witness a variety of manifestations of submissiveness, depending on the theology a denomination adopts and the environment it happens to face. In what follows, I will take the True Jesus Church (TJC), another prominent Pentecostal-charismatic church in Taiwan, as an example to illustrate this peculiar church-state relationship.

II. True Jesus Church

Background

The True Jesus Church was established by Wei Enbo 魏恩波 (Paul Wei), Zhang Lingsheng 張靈生 and Zhang Dianju 張殿舉 (Barnabas Zhang) in 1917 in Peking. The TJC’s official history claims that these early church workers individually underwent extraordinary spiritual experiences, including seeing visions, speaking in tongues, and receiving instructions from Heaven with respect to the name of the church and the truth to salvation. (Wang 2005) The three of them were charismatic preachers and healers, spreading the new sect fast and wide first in North China and, then, downward to provinces in South China, Taiwan included. By late 1940s, the TJC claimed to have one-hundred-thousand members, with chapels, schools, and meeting houses set up throughout China.² Historians of Chinese Christianity usually

² The most useful primary source about the early history of the TJC is its *Zhen yesu jiaohui chuang li sanshi zhounian jinian zhuan* 真耶穌教會創立三十週年紀念專刊 (Commemorative Issue on the Thirtieth Anniversary of the True Jesus Church), published by its General Assembly in 1947, Nanjing.

juxtaposed the TJC with the Assembly Hall and Jesus Family, designating them as representatives of Chinese indigenous Protestantism in the first half of the twentieth century. (Bays 1995, 2003; Deng 2005; Lian 2008, 2010) After 1949 when the CCP took over China, religious activities of whatever sorts were strictly prohibited or even suppressed. Many of the TJC leaders were in this circumstance imprisoned, and all of its chapels were shut down and confiscated. The Taiwan TJC, in contrast, enjoyed relative religious freedom under the KMT government and thus established a headquarters to succeed the old one in mainland China and assumed the role of central leadership.³ (Wang 2005)

The TJC is conservative in its theological outlook. It upholds Ten Articles of Faith among which five are most fundamental: water baptism, footwashing, holy communion, holy spirit, and the Sabbath. (Wang 2005; TJC 2007) In the initial stage of its history, the TJC promulgated a millenarian message that announces the imminent coming of Jesus Christ. It saw itself as the orthodox inheritor of the Apostolic Church recorded in *Acts*, and its mission was to rectify the mistaken beliefs seen in Catholicism as well as in all other Protestant denominations. In its self-understanding, it was the only church that saves in the end time. The “True Jesus,” as its title indicates, thus carries dualistic and exclusivist connotations that often incurred antagonism from other Christian churches. However, in its animosity against the outsiders, the Western foreigners were part of the central target. The TJC was eminently proud of the fact it did not have any connections with the Western missionaries and that it was established and managed by the Chinese on the basis of self-reliance, self-support, and self-propagation. (Wang 2005) Given the context in which China was struggling against the Western imperialists in the early decades of the twentieth century, the TJC’s anti-foreign stance somehow secured for itself a status of being politically correct. In this sense, although the TJC has maintained an apolitical attitude toward the state, its Chinese nationalist sentiment has proved to be an intriguing factor that affects its relationship with the ruling government. We may detect this important point by delving into the numerous issues of its gazette, the *Holy Spirit Times* 聖靈報.

Holy Spirit Times (HST)

The General Assembly of the TJC has continuously published the *HST* monthly

³ Some senior Taiwan TJC leaders expressed to me that the KMT government did not intervene in their church affairs. They reasoned that it was because the TJC never got involved in political activities but went along with the government’s policies. However, with respect to preaching the gospel outdoors and among the original tribes, the church was required to secure the official permission beforehand. In addition, when the annual church delegates’ meeting was convened, government officials would come to “give advice,” i.e. to supervise. (interviews conducted on February 22 and March 1, 2014)

since 1926 until today, with a few interruptions caused by wars.⁴ This official journal is rich in content, containing such thematic categories as editorial, sermon, bible study, reflection, testimony, meeting minutes, news report, etc. The goal of this journal is twofold, one for the spiritual edification of the TJC followers, the other for spreading the gospel of salvation to the unbelievers. Among these variegated literary items, the editorials, although short and written by different authors under pen names, appear the most formal and valuable, because they represent what the TJC leaders think and respond in the different living contexts they are in. Examinations of them will shed light on the problematic that concerns us here.

When the first issue of the *HST* appeared in October 1926, the editor announced ten general rules that define the aim and contents of this newly born gazette. The seventh one stipulates that the *HST* does not publish “articles on political issue, unless they concur with TJC’s fundamental belief and are beneficial to the betterment of human mind.” (1.1:1) Furthermore, an article in this issue titled “Distinction between the Spiritual Church and the Secular Church” emphasizes that the Spiritual Church occupies itself with preaching the gospel, worshiping God in sincerity, and spiritual cultivation, whereas the Secular Church is happy with worldly pursuits, including “talking about science, politics, and current social affairs.” (1.1:4) It is thus clear that the TJC considers itself to be an absolutely spiritual body and is conscious to distance itself from any political involvements. This explains why in the following two decades, rarely can one find articles in the *HST* that directly address political or social issues. Critical incidents, however, are exceptions. When the Japanese empire launched wars against China from 1937 onward, it, focusing on Shanghai as its primary target, brought the area into devastation. TJC’s headquarters, then situated there, were destroyed, and its printing facilities were in total ruins. The *HST* was in this way forced to discontinue its publication for months. Interruptions caused by wars such as these repeated three times in the 1930s and twice in the 1940s. Only on these occasions would the *HST* lay out reasons, explaining to the reader what has happened. (13.1:1; 13.2:1; 14.12:1; 18.1:1)

It may be TJC’s Chinese nationalist feeling, intensified by the Sino-Japanese War, that drew it near to the KMT government. The True Church might not want to deal with the secular issues, it could not blind itself to the wartime reality. To support the government against the foreign invader seemed theologically legitimate and doctrinally acceptable. Wei Yisa 魏以撒 (Issac Wei), son of Paul Wei and the Superintendent of the TJC General Assembly in the 1930s and 1940s, in this context

⁴ For information in this regard, see <http://www.zysjh.com/zhuanke/sbycd/4.asp> (accessed March 30, 2014) I want to thank the Taiwan General Assembly of TJC for providing me with photo copies of the entire *HST* back issues from 1926 to 1993. For more recent issues from 1994 onward, one can refer to <http://www.joy.org.tw/holyspiri.asp?item=3> (accessed March 30, 2014).

adopted the tune of KMT's party anthem and had the believers sing the *Shier biao zhun* 十二標準 (Twelve Standards) he had formulated in accordance with the borrowed tune. On a meeting of provincial church delegates, he thus delivered his message:

Let us stand up and sing the following words by following the tune of KMT's party anthem of the Three People's Principles: One True God, Two Testaments, Three Spiritual Roots, Four Activities, Five Salvations, Six-day Work, Seventh Day Rest, Eight Remnants, Nine Spiritual Levels, Ten Commandments, Eleven Kinds of Grace, Twelve Foundations. (17.9-12:90)

His deliberate numerological interpretation of the Bible is imaginative but arcane and controversial from our modern perspective. His rendering of these doctrines into an oral, mnemonic pattern by incorporating the political element, however, attests that TJC's apolitical attitude was not immune from political connection. It is a moot point how Wei Yisa interacted with the KMT regime in private because there is not sufficient information for us to judge, but that this indigenous Chinese church maintained an amicable relationship with the ruling authority is plausible. In 1947, when the TJC celebrated its thirtieth anniversary, quite a few of KMT's important figures such as Sun Ke 孫科, Zhang Qun 張群, Gu Zhenggang 谷正綱, Yan Xishan 閻錫山, Wang Yunwu 王雲五, Zou Lu 鄒魯, and Chen Lifu 陳立夫, sent in their congratulations in calligraphy and were printed on the front pages of the *Commemorative Issue*.⁵ This further proves that the TJC was by no means apolitical as it officially claimed itself to be.

After 1949 the TJC in Taiwan has continued the ambiguous attitude of its mainland predecessors to deal with the political authority. That is, on the surface it adheres to the policy of separation of church and state, it actually expresses a supportive attitude toward the secular government. Be that the case, compared with the TJC mainland predecessors, the Taiwanese church leaders appear more adroit at combining the political vocabularies with theological terms and turning the result into strengthening its status as an independent Pentecostal-charismatic church. We can draw some examples from the *HST* to illustrate this point.

“Making Supplications for the State”

Taiwan encountered a series of crises during KMT's martial law period. Notable ones include defense against the protracted and targeted military attacks from mainland China in the 1950s, being expelled from the United Nations in 1971, and

⁵ See footnote 2.

severing of diplomatic tie with the United States in 1979. (Lin, B. 1990: 93-125; Taylor 2009:547-587; Tien 1989: 216-248). These events created a strong sense of instability and anxiety among Taiwan's residents. They were also occasions that tested how the Christians would interpret their faith vis-à-vis the external world. Eschatological descriptions loomed large in many of the *HST* issues when these events took place (nos. 48, 93, 101, 113, 134, 179, 312), but very few editorials or articles directly pinpointed them except reacting with biblical quotations. An editorial in a 1954 issue (no. 54), titled "Making Supplications for the State," first quotes 1 Timothy 2:1-2 to legitimate its care about the politics. Its author goes on to argue that as Christians we should intercede "for everyone, for kings and all who are in high positions,"⁶ and these people refer to our compatriots and our political leaders. He expounds further that as we pray for them, in particular for those who reign, we are able to remain away from disasters of war and "lead a quiet and peaceable life." He in the end emphasizes that even though earthly potentates rule over the nations, it is God the Supreme Lord who bestows power decides the final victory. Therefore it behooves us to make supplications for the state, but one should rely upon God all the more. (50:2)

"Making supplications for the state" seems to have become a popular topic for the TJC authors when coming to their relationship with the state in the 1950s. This is understandable as it is derived from the biblical instruction and, as well, is related to their urgent living reality. A sermon note in the August 1958 issue (no. 96:9-10) bears the same title and elaborates 1 Timothy 2:1-3 in more detail. In a creative exegesis, the author avers that "for everyone" in the original verse means "for those who have not been saved." This, then, takes all non-TJC members into consideration. The author suggests that strategically we should pray for the provincial fellow citizens in Taiwan first, gradually expand our intercessions to include the compatriots in mainland China, and finally concern ourselves with all humankind. He particularly mentions the military confrontation over the Taiwan Straits, lamenting the possible breakout of a big war. To stop the upcoming war and its disastrous consequences, he considers it important to ask God to cleanse human sins first because it is sins that bring about war. "Making supplications for the state" therefore is intimately tied to whether or not we can lead a peaceable life. The author concludes with affirmation that should we intercede, the state will be saved; if not, at least we the intercessors will be.

Another editorial published in 1972 (no. 259), titled "Making Supplications for The Peace of the State," basically echoes the same message of the articles aforementioned, but it more explicitly identifies some biblical verses with what

⁶ I use NRSV English translation throughout this paper.

Taiwan is realistically confronting. The author refers to Jeremiah 29:7, “But seek the welfare of the city where I have sent you into exile, and pray to the Lord on its behalf, for in its welfare you will find your welfare” and, again, 1 Timothy 2:1-4, as prooftexts for his theological argument. He contends that it fulfills God’s will for the “chosen people” (read “TJC members”) to pray for one’s country or foreign countries, those in power, and all people. He then turns to *Revelation* and interprets such apocalyptic creatures as “red horse” (6:4) and “dragon” (13:1-8) to mean the leading Communist countries (read “Red China” and “USSR”) with their minions. People in the “fallen area” are under Satan’s control, and the author warns us not to follow their fate. In contrast, we people in the “free area” should vigilantly make supplications for the peace and safety of the state. The contents of this intercession should include, he instructs, praying for the unbelieving compatriots to desist from idolatry and other evil deeds. In conclusion, he makes it explicit that the TJC originated and developed in China, a history to be cherished and proud of. Since the Red China has fallen into the hands of Satan, the TJC members in Taiwan, the free China, hence has a great responsibility for world mission. This should be the ultimate goal and meaning of “making supplications for the peace of the state.”

“Composed and Perseverant”

The TJC leaders on some occasions turn away from their official apolitical position and talk about “politics.” This when they do, they do it in a dexterous manner. An article bearing the title “Basic Principles for National Prosperity” in a 1965 issue (no. 183) appears quite noticeable. Its author begins with an apologetic clarification, maintaining that the Christian’s apolitical attitude should not be read as a sign of being unpatriotic. Christians should and do concern about the fate of the country where they happen to reside, otherwise they cannot live a peaceful life if that country would slip into violence or disorder. They are overall good citizens and pray for the ruling authority. The author’s biblical quotations, Jeremiah 29:4-7 and 1 Timothy 2:1-3, are conventional as far as TJC’s theological self-justification for its relationship with the state is concerned.

What is interesting about this article is that the author lays out four principles, accompanied by numerous biblical verses, by which he thinks the country can prosper: “1. nation-wide devotion to God; 2. upholding morality and justice; 3. implementation of benevolence; 4. electing sagacious and competent officials.” (no. 183: 12-15) These principles appear moralist in intent, not far from what a Confucian idealist would propose to the ruler in imperial China. It is as though the author would want to talk about real politics, with mild chastisement, remonstrance, and hope, and yet

refrains from doing it too explicitly. He therefore couches his political concern in theological rhetoric. To round up his statement, he affirms that in a time of national crisis, the best way for Christians to do service to their country is no better than pray for it, transform human heart, and preach the gospel to save souls. By this conclusion one sees the author resume his identity as a leader of the apolitical TJC again. There are some more similar examples which manifest this practice of combining political concern with theological rhetoric in other issues of the *HTS*.

The United Nations ousted Taiwan and received instead the CCP regime as the legitimate representative of China in 1971. (Taylor 2009: 571-575) Facing this devastating impact, Chiang Kai-shek issued an official statement urging the Taiwanese people to be “composed and perseverant, fearless in turmoil.” (*zhaungjing ziqiang, chubian bujing* 莊敬自強、處變不驚) Afterwards this slogan he coined in two four-character phrases quickly became circulated in every corner of society. One editorial in a 1972 issue of the *HST* appears exactly with the title of “Composed and Perseverant.” (no. 261.2) Its author does not mention the historical event, but he resonates with the government’s tone, trying to strengthen the reader’s spirit in words of assurance. For proof texts, he quotes Palms 33: 9, 11-12: “For [the Lord] spoke, and it came to be; he commanded, and it stood firm....The counsel of the Lord stands forever, the thoughts of his heart to all generations. Happy is the nation whose God is the Lord, the people whom he has chosen as his heritage.” The author assumes that the ROC on Taiwan has observed the divine principle, and on that account it should be reckoned as God’s favorite. What the Palmist pronounces to the ancient Israelites must be also true to the Taiwanese. The implied message the author intends to convey should be clearly understood by TJC members as well non-believers living under the shadow of that crisis.

Another article bearing the same title is more explicit about the living context, but its author translates the national crisis into a spiritual and eschatological scenario that easily evokes the reader’s alertness. (no. 258: 21-22) He refers to the biblical passages related to the end time (Mathew 24:5-12; 2 Timothy 3:1-5), reminding the reader that what was forewarned in the Bible about corruption of the secular world and human heart is taking place in their time. In view of the crisis, however, the true believers should not be affected. Rather, they should be “composed and perseverant, fearless in turmoil.” Here the political motto is adopted into theological purposes. Safely sailing through the stormy sea, the author affirms, we should rely upon the Lord as our true leader. In any event, to be firm about our faith and hold fast to the hope for eternity assures us to live a peaceful life on earth and enter into the Heavenly Kingdom in the future.

Taiwan was living in an increasingly isolated situation after 1971, and this crisis

of national existence culminated in 1979 when the United States announced to discontinue its diplomatic tie with Taiwan and “normalize” its relation with the CCP government in mainland China. The blow was almost deadly for Taiwan who had relied upon this Superpower for its aid in many respects, including financial, economic, military, scientific-technological, medical, etc. An atmosphere of being abandoned and betrayed prevailed. The two phrases, “composed and perseverant, fearless in turmoil,” were continuously repeated. The TJC in this circumstance did overtly respond. In two consecutive issues of 1980, two editorials address the crisis under different titles but with a similar goal and way of presentation. The first one, “May God Bless the ROC,” begins with affirming the positive performance of the KMT government and casting harsh criticism against the US:

Our government is sagacious, competent, and credible. It has never betrayed its allies in exchange for gains. It is also able to endure hardship and challenges and seek for self-reliance. Now the US deserted Taiwan and turned to the Bandit (*fei* 匪; read “PRC”) for diplomatic relationship! It is rare to see countries like the US which harbor such an evil intent and selfishness. (no. 17: 1)

The author goes on to praise President Chiang Ching-kuo as a wise and determined man who is “fearless in turmoil” and, indeed, is our “spiritual bastion” (*jingshen baolei* 精神堡壘). After these words, he cites Romans 13:1 to buttress his statement: “Let every person be subject to the government authorities; for there is no authority except from God, and those authorities that exist have been instituted by God.” He in this connection urges the TJC members to stand united under the President’s leadership because “it is right and is acceptable in the sight of God our Savior.” (1 Timothy 2:3) In the end, he salutes the President and wishes the ROC a bright future and, as well, fast spread of the Christian truth.

The second editorial came to the public just at the beginning of the Chinese New Year. The author also lays out first what has happened to Taiwan:

On December 16, [1979], President Carter announced to sever diplomatic tie with Taiwan and “normalize” relationship with the PRC. When the news reached here, we Taiwanese were shocked to despair, with no idea where to go.... However, we trust that all our fellow countrymen have stood united under the leadership of the most competent government and would be able to overcome the unprecedented difficulty. (18: 1)

He admits that the crisis Taiwan is facing is intimately connected to the safety of the TJC, therefore it is necessary for the Church to have an “extraordinary tactics in face of the extraordinary situation.” Besides helping the TJC members strengthening their faith, raising their spirituality, and quickly carrying out the holy work of saving souls,

he proposes some plans to restructure TJC's General Assembly and from there to galvanize the Church as a whole. In this way he sees the adversity as an opportunity for TJC's self-renewal and further development.

III. Discussion

The Cold War occupies a very crucial period of history in the second half of the twentieth century, with a long-lasting effect that still shapes our world map today. (Immerman and Goedde 2013) The United States and the Soviet Union, the most prominent two superpowers, respectively led its own allies and subjects to struggle against each other over sovereignty in both overt and covert conflicts during that time. In retrospect, as Prasenjit Duara insightfully points out:

The Cold War rivalry provides the *frame of reference* within which the historical forces of imperialism and nationalism interact with developments such as decolonization, multiculturalism, and new ideologies and modes of identity formation, thus providing a novel *configuration*. (Duara 2013:86, italics his; see also Iriye 2013)

What is noteworthy for our purposes is that the US created in many parts of the world “a vast system of ‘political and military vassalage.’” (Duara 2013:90) Taiwan and Korea, too, in East Asia became the “client-states” of the imperialist America, with economic and military support from the “parent” country. This in turn encouraged and facilitated the establishment of authoritarian regimes in the two emerging nations which suppressed their own people with legitimate excuses like anti-Communism.

From the perspective of modern Chinese history, the KMT, although temporarily lost battles to its enemy, the CCP, retreated to Taiwan for a respite. The civil war between the two rivals was thus extended to the island which had just been returned to the ROC from Japan the defeated colonist. As the Cold War descended, the regional Chinese civil war was absorbed into the global conflict, with the CCP in the Communist conglomerate and the KMT in the democratic camp. It was to the KMT regime's benefit to remain in the “free world,” because it could reversely turn the global anti-Communist force to achieving its own goal, i.e., to defeat its enemy and reclaim the mainland. Indeed the KMT government did it by imparting political ideology to its Taiwanese subjects. *Fangong dalu* 反攻大陸 (“Re-conquering the Mainland”) became a widespread political motto during the martial law period. A second slogan, *Fangong kang-e* 反共抗俄 (“Opposing the Communist and Resisting the Russian”), was simultaneously formulated to expand the content of the first one.

(Lin, G. 2009: 70-73) By combining these two slogans and inculcating them in the mind of the Taiwanese people, the KMT regime at least accomplished two things. One was that it could legitimately implement the martial law under the pretext that the country was still in the state of the prolonged civil war. Another was that the KMT regime aligned itself with the advanced, Western democratic countries thereby to gain for itself the name, although spurious, of being a democratic country.

The political ideology the KMT regime created in the Cold War or martial law period seemed to take effect. As mentioned, except for the Presbyterian Church and the New Testament Church which rose to defy the authoritarian government, almost all religious groups, Catholicism and Protestant denominations included, appeared submissive. Admittedly there are many reasons behind this submissiveness. For conservative Christians like the TJC, an apocalyptic reading of the Cold War situation might be an important one. To them, the mainland China was controlled by an atheist government which was hostile to any type of religion and persecuted all religious believers. A regime such as this was no more than the vicar of Satan who was to be annihilated on the Day of Judgment. In contrast, the US-led free world was intimately affiliated with Christianity. Since Taiwan under the KMT regime was a member of this camp, it was natural for the Christians to support it.

This global context in which Taiwan was situated in the Cold War is fundamental to understanding our subject. It reminds us of the specific circumstance within which Christian groups would and could respond to the state. It also affects how we would evaluate their performances at that historical stage. These Christian denominations were in general submissive; however, it should be emphasized again that different Christian churches manifested different degrees of submissiveness. As we have seen, even the Pentecostal-charismatic TJC exhibited multiple feelings toward the KMT government, depending upon the changing context in which it existed and which theology it wanted to prioritize. This needs to be stated in more detail.

The TJC has in general maintained a good relationship with the KMT government. In the period of 1927-1949, this church was immensely eschatologically oriented and as such strenuously engaged in evangelism. As many issues of the *HST* indicate, it refrained from dealing with politics and anything considered secular. However, due to the fact that this Christian sect was established by Chinese, that it was averse to Western missionaries, and that Sino-Japanese War intensified its nationalist sentiment, it supported KMT regime for national causes.

The TJC spread its gospel of salvation to Taiwan in 1926 and quickly took root in the land, twenty-three years earlier than the time when the KMT set up its central government on the island. The Taiwan TJC leaders, mostly Taiwanese, were skillful in dealing with this “new” regime. Based on the *HST*, one can observe this skillfulness

on two levels, biblical and practical, and these two interact with each other.

The TJC is Biblicist as far as its theological understanding is concerned, and, as such, quotes the biblical verses as prooftexts frequently and abundantly in regard to whatever topic it deals with. As we have illustrated, many *HST* articles refer to Jeremiah 29:7, Romans 13:1, and 1 Timothy 2:1-4 to justify their political attitude toward supporting the ruling authority. They do not discuss in what way or to what degree this supportive stance could be made possible. They avoid getting involved in political or secular affairs for sure, but as long as the issues “concur with TJC’s fundamental belief and are beneficial to the betterment of human mind” (1.1:1), they would nonetheless face the realities. National affairs such as possible wars against the PRC, withdrawal from the United Nations, discontinuity of diplomatic relation with the US are certainly too big and shocking to ignore. Some domestic problems, much smaller in scale, may also catch the TJC’s attention. For example, the KMT government promoted an island-wide Environmental Clean-up Movement (*xiaochu zangluan yundong* 消除髒亂運動) in 1975. Two *HST*’s editorials that year seized the opportunity and responded to the government’s campaign. (nos. 299, 300) The authors follow the “politically correct” propaganda by saying that littering of garbage is sign of culturally backward people, hence something to be ashamed of. To be counted as an advanced and civilized society, the nationals should shape up and clean their living environment up to the modern standard. There is no doubt that they sincerely present their opinions in accordance with the tenet of the political campaign, but it is interesting to note that the prooftexts they quote are all spiritual in denotation. Mark 7: 21-23 stands for the most conspicuous instance among these quoted verses:

For it is from within, from the human heart, that evil intentions come: fornication, theft, murder, adultery, avarice, wickedness, deceit, licentiousness, envy, slander, pride, folly. All these evil things come from within, and they defile a person.

The authors express that these items of vice Jesus used to castigate the Pharisees are more genuine in comparison with material uncleanness. To them, to eliminate dirt and dust from our living environment, the first priority is to get down to the spiritual source and clean the human heart.

Indeed, emphasis on the spiritual dimension of what the Bible says is tactically crucial to the TJC leaders, and, paradoxically, this hermeneutic principle may sometimes guide them to face social or political events realistically. We already mentioned that an editorial of the *HST* proposed to the government that it uphold justice, practice benevolence, and put the upright and able persons to offices. There are some more similar examples of this nature. An editorial bearing the title “Do not Intend to Fight against God” was published in 1951 (no. 36), not long after World War

II had ended and Taiwan was still in a state of upheaval. It was written to protest against some type of encroachment, although unspecified, that was pressuring the TJC. Its author refers to quite a few historical events in the Old Testament and argues that those foreign kings, false prophets, and evil schemers who stood against God or God's chosen people all met their own destruction in the end. The author emphatically concludes, "any nation, group, or individual today should be aware. Do not become God's enemy, resist the truth, or persecute God's people." (no. 36.2) What happened in ancient time, he explicitly warns, will definitely take place today. The author in this short piece of writing conveys his confrontational emotion by making use of the biblical examples to address his concern. Another editorial, carrying the title of "Saving the Country by Preaching the Truth" and published in 1980 (no. 27: 1), can be added for purposes of contrast. Its author first repudiates the popular wrong impression that Christians are unpatriotic because of their apolitical or withdrawn attitude. He, citing Romans 13: 1-7, argues that they are subject to the government, obey the laws, and pay taxes; these show that they are good citizens. There are ways to love one's country, he continues, and there is no better way than preach the truth. He explains that the truth can change the sinner, harmonize the family, and bring peace to the country. This is the great contribution Christians can make to our society or country. On account of it, Christians are actually very patriotic, the author conclusively affirms.

The TJC leaders are thus seen to have moved between the spiritual and the practical, depending on the situation they happened to counter or the subject they intended to tackle. In response to the authoritarian government which they were supposed to obey according to the biblical instructions and historical circumstances, they were careful about reconciling their theological terms with the social and political realities. On the one hand, their conservative theological stance directed them to read the biblical verses literarily and use them as prooftexts. On the other hand, secular or political events prompted them to choose appropriate biblical verses that were most beneficial to their church community. The spiritual and the practical in this way interacted with each other. In the limited space that the KMT regime would grant to the religious groups, this adaptationist approach seems to have functioned very well for the TJC in the Cold War.

IV. Conclusion

Scholars' observations about Pentecostals in the West that they are Biblicist, that they are concerned with personal salvation more than with social engagement, that they are apolitical, and that they are submissive to the ruling authority are generally

valid, but they have to be modified in view of the Taiwan TJC case we studied in this paper. What is crucial about this modification lies in the necessity of reevaluating them from a broader context in which they live, as well as of pinpointing the specific historical stage this context is associated with. Cautiousness about this not only helps us to distinguish the Pentecostals from other types of Christians but, more significantly, guides us to look into the intricacies that characterize their relationship with the state.

The Cold War period was generated by military and political forces after World War II, and it affected the international order and ordinary people's life alike far and wide. The KMT regime in Taiwan, part of that historical formation, benefited from the Cold War tension to legitimate itself as an authoritarian government. Domestically it implemented the martial law under which religious activities were supervised and restricted.

Responses of the Christian churches to the KMT regime varied. While the Presbyterian Church and the New Testament Church were defiant, almost all other Christian denominations were submissive and obeyed whatever laws issued from the government. In this connection, the Pentecostals were no different from the Catholics, Baptists, and members of the Local Church. (Kuo 2008: 45-54) The TJC was likewise submissive, but due to its peculiar theology and historical origins and development, this submissiveness exhibited different faces. This church appeared as an apocalyptic sect in mainland China in the early part of the twentieth century, and as such held a withdrawn attitude toward the state and the secular world in general. However, its Chinese indigenous character and strong nationalist sentiment enabled it to maintain good terms with the KMT government, and this relationship was continued to the Cold War or martial period in Taiwan.

Murray A. Rubinstein classifies the Protestant community in modern Taiwan into three groups, according to the degrees of their indigenization. (Rubinstein 1991) He juxtaposes the TJC with other churches of the Holy Spirit such as the Assemblies of God, Assembly Hall Church (Local Church), and the New Testament Church. While his device of "pattern of congruence" makes some sense from the perspective of Western mission, it does not help us look into the details about the church-state relationships among Protestant denominations in Taiwan. As we just saw, the conservative and indigenized TJC, unlike the New Testament Church, did not openly attack the KMT government. On the contrary, it was pro-government, akin to the more liberal denominations like the Anglicans, Lutherans, and Methodists, all established by and connected to foreign missionaries. With respect to national crises, events that the TJC considered concurred with its theological position and conducive to the betterment of human mind, it would voice its opinions either implicitly or

explicitly. In this regard, it was very different from most of the muted, submissive churches. Therefore, examinations of each Christian church according to specific circumstances, again, are necessary.

Lastly, no matter how we evaluate the church-state relationship by focusing on a certain church in Taiwan, we should be reminded of or surprised by the fact that the Christian population grew rapidly under the KMT's martial law period, in particular during the 1950s-1960s, with no distinctions between denominational lines.

(Rubinstein 1991:7; Kuo 2008:38-45; Sawatzky 1981:457-458) The growth rate, however, declined when the KMT government began to accelerate its economic development in Taiwan toward the late 1970s and somewhat loosened its control over its subjects. This phenomenon and its subsequent dramatic transformation deserve our attention, but they require another study.

Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan

Yen-zen Tsai

Graduate Institute of Religious Studies
National Chengchi University

“The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars”

Adelaide, Australia, July 5-9, 2015

Brother Chen had accompanied me in my regular Bible reading. Through his exegetical guidance, I could always feel beautiful things contained in the holy book.... If what my daily reading of the Bible was an intake of spiritual food, then he was a skillful chef who turned the food into palatable dishes. Bible reading was no longer an unbearable burden like chewing tasteless wax; rather, it was something delicious to be ingested....So we read the Bible together everyday, ate meals at the same table, and shared our life experiences in the midst of bowls and dishes....Indeed it was the Bible verses, similar to tasty and nutritious food, that strengthened my mind and enabled me to move forward.

“Different Kind of Food,” by Han Xiaojing

Introduction

Many scholars of religion have noted the rapid growth of Christianity in China in the past decades (Aikman 2003; Dunch 2001; Hunter & Chan 1993; Lee 2007; Lian 2011; Yang 2012). When the Communist regime took control of China in 1949, its official survey reported that there were 3 million Catholics and 1 million Protestants. Despite its severe repression of Christianity or all forms of religion during the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) and restrictive religious policy following this period, the Christian population dramatically increased to 67 million, Catholics and Protestants combined, in 2010, according to the Pew Research Centre's Forum on Religion and Public Life.⁷ Fenggang Yang, a leading expert on contemporary religion in China, estimated that if the current growth rate would go steady, Chinese Christians

⁷<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/china/10776023/China-on-course-to-become-worlds-most-Christian-nation-within-15-years.html> (accessed June 14, 2015)

would swell to 250 million in 2030, making China the largest Christian country in the world.⁸

Although the focus of attention on the numbers of Chinese Christians might be interesting, uncertain variables such as sources of data, size or area of survey, unpredictability of social, economic, and political developments, often turn it into guesswork. What is more noteworthy, I suppose, should be to find out the special features about this Christianity that just recently arose. Indeed we should ask first: what kind of Christianity is the current Chinese Christianity? Is it the same as the Christianity we have familiarly witnessed and understood in the West? Can we compare it to other forms of Christianity such as the Pentecostal-charismatic ones that also have been swiftly spreading in Latin America and other parts of the world (Cox 1996; Hollenweger 1972; Martin 2002; Miller and Yamamori 2007; Synan 1997)? As Fenggang Yang observed that “this speed of growth [of Chinese Christianity] is similar to that seen in the fourth-century Rome just before the conversion of Constantine, which paved the way for Christianity to become the religion of his empire,”⁹ how, then, do we, taking their respective “imperial” contexts into serious consideration, compare these two Christian manifestations? And since the present Chinese regime has repeatedly emphasized the importance of developing a “socialism with Chinese characteristics” as its national goal (Dirlik 1989; Link 2015; Youwei 2015), in a parallel vein, can we delineate a rising “Christianity with Chinese characteristics”?

The aforementioned questions are legitimate and important, but my present paper is not able to answer all of them. Instead, my modest attempt will focus on food and eating in contemporary Chinese churches. As the excerpt quoted from a prose collected in a 2015 Chinese Christian weekly calendar booklet, titled *Delicious Relationship*, and placed at the beginning of this paper vividly demonstrates, vocabularies describing food and its gastrointestinal effects are heavily employed to express the author’s experience of scriptural reading. As far as I have observed, this blending of food, eating, and spiritual experience both in the practical and figurative senses are typical and prevalent in the Chinese Christian community. For this reason, I would suggest that food fellowship as a prominent characteristic in contemporary Chinese Christianity deserves our investigation. I will argue that it is often an essential element that helps establish a Chinese church and that this special feature is consequential behind the rapid growth of today’s Chinese Christianity. To achieve my

⁸ <http://www.economist.com/news/briefing/21629218-rapid-spread-christianity-forcing-official-rethink-religion-cracks> (accessed June 14, 2015)

⁹ Ibid.

end, I intend to take the True Jesus Church (TJC) as an example of illustration, drawing evidence from its different local churches across the Taiwan Strait.

Data and Method

The True Jesus Church was founded in 1917 in Peking (now Beijing) by “the Lord Jesus Christ,” as its official website claims (TJC, US General Assembly website 2015). It has actively engaged in evangelical work in China and abroad since its birth. By now it has established branches in 58 countries and in 6 continents, with memberships totaling 1.5 million the majority of whom reside in mainland China (True Jesus Church, International Assembly website 2015; Wikipedia 2015). Scholars of Chinese Christianity have designated it, along with the Jesus Family and Little Flock, as one of the three most conspicuous Chinese indigenous churches that had appeared in China before 1949 (Bays 1995, 2003; Deng 2001; Lian 2008; Tang 2006; Wang 2005). This background of indigenesness makes it a good candidate for our exploration of Christianity with Chinese characteristics.

For my research purposes, I have traveled to mainland China since early January, 2011, for more than ten times and conducted my field work in different local TJC's primarily in Fujian, Zhejiang, and Jiangsu provinces. The most intense one took place from April 13 to May 19, 2013, during which I had oral interviews with the church leaders. In this paper, I will use pseudo-names for them for safety reason as most of them are not affiliated with or distance themselves from the official Three-self Patriotic Movement (TSPM) and thus could easily incur suppression. As a resident of Taiwan, I have regularly attended TJC's meetings in Taipei, in particular its Sabbath Day services, the highly regarded occasions by its members. In this way, my approach combines oral interviews and participant observations, in addition to consulting TJC's official publications, as well as documents that local churches feel no qualms to share.

Thematic and Theoretic Background

That food is vital to human biology is a truism, but how it is perceived, emphasized, and managed varies in different cultures and societies. In many religions, foods are often categorized, with rules that instruct the believers what to take or what to abstain from. Thus the *kasher/terefah* distinction under the dietary codes in Judaism makes it clear for the Jewish people what are allowed or forbidden to eat. Similarly prescriptions about *halal* and *haram* foods, designating lawful or unlawful according to the *Qu'ran*, also shape the Muslim's eating habits. In Mahāyāna Buddhism, the belief in *ahimsā*, nonviolence or non-taking of life, impels its followers to avoid meat and opt for vegetarianism (Bowker 1997:351-52; Smith 1995:365). Not only what to

eat is important, but also when and with whom one eats is crucial to many religious devotees. Fasting, either for purposes of repentance, petition, or spiritual discipline, always demands the practitioners to refrain from intake of food during a specified time span. Observance of the holy month of Ramadān is a good example (Denny 1985: 113-117). In Hinduism, complex rules are laid down for different caste groups to follow as regards the production, preparation, and consumption of food. Brahmins of high caste in particular are cautious about whom they dine with or happen to touch when dealing with foodstuffs, because improper physical contacts may bring about pollution, a ritual and moral taboo (Michaels 2004:180-84).

As an offshoot of Judaism, Christianity has not developed its own dietary laws in the process of its birth and formation. Although some Jewish Christians in the first two centuries may have followed their ethnic food codes, subsequent orthodox Christianity did not formulate rules in this regard for public observance (Latham 1987). Sensitivity to different categories of food and their application to physical body and spiritual exercise were only related to ascetics, notably in Medieval monasteries (Bynum 1987). However, as I will expound in the following pages, food was by no means ignored in Christianity; rather, it was transcribed into a “food-rite” the importance of which is closely connected to the establishment of a church community.

Chinese civilization has placed a great emphasis on food and eating since the time of its inception. Many sinologists confirmed that in this sphere, “China has shown a greater inventiveness than any other civilization” (Gernet 1962:135; Chang 1976, 1977; Anderson, Jr. and Anderson 1977). K. C. Chang, late eminent archaeologist and historian of ancient China, confirmed his research in these emphatic words:

I cannot feel more confident to say that the ancient Chinese were among the peoples of the world who have been particularly preoccupied with food and eating (Chang 1977:11).

And this cultural trait seems to have left its indelible mark to Chinese life in the subsequent generations, even down to our present time.

Food and eating in Chinese society do not center on the separation between the edibles and the non-edibles on the basis of a belief system as other world religions have shown. Nor do they highlight taboos of possible pollution that strictly guide the interaction of those coming from different social statuses and eating together. The Chinese have enjoyed a pretty wide range of diets, in a way true to the meaning of

homo omnivores who are able to adapt themselves to changing environments and consum whatever foodstuffs available. There are at least two prominent features, I propose, about food and eating in Chinese society that should distinguish themselves from those found in other cultures or religions. The one concerns the components of a meal, and the other is related to the behavior or manner manifested in the setting of a group eating.

A Chinese meal, as K. C. Chang has pointed out based upon ample archaeological and historical evidence, consists of *fan* (grain food) and *cai* (*ts'ai*; vegetable and meat dishes). The *fan* component has remained relatively stable throughout Chinese history, referring to either cooked rice or wheat or millet products like pancakes or noodles according to the availability of agricultural species in different localities. The *cai* component, on the other hand, may contain one, three, five, ten, twelve or even more dishes the contents of which depend upon how different kinds of vegetables, meat, or other edible natural ingredients are mixed and cooked. This part shows a great variety of compositions, and its manifestations reflect multiple culinary systems across the vast Chinese land. The dual "*fan-cai* principle," as Chang dubbed it, bespeaks the "Chineseness" of a Chinese meal, no matter what the variegated local cuisines may appear. And he reckoned that the age-old indigenous *yin-yang* concept may have played a role in formulating this dietary principle (Chang 1976:115-148; 1977:8).

People who eat at the same table and share the same *fan-cai* demonstrate a significant internal relationship. The collective behavior of commensality itself symbolically sets up a boundary that distinguishes the insiders from the outsiders. David Jordan, scholar of Taiwanese folk religion, cogently remarked that "a family is the unit attached to a rice pot" (Jordan 1977:118). What he meant was that eating together is an act that presumes recognition of affinity among those involved. The hospitable expression offered to a guest for a meal at home is "nothing [troublesome] but adding one more pair of chopsticks" (*buguo duo jia yishuang kuaizi*) on the part of the host. That is, the guest is invited to share the *fan-cai* already prepared for the family members and he or she, once joining in, would be treated just as a member among them. On this occasion the invitation connotes an act of inclusion and, as well, an expansion of the familial web. Further, as the act of eating together does not only happen among the living but also takes place between the living and the dead on moments such as funerary ceremonies, it is thus intrinsically a ritual behavior. Prescriptions about how to cook the *fan-cai* sacrificed to the deceased, regarded as either gods, ghosts or ancestors, may be different from the ordinary ones, it is certain that those who participate in the meal are to create a large family network spiritually

(Thompson 1988). Food and eating in the Chinese cultural context therefore contain the mundane and the transcendental meanings.

More and more scholars have approached the theme of food and eating in the recent decades, focusing on a wide spectrum of topics such as nutrition, culinary culture, communication, power and control, race, class, justice, ecology, etc. (Jung 2004, 2006; Latham 1987; Mennell, Murcott, and Otterloo 1992). Among them, I found theories advanced by Mary Douglas and Clause Fischler relevant and helpful in illuminating my present concerns.

Mary Douglas perceived food not as an isolated item but as an integral part of a structured whole that has a close relationship with human cognition and socio-cultural practices. The categorization of food, as her acclaimed analysis of the dietary codes in biblical Judaism based upon the binary “clean and unclean” mode has demonstrated, exactly reflects how people arrange the animal world in correspondence with the order of the human world. Hence the classification of meat into fit or unfit categories patterns the symbolic universe that the ancient Jews created. In the practical life, the “abominable” animals are likened to the gentiles who encroach on the Israelites’ boundaries, and as such their meats are unclean. Only those animals matching with detailed and restrictive prescriptions, paralleling the Jews’ self-understanding as a chosen people who observe various laws of holiness, are considered to be clean. The clean animal meats, hunted from the air, sea, and land, are allowed to be food at the table, and among them only selected few are qualified to be offered at the altar. These graded degrees of holiness further show how the Jewish people conceive their symbolic world and conduct their daily activities accordingly (Douglas 1966).

To understand food and eating, Douglas asserted, one has to decipher how a meal is arranged and consumed as a “patterned activity.” A meal is not merely food eating but rather a social event. Like language, it is expressed in “syntagmatic relations” the basic element of which is a “gastronomic morpheme,” the mouthful (Douglas 1975:251-53). In people’s daily life, for example, breakfast, lunch, and dinner are socio-culturally understood in temporal sequence, and the meaning of each is deciphered in relation to one another. The weekly meals, which are specially regarded, are held in contrast to and on the basis of the daily ones. And the annual celebrations of certain feasts are further ceremonially prepared and enjoyed by communal recognition and participation. All these meals, whichever graded level each may fall upon, define themselves in structured relations (Douglas 1975:258-59). As to the components of a meal, it is customary in western society to contain the two-part solids and liquids. The solids, although their ingredients and ways of cooking may be different, are also structured according to the identities of the participants. They are

normally offered to and shared by family members and invited guests, in contrast to drinks that are unstructured and could be given to strangers (Douglas 1975). All in all, food and eating represent a system of communication, and their meaning is metonymical. Their function lies in establishing an order in the midst of disorder, which is vital to a community's integrity and survival.

Claude Fischler's (1980, 1988) theory focuses on the dialectic relationship between food and human identity. He presupposed that human species are omnivorous and, as such, are prone to constantly searching for new edibles due to biological needs. On the other hand, "taxonomic doubt," caused either by the habit of eating stable, rigid diets as witnessed in an isolated agricultural society or by "gastro-anomy" in modern industrialized society where snacking culture is prevalent, makes humans suspect foodstuffs of unknown sources. To resolve the dilemma between "neophilia" and "neophobia," he argued, people invent different culinary systems to incorporate the new and strange materials. In this sense, cookery functions to tame the wild; it is a mechanism that transforms nature into culture, making the raw and the unknown familiar in the human world. Echoing Mary Douglas' concept that purity and edibility are synonymous, Fischler asserted that by classifying food into categories and giving rules to cooking and eating, humans create a world of order wherein also lies their identity. Indeed, as he strongly claimed, "We become what we eat" (Fischler 1988:279) and "Food makes the eater" (Fischler 1988:282).

Although with different emphases, the theories by Douglas and Fischer seem to converge at three interrelated points. First, food itself is by no means meaning-neutral. It always carries an arbitrary and symbolic meaning the understanding of which is intimately tied to the social and cultural context in which it is generated, particularly in the culinary culture or system a group of people have established. Second, food and its consumption are a social activity, and their expression is patterned or structured. They represent a collective effort to communicate within a group of people who share the same symbolic universe. Third, once the communication takes effect, it further strengthens the existed world of order and endows people attached to this world with a sense of identity. These theoretical insights, to my mind, are inspiring, but in what way and to what extent they can be applied to the understanding and interpretation of food fellowship in a Chinese Christian community remains to be tested.

Cases of the True Jesus Church

I have been frequently attending church services affiliated with different denominations in the US and Asian countries, paying special heed to how the church members mutually interact and, as well, greet the first comers. How a church and its

members express themselves is admittedly related to their theology, service format, church convention, members' background, and social custom. But a church's attitude toward its own members and toward the visitors, either cold, warm, or enthusiastic, it seems to me, crucially affects its development. My recent visits to some TJC local churches in China, all thriving, compelled me to look for explanatory elements in the cultural sphere. Food fellowship, among others, appeared to me very prominent when I examined how these churches have been quickly expanding. Here is a vignette I noted down in April 2013 when I stayed at Endian Church in L City for my field work. It tells about the scene when the congregants gathered to enjoy the Sabbath lunch meal:

I noticed that in southern Jiangsu province, almost all churches like this one that belong to the TJC denomination have a spacious dining area. And its location, accommodation, and kitchen facilities are always heated conversations for the local church leaders who plan to construct or purchase a chapel or a meeting site. After Endian Church had bought the present property, it inherited a small kitchen adjacent to the factory building. In order to accommodate three to four hundred members at the meal hour, however, it constructed a shelter-like roof along the wall that divides it from its neighbor and set up tables and benches for that purpose. The whole dining site appeared simple and crude, but the congregants were happy about what they saw. After the morning service was over, it was close to noon. Sisters of today's cooking team had prepared the meal. They put two huge pots containing *fan* (cooked rice) at the entrance area, in addition to a big barrel of hot soup standing ready at the corner and against the wall. They also laid out four dishes of *cai* on each table. Congregants quickly moved from the chapel to the dining area and filled the empty seats around the table. When they began to eat, they individually said a thanksgiving prayer first and then warmly invited one another to the tables to share the food. They quickly raised their rice bowl and extended their chopsticks to the dishes, showing joyous and content countenances. Those who were not able to sit around the tables due to lack of seats, especially the youths and women with children, were holding their own rice bowls covered with *cai* and savoring every mouthful in the parking space. At this moment, all the church members seemed to forget the difficulties they confronted and were immersed in the bliss of food fellowship.

Endian Church started its house meeting in 1993, with a core membership of no more than a dozen. With the increase of believers and "truth seekers," in the words of Sister Guan my informant, it moved quite a few times to larger private houses or rented apartments for better accommodation. But the members' gatherings often

incurred protests from the neighbors because of noises caused by praying and hymn singing. These complaints drew local police's interferences and they were often forced to run and hide. Thanks to the "miraculous" help from God, according to Sister Guan, they finally purchased the present location, a bankrupt factory, in 2008 with a very cheap price. Now the congregation exceeded three hundreds. Through a long process of negotiation with local authorities, they were allowed to hold religious activities at the present site, with regular supervisory visits from government officials.

The members of Endian Church, including Sister Guan herself, are mostly migrant workers and their families from northern Jiangsu. To search for a better life, they moved down to L City, located at the flourishing Yangtze Delta, to try their fortune. Although they worked hard, low wages and the precarious nature of their jobs have often made their life insecure. A few church members from Fujian province are financially better-off, as they are owners of small factories in the aluminum industry. Some of them run their own shops, selling construction materials. In a booming but highly competitive market, however, they also work day and night to keep their business running at the expense of family life and church attendance. During my stay at Endian Church, I once joined Sister Guan and her fellow workers' visit to these "backsliding" members. I was impressed by the constant interruptions of our conversations either from their employees or mobile phone calls. At that moment Sister Guan showed me an awkward smile, hinting that I should understand what she had told me about some of the difficulties the church was currently facing.

Because of the members' general living situation, the occasions when they are able to appear at the church become all the more cherished. In particular on the Sabbath Day, a holy day greatly honored by TJC, the church leaders would host activities to bring their members firmly together. Besides the two formal services, one in the morning and one in the afternoon, when the congregation gathers to listen to the sermons, pray, and sing hymns, lunch fellowship features most conspicuously. This is the time when the church can show its love and care toward its members. It is also an event that involves all the church members regardless the different degrees of their faith. On this occasion, guests or first comers are warmly invited to sit around the table. Those who have recently less attended the church, if found showing up, are particularly welcomed. I heard Sister Guan, when she saw some church members hurrying away after the morning service to attend their own business, shouting their names and insisting that they finish the meal before leaving. The occasion was a bit chaotic, as sounds and responding actions simultaneously broke out and intermingled. But it was unmistakable that the atmosphere of the communal eating was hilarious and convivial, exhibiting an inclusive and soothing spirit.

Endian Church is by no means unique in its practice of food fellowship. Others like Panwang Church and Fengfu Church also manage it in a comparable fashion although in different living contexts. Panwang Church is situated in B City, a city larger than L City but has been similarly flourishing owing to booming economy. Most members of the church are young adults in their twenties or thirties, and a few such as its able and experienced leader, Sister Dong, are older. They came, again, from northern Jiangsu to the new place as hire hands, leading a hopeful but difficult life. I was struck by the dilapidated two-story meeting house they rented in a slummy quarter when I paid them my first visit in July 2011. The house was packed on the Sabbath, and during the service hours, I was afraid that the ramshackle might fall apart. While the sermon was going, some church sisters were simultaneously preparing the lunch in a kitchenette adjacent to the assembly room. Once in a while, tinkling and clinking of kitchen utensils broke the otherwise solemn silence. The air was suffused with appetizing smell of the cooked dishes when the sermon was drawing to its end. After the concluding prayer was over, the church members moved fast to fetch their own bowl and filled it with *fan* and *cai*. They found whatever space available and, either sitting or standing, began eating their meal. The lunch activity seemed to be understood as a formal part of the Sabbath Day service, as evidenced by the smoothness and spontaneity with which the congregation conducted their movements. I, as a guest, was invited to sit at the only table and enjoyed the meal with the church board members. The delicious food stood in sharp contrast to the shabby appearance of the building, yet for Panwang Church members, the former seemed to be much weightier than the latter.

When I returned to Panwang Church again in July 2014, it had moved to the fourth floor of a newly constructed building that contain eight rooms, not including the main hall that is able to accommodate more than two hundred worshippers. Sister Dong proudly introduced me to the new site, while at the same time bearing testimonies to how divine grace had brought many new members to the saved ark and how God had paved the way for the church to successfully own this location. She specifically led me to the kitchen, pointing to the modern facilities with which it was equipped. She was satisfied that the church could now more conveniently prepare food and, on account of it, welcome more outsiders to the church community.

Fengfu Church in P City began its meeting in 1994 and purchased its present compound in the suburban area in 2007. Compared with the two aforementioned churches which have undergone local governments' surveillance and even suppression from time to time, this one is fortunate to have developed without too many obstacles. That it occupies a great piece of land and stands next to a government's building

bespeaks its relatively stable relationship with the local authority. Sister Ying, its leader and my informant, has witnessed its growth from a handful of people to a congregation of eight hundred members. From my first interview with her in July 2011, the second one in August 2012, to the third one in July 2014, I was impressed by her and her co-workers' effort to manage their church to be a center that coordinates eight meeting points in the vicinity. Fengfu Church has indeed become a gathering point not only for the church members spreading around P City, but also an important center that often hosts training programs of various kinds for TJC in southern Jiangsu.

Two thirds of Fengfu Church's members are immigrants, and only one third are native residents. Among the former, many are students who come from different parts of the country to P City to attend local universities or colleges. To manage the huge congregation, Sister Ying explained to me, the church organizes all of its members into fellowship groups according to age, hence the Old People's Fellowship, Pillar Fellowship, Social Youth Fellowship, and Student Fellowship. When these fellowships meet at the church, they hold activities that include Bible study, prayer, choir rehearsal, special lectures, etc. What is crucial during or after the activities is food sharing. And for that purpose, Fengfu Church has partitioned a large space as the dining area, in addition to constructing a clean, well-equipped kitchen. As I was conversing with Sister Ying right in the dining room and had quite a few meals with her and other church leaders there, I could see the geographical centrality of this particular spot and understand the importance it assumes in the process of the church's growth.

The local TJCs in Taiwan have laid equal, if not more, emphasis on food and eating in managing their congregation and attracting new comers. Take Ankang Church, for example, a church I have frequently attended. The church is located at the outskirts of metropolitan Taipei. As finding a piece of land upon which to construct a spacious chapel is beyond its financial power because of the extremely expensive real estate, it is housed in an apartment building. Its members include Han the majority and two other ethnic minorities, Amis and Atayal. Their socio-economic backgrounds vary widely, from construction workers, security guards, shop keepers to computer engineers and university professors. Although demographically diverse, they get along well in a caring and congenial spirit. One often sees enthusiastic participation from the members whenever church activities such as training programs and evangelical meetings take place. The harmonious relationships and fervency have made the church admirable, and visitors from other church communities often come and take it as a model to emulate.

Ankang church also holds two services on the Sabbath, one in the morning and the other in the afternoon, and the number of attendees has maintained an average of one hundred to one hundred and twenty. The church members come to observe the morning service at ten thirty, which normally lasts an hour and half to finish. As the main part of the service is a long sermon, attendees have developed a spirit of listening in quietude and devoutness. After it is ended and administrative reports have been announced, a young brother or sister is assigned to say grace for the lunch, particularly thanking the hands that have prepared today's meal. Then and there the relatively solemn and serious atmosphere would change to a lively one. The congregants begin to greet each other, particularly calling names of those whom they have not seen for some while to show their good will. As the congregants slowly leave the assembly room, many of the members politely pat others' shoulders, pull those intimate friends by their hand, and encourage one another to move to the dining area.

Ankang Church has four cooking teams which take monthly turns to prepare the lunch meal for the congregation. The team members are mostly middle-aged housewives headed by Sister Zhou. If a month happens to have a fifth week, it is the young adults, male and female included, who are responsible for the cooking job. On the Sabbath, the team members have to get up early and go to the market to buy the foodstuffs with which they have planned to make *cai*. With a limited budget, 3,500 NTD (roughly 110 USD), as Sister Zhou revealed to me, they are careful in selecting the right, inexpensive materials available. If the expenditure exceeds what is officially set, they either apply for reimbursement or, as most of them would do, simply pay from their own pocket and regard it as a way of offering. After bringing the foodstuffs back to the church, they have to wash, cut, stew or fry them and get five, six, or even seven dishes ready at the table before the noon time. Sometimes I poked into the kitchen, often finding the busy cooks moving with adroitness and attentiveness as though driven by an invisible task master.

When the hungry congregants come to the dining area, they, upon seeing the delicious dishes, usually voice light-hearted praises. After tasting the *fan* and *cai*, many of them, like experienced gourmets, would evaluate their different gustatory and olfactory qualities. They further make comparisons among the different Sabbath Day meals they have enjoyed in the past weeks, as if implicitly pressing the cooking teams into competition. But the cooking team members are happy to receive the congregation's responses, always congratulatory and thankful, and would politely ask everyone to consume all the food they prepared. And that, as they customarily express, is the highest complement. In this way the Sabbath lunch at Ankang Church is not an ordinary meal but rather a weekly feast, as indeed many church members and visitors

have repeatedly aired such an opinion. That is also why many late comers who have missed the morning service would positively show up at the dining table, an event they often feel physically and spiritually gratifying.

The local TJC leaders in Taiwan are aware of the importance of food fellowship in uniting the congregation and inviting “truth seekers.” Therefore they are very willing to spend resources on this activity. Table 1 shows Ankang Church’s food-related expenditures in the ten-year period of 2005-2014,¹⁰ in contrast to the amounts spent by Zhengbin Church,¹¹ located in northern Taiwan, and Dalin Church,¹² located in southern Taiwan. It is hard to compare them based upon their respective pure numbers owing to different congregational sizes and incomes, but it is significant to note that substantial percentages of money are spent on eating (an average of 12.62% for Ankang, 11.40% for Zhengbin, and 26.53% for Dalin¹³) and that in this regard they are generally increasing in the past years. Further, as Zhengbin Church is presently constructing its new church building and Dalin Church, too, is about to do the same thing, spaces reserved for dining hall and kitchen at these two churches are impressive. Table 2 indicates that Zhengbin’s new church will have a space for the eating purposes (dining hall and kitchen combined) 1.3 times larger than that of the main chapel. As for Dalin’s new church, space for preparing food and eating and space for worship gathering are almost equal in size. These concrete pieces of evidence well substantiate my observations about the practices of food fellowship at Taiwan’s TJCs described above.¹⁴

(Table 1 here)

(Table 2 here)

As far as food fellowship is concerned, the TJCs across the Taiwan Strait, although burgeoning in different socio-political contexts, share some common, interconnected features. These features are also elements that contribute to the cohesiveness among the church members, as well as to the attractiveness to the possible converts. First, the local TJCs rely heavily upon food and communal eating as a strategy to grow. This leaning toward or emphasis on corporeality and its enjoyment does not defeat but co-exist with the fact that TJC, a

¹⁰ Ankang Church provided me its data on May 25, 2015.

¹¹ Zhengbin Church provided me its data on May 27, 2015.

¹² Dalin Church provided me its data on May 9, 2015.

¹³ As Dalin Church explained to me, because it has become a regional center, akin to the status of Fengfu Church in China, where activities and meetings of many kinds have taken place, it has financially allotted a large portion to the preparation of food. This is why very high percentages of food expenditure appear in the data in the past five years.

¹⁴ Brother Su, architect who designed for these two churches, provided me the data on May 6, 2015.

Pentecostal-Charismatic denomination (Tsai 2015), regards spiritual experience most highly. Second, the local TJC's manage their congregation after the model of a family in which caring, affection, and intimacy of human relationship are promoted and practiced. To many of TJC's members, the church is unmistakably a family writ large. Third, female members of the local TJC's are the foremost agents who prepare food and arrange its distribution. They assume a critical role in moving and shaping the course of the church's development. These characteristics are important for us to bear in mind when we bring our cases into theoretical discussion.

Discussion

When we concentrate on the topic of contemporary Chinese Christianity, we deal with complex elements related to Christian religion, Chinese culture, and different local social, economic, and political contexts in "greater" China. What I have presented in the preceding section about food and communal eating at TJC's local churches across the Taiwan Strait may appear preponderantly Chinese. That is, it all has something to do with traditional Chinese *fan-cai* components and, as well, Chinese way of management in a family-like style. In what sense, then, is it Christian? Can we find specifically Christian factors in our case study? Indeed, food and communal eating are prevalent in world religions, and in Chinese society, sharing meal sacrificed to local deities has been a long-time practice in folk or popular religions (Overmyer 1986: 70, 85). In this connection, food fellowship at the church can be easily identified as another festive celebration of a local god's birthday. But this contradicts the self-understanding of the church members who would insist that their belief and practice of food fellowship is rooted in the biblical teachings and that it is entirely Christian rather than Chinese.

To reconcile the perspectival discrepancies, I detected that the Eucharist or Holy Communion is a pertinent gateway to start with theologically and practically. The Eucharist has been part and parcel of Christianity since the origination of this religion. In the past two millennia, it has gone through various theological interpretations and liturgical transformations, depending upon which denomination took it into deliberation (Bernas, 2002; Jung 2006; Hellwig 2005; Power 2002; Wandel 2006). In sum, the Catholic Church stresses the liturgical power of the Eucharist that is believed to transubstantiate the blessed bread and wine into Christ's presence. Protestantism, on the other hand, regards the celebration of the sacrament as anamnesis, a memorial act that recalls the suffering, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ. Both of these two Christian mainstreams, however, agree that the significance of this Christian rite lies in urging the Christians to reflect on and realize Christ's sacrificial love and, as well, to remain in unity (Hellwig 2005: 2877-78; Levering 2005:11-28).

Relevant to our consideration are the initial layers of composition of the Eucharist which, in the process of its formation, evolved into oblivion in the orthodox liturgical theology toward the end of the second century. According to the Synoptic traditions, Jesus and his disciples, as their Jewish custom would have it, celebrated the Passover and had the seder meal together (Mark 14:12-16; Mathew 26:17-19; Luke 22:7-13). It was a time for the Jews to commemorate the saving grace which the Lord had bestowed upon their ancestors in the mighty act of delivering them from bondage in Egypt. The prescribed paschal lamb, unleavened bread, and other foodstuffs were to be consumed while holding the feast by a family (Exodus 12: 1-14). One could see on this occasion a mixed feeling of excitement, gratitude, and pensive sadness (Robinson 2000: 118-125; Schauss 1962: 77-85), yet it was positive that the concrete edibles helped lead the participants to a realm of higher spirituality.

The Passover meal coincided with the last meal Jesus had with his disciples. The early Christian tradition which the Apostle Paul had inherited combined the two but purposefully shifted its focus from the former to the latter (1 Corinthians 11: 23-26). Now the Last Supper was held to commemorate the death of Jesus, the sacrificial lamb, who died for the sins of humanity. It was one step further proclaimed as the Lords' Supper or the Lord's Table, a meal that emphasized not the consumption of physical but symbolic bread and juice. In the relationship of the "new covenant," what the dish and cup contained were no longer ordinary food but the flesh and blood of Jesus (1 Corinthians 11: 24-27). Here Christ's corporeality was still maintained, but the original food imagery disappeared from the scene. When the Lord's Supper was instituted as the Eucharist, as a sacrament, it informed Christians of its spiritual meaning through ceremonial act. On this occasion participants gathered only to eat symbolically. Jesus Christ, God's incarnation, was thus divested of his physical body. What remained to be learned about the Eucharist were sacrifice, love, and unity, all spiritual virtues without material faces.

The TJC formulates its theology in the Protestant tradition. It holds the Holy Communion, along with Water Baptism and Footwashing, in high esteem, regarding it as one of the three sacraments that Jesus Christ himself established and commanded his disciples to observe (True Jesus Church 2007: 89). It is celebrated at every local church twice a year during spiritual convocations respectively in spring and fall. According to TJC's official explanation of its basic beliefs, the Holy Communion "can never be regarded as a usual, ordinary diet, or else God will execute judgment (1 Corinthians 11:29, 30)" (Yang 1970: 137). Rather, it is "a spiritual fellowship" of those already baptized and recognized as church members (True Jesus Church 2007: 93). In other words, guests, "truth seekers," and even Christian friends of other

denominations are not qualified to partake of the sacramental meal. The meaning of the Holy Communion, the TJC advocates, lies in commemorating the suffering and death of Jesus Christ. Through the ceremonial reenactment, participants are reminded of his salvific grace, as God brought the same to the ancient Israelites. It is something like a mystery, because those who join the spiritual fellowship can anticipate the future resurrection after death (1 Corinthians 11:26; Revelation 19:7-9) or an eternal life (John 6:53-56) (Yang 1970: 134). What is beyond doubt about the central message of the Holy Communion for the church members is that, in imitation of Christ, they should be humble, serve one another, and unite as one body (1 Corinthians 10:17; 12:12-27) (True Jesus Church 2007:98).

Many theologians affirm the sacral nature of the Eucharist or Holy Communion, as TJC's official stance does. They call it a "holy eating" (Jung 2006: 131) and warn the Christians not to treat it as a "fraternal banquet" (Levering 2005: 26). To my mind, although the liturgical performance of this Christian rite may create a sacred aura and hence help maintain the authority of the sacerdotal system, whether or not it facilitates the growth of the church is highly disputable. Once the material dimension of the Holy Communion is missing, what kind of experience in real life can the Christians identify to comprehend the Eucharistic "mystery"? To put the question reversely, in what way can the eating of the "flesh and blood" of Jesus Christ evoke similar experience among the Christians, or Chinese Christians for that matter, in their practical life, if its spiritual teachings like humility, service, love, and unity are simultaneously imparted and demanded? Our introduction to the different TJC cases can challenge the conventional theological position and offer a new perspective.

As far as I can observe, the majority of the local TJC members are lower-middle class people with limited education; this is more obvious in China than in Taiwan. They work hard, harboring the hope to gain a stable life particularly in the new and competitive urban environment, as the members of Endian, Panwang, and Fengfu have testified. Entering the TJC, they find empowerment and consolation in their charismatic experiences like speaking in tongues and miraculous healings (Tsai 2015). On the other hand, they are also practical people. Food and its consumption are certainly their daily necessities, but where and with whom they eat are also important. They find that the church provides a setting where they can comfortably dine. This is because, first, the church functions like a large family with participants of comparable backgrounds. To many members who are singles, migrants, or underprivileged struggling in an alienated society, it proves to be an attractive place to come and stay. Second, the *fan* and *cai* are carefully prepared, like the case of Ankang, which to many are more than an ordinary meal. The Sabbath Day lunch is a festive treat, as a

matter of fact. The gastrointestinal enjoyment here is not a small business. Third, the food fellowship is easy to access. It does not have boundaries that divide or exclude whoever wants to enter. On the contrary, it is meant to eliminate any barrier and welcome church members and non-church members alike. Fourth, it is managed prominently by middle-aged sisters whose motherly characteristics usually soften an otherwise rigidly organized church body. Their leadership runs smoothly not by rules or commands but by caring through food preparation and distribution.

At this juncture, one clearly sees a gap between the Protestant theology of the Holy Communion or the one upheld by TJC and its realization in local churches. On one level, what is appealing to ordinary members is the physical consumption of food. Hence the original layer of the Holy Communion, that is, the Passover meal when and where the paschal lamb and unleavened bread are served at a Jewish family, appears to tally well with their practical experience. That by partaking of Jesus' flesh and blood one has the hope of eternal life may remain a mystery forever for most of the local TJC members. On another level, however, the ordinary TJC members absorb other spiritual teachings with sensitive mind. They understand what love, care, service, and unity mean when the preacher expounds them in association with the celebration of the Holy Communion. On quite a few occasions I saw the congregation moved to tears when the suffering of Jesus was narrated and his sacrificial love was portrayed. So with respect to this part of the Holy Communion, there is no better realization of it than in the communal event of the Sabbath lunch. Through being a preparer, a distributor, or a consumer, the church members easily catch its spiritual implications on account of their bodily engagement. And this blending of the practical and the spiritual pertinently reflects the double identity of the local TJC members who, as Chinese and as Christians, live in contemporary "greater" China.

If the analysis above makes sense, we can further refer it to the theories proffered by Mary Douglas and Claude Fischler. I fully subscribe to both theoreticians' insight that food itself is not an isolated item but rather a meaning-laden system. Like language, it has its own "syntagmatic relations" the interpretation of which relies upon the context in which it is generated. I also agree that a meal is not equal to food eating; rather, it is a social event imbedded in a temporal-spatial web. It is constructed by people who share similar symbolic universe and, on account of it, obtain their identity. These inspiring ideas of theirs compel us to examine food and food eating from a broader perspective, reminding us of the importance of relating the subject particularly to social and cultural dimensions.

It seems to me that the structuralist approach adopted by Douglas and Fischler appears restrictive and rigid. Their overemphasis on “patterned” or “structured” mode of perception may encounter difficulties when it comes to our study of Chinese Christian community. In the first place, taxonomic categorization of food in Judaism or in other religions does not apply to Chinese culinary culture. The distinction between clean and unclean foods as a reflection of “purity and danger,” as Douglas advocated, or the equation of purity and edibility, as Fischler asserted, does not exist in the Chinese world of cognition. On the contrary, because of the propensity to tasting whatever edible, the Chinese culinary culture opts for intermingling different kinds of food. As the “*fan-cai* principle” makes it clear, it is not the ingredients but how to cook them that distinguishes a specific cuisine from others. This mixing or synthesizing quality, further, facilitates communal participation to a wider and quicker degree. My field work tells that not a single member of those who came to the Sabbath lunch cared about whether the meal was vegetarian or prepared according to certain dietary codes. To the Chinese Christians, just like to other non-Christian Chinese, the more variegated the food ingredients are, the more welcomed they appear. The lowering or elimination of boundaries in this regard makes easier access for whoever comes to the church and participates in the meal event.

In a true sense, food serves as a gateway for the local TJC members to consolidate their congregation and attract possible converts. And if food itself exhibits a mixing characteristic, so does the commensal activity. Although I mentioned that the majority of the local TJC members in China are from the lower-middle class, more and more new members of middle class background, in particular in Shanghai and Taipei, have joined the church. When they gather to eat, no priority is given to specific individuals except, according to Chinese custom, the elderly and the guests. They each help themselves by filling their bowls with cooked rice and whatever *cai* prepared. They sit or stand casually and chat with other fellow members while eating. The amalgamation of sounds and actions creates a receptive environment for the food sharers to get immersed in enjoyment. The human agents and the warm atmosphere they create appear very crucial, as long as I can observe, because it is they who manifest the effect of food and validate its public consumption. My personalist approach, which highlights persons as creators and experiencers, here stands in contrast to Douglas and Fischler’s theoretical stance.

Last but by no means least, Douglas and Fischler’s structuralist approach also ignores the role women play in producing and managing food in a religious community. My case study indicates that middle-aged female members, as church leaders and cooks, are indispensable in shaping and guiding the local TJC members. They may

not be as knowledgeable about the Bible as the preachers, mostly male, and therefore do not exert their influence from the pulpit. Nor are they proficient in church organization which is necessary in combating the social and political pressure. Many of them, however, act as a traditional, motherly figure in preparing food and distributing it to the entire congregation. They engage themselves in the kitchen and start actions from the members' basic needs. In a community like the TJC where female members take up much higher proportion than male, their role functions decisively in the rapid development of local churches. I affirm that so far as the issue of food fellowship and the making of a Chinese church is concerned, this gender factor is something we should always take seriously.

Conclusion

My concern in this paper is, in view of the rapid growth of Christianity in contemporary China, to explore what this "Christianity with Chinese characteristics" may appear to be. I singled out food fellowship as the focus of examination, regarding it as one of the most prominent features that contrast Chinese Christian communities with those outside of "greater" China. To illustrate my point, I relied upon the data I collected from my field work in different local TJC churches across the Taiwan Strait. My analysis shows that food fellowship functions as a pivot that internally pulls the congregation into a cohesive whole and externally attracts the new comers to join the church community.

Interpreting my finding, I noted that we should look into the two major sources, Chinese and Christian, of the food fellowship under discussion. Food, in the form of *fan* and *cai*, and the different ways of cooking it have taken a highly important position in Chinese culture. How and on what occasions a family members share food are also crucial to their interaction, integration, and cultural transmission. On the Christian side, the earliest layer in the composition of the Eucharist or the Holy Communion originated from the Jewish seder meal. It was and still is celebrated with concrete, physical food and collective eating in and by a Jewish family to commemorate the Exodus event. The Protestant sacramental theology, which the TJC generally agrees with, has reduced it to a symbolic, ceremonial performance but kept its spiritual significance with emphasis on humility, sacrifice, care, and unity. The Chinese Christians, as seen from the local TJC members, cherish the opportunity of eating together at the church, as it has become harder and rarer for a family to practice in a busy, disintegrating urban environment. But unlike a Chinese religious feast in relation to celebrating a local deity's birthday, the participation in the Sabbath Day meal restores the origin of the Holy Communion and physically realizes its spiritual

teachings. The synthesis of these two, Chinese culture and Christian theology, is worthy of our attention.

With respect to theoretical consideration, I resorted to the insights brought about by Mary Douglas and Claude Fischler. On the one hand, as they emphasized, I agreed that food should be treated as a system of communication and as a social event, hence the importance of viewing it in a larger context of human interactions. On the other hand, however, I found that their structuralist perspective has its limits and is disputable when applied to our interpretation of Chinese Christian community. In contrast, my personalist approach lays weight on the human agents who participate in the food fellowship either as a preparer, a distributor, or just a consumer. Their involvement in the food event in creating Durkheimian effervescence has abolished the boundaries that divide food categories and human classes. The conglomeration, informed by Chinese familial ideal and established by Christian love, equality, and devotion, is precisely the desirable context in which the church members found their physical enjoyment and spiritual solace simultaneously. In this sense, I would argue that food fellowship suitably characterizes contemporary Chinese Christianity and that it has substantially contributed to the rapid growth of many Christian churches across the Taiwan Strait.

I want to conclude with adding some words about similar practices of food fellowship in Western society from a comparable perspective. They may hint at possible directions which we can pursue in the future. Many churches in the US have long recognized the bonding effect of food sharing. In this regard, a popular activity in a church is to hold a potluck party. It is indeed a loving, convivial occasion where each family prepares a dish and brings it to the church to share. Participants take that opportunity to eat together and, through chatting and interactions, enhance mutual relationship. A commensality of this type, however, differs from what I described in this paper. The church potluck, it seems to me, emphasizes equal contribution, presupposing individuality and subjectivity of each family. Moreover, the process of preparing each dish is a private act; it lacks the dimension of collective engagement in a kitchen. But undoubtedly the potluck event and its effect closely resemble my case study, and they need to be examined by looking into the different contexts in which they take place. The other oft-seen charity program is preparing food for the homeless at a shelter in freezing winter. The activity is usually held in a church building. On this occasion, food, particularly hot soup, is prepared for those hungry, cold street people who come to seek refuge. For the Christian community, as the giver, it is an opportunity to engage in the society in the manner of philanthropy. For the homeless, as the receiver, they accept other's food in order to survive. The distinction between

the subject and the object is obvious in this context, but as a social event, it reveals a special web of human relationships at that specific moment against an alienated modern world. A food fellowship of this kind also deserves our further investigation. Lastly, a recent scholarly interest in food and its consumption, tentatively termed “theology of eating,” begins its concern about the wide-spread problems of eating disorder like bulimia and anorexia in the US. It sees global capitalism and consumerism as the source of the malaise. To redress the issue, it calls for a rethinking of the implications of the Holy Communion theologically and of the fairness of global distribution of food practically. In a spirit of ecumenical, philanthropic, and ecological engagement, it challenges us to take the subject of “food sharing” more creatively (Jung 2004, 2006). I judge that although the seriousness of eating disorder varies from place to place, the complicated knots it touches and the possible solutions the “theology of eating” has proposed is related to my discussion of food fellowship in the Chinese Christian community. At any rate, as Fischler’s quoting of Lévi-Strauss famous sentence indicates, “Food must not only be good to eat, but also good to think” (Fischler 1988: 284).

Table 1 Food Expenditure of Three Churches in Taiwan, 2005-2014

	Ankang Church			Zhengbin Church			Dalin Church		
Year	Total Expenditure	Food Expenditure	% of Food Expenditure	Total Expenditure	Food Expenditure	% of Food Expenditure	Total Expenditure	Food Expenditure	% of Food Expenditure
2005	1,549,896	122,415	7.9%	3,785,200	109,373	2.9%	1,376,904	262,890	19.1%
2006	2,820,569	246,994	8.8%	3,015,545	209,776	7.0%	2,241,339	335,916	15.0%
2007	2,133,506	173,472	8.1%	1,340,230	158,008	11.8%	1,649,430	390,548	23.7%
2008	1,816,293	223,073	12.3%	1,667,391	264,920	15.9%	2,939,499	459,694	15.6%
2009	1,871,309	284,070	15.2%	2,805,766	268,936	9.6%	2,757,433	558,471	20.3%
2010	1,874,852	298,490	15.9%	1,915,918	293,301	15.3%	2,185,741	636,901	29.1%
2011	2,262,608	318,031	14.1%	2,186,120	310,080	14.2%	1,573,223	620,114	39.4%
2012	2,127,003	395,137	18.6%	2,008,062	315,084	15.7%	2,257,549	632,107	28.0%
2013	3,498,683	368,391	10.5%	2,386,374	314,552	13.2%	1,740,722	707,240	40.6%
2014	2,369,426	388,292	16.4%	1,535,733	332,748	21.7%	2,198,645	945,475	43.0%
Total	22,324,145	2,818,365	12.6%	22,646,339	2,576,778	11.4%	20,920,485	5,549,356	26.5%

Table 2 Space Allotment of Chapel, Dining Hall, and Kitchen of Two Churches in Taiwan

Space (m ²)	Zhenbin Church	Dalin Church
Chapel	154.16	246.75
Dining Hall	181.02	206.04
Kitchen	19.32	28.59
Dining Hall and Kitchen	200.34	234.63
Ratio of Dining Hall and Kitchen to Chapel	1.30	0.95

Works Cited

- Aikman, David. 2003. *Jesus in Beijing: How Christianity Is Transforming China and Changing the Global Balance of Power*. Washington, DC: Regnery.
- Anderson, Jr. E. N. and Marja L. Anderson. 1977 "Modern China: South," in K. C. Chang, ed. *Food in Chinese Culture: Anthropological and Historical Perspectives*. London: Yale University Press. Pp. 319-382.
- Bays, Daniel H. 1995. "Indigenous Protestant Churches in China, 1900-1937: A Pentecostal Case Study." In *Indigenous Responses to Western Christianity*, edited by Steven Kaplan, pp. 124-143. New York: New York University Press.
- _____. 2003. "Chinese Protestant Christianity Today." *The China Quarterly* 174: 488-504.
- Bernas, C. 2002. "Eucharist," in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, ed. Thomas Carson. Washington D. C.: The Catholic University of America Press.
- Bowker, John. Ed. 1997. *The Oxford Dictionary of World Religions*. Oxford and NY: Oxford University Press.
- Bynum, Caroline W. 1987. *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley and Lodon: University of California Press.
- Chang, K. C. 1976. *Early Chinese Civilization: Anthropological Perspectives*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- _____. Ed. 1977. *Food in Chinese Culture: Anthropological and Historical Perspectives*. London: Yale University Press.
- Cox, Harvey. 1996. *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twentieth-First Century*. London: Cassell.
- Deng, Zhaoming. 2001. "Indigenous Chinese Pentecostal Denominations." *China Study Journal* 16.3:7-14.
- Denny, Frederick M. 1985. *An Introduction to Islam*. New York: Macmillan.
- Dirik, Arif. 1989. "Postsocialism? Reflections on 'socialism with Chinese characteristics.'" *Critical Asian Studies* 21: 33-44.
- Douglas, Mary. 1966 / 1984. *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- _____. "Deciphering a Meal," in *Implicit Meanings: Essays in Anthropology*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul. Pp. 249-275.
- _____. "Food as a System of Communication," in *In the Active Voice*. Routledge & Kegan Paul. Pp. 82-104.
- Dunch, Ryan F. 2001. "Protestant Christianity in China Today: Fragile, Fragmented, Flourishing." In Uhalley, Jr. Stephen and Wu, Xiaoxin, eds. *China and Christianity: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future*. Armonk, NY: ME Sharp. Pp.

195-216.

- Gernet, Jacques. 1962. *Daily Life in China on the Eve of the Mongol Invasion 1250-1276*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Hellwig, Monika K. 2005. "Eucharist," in *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. Lindsay Jones. Detroit: Macmillan.
- Hollenweger, Walter J. 1972. *The Pentecostals*. London: SCM.
- Hunter, Alan and Kin-kwong Chan. 1993. *Protestantism in Contemporary China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jordan, David. 1977. *Gods, Ghosts and Ancestors: The Folk Religion of a Taiwanese Village*. Berkeley and LA: University of California Press.
- Jung, L. Shannon. 2004. *Food for Life: The Spirituality and Ethics of Eating*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.
- _____. 2006. *Sharing Food: Christian Practices for Enjoyment*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.
- Latham, James E. 1987. "Food," in *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. Mircea Eliade. New York: Macmillan.
- Lee, Joseph Tse-Hei. 2007. "Christianity in Contemporary China: An Update." *Journal of Church & State*, 49.2: 277-304.
- Levering, Mathew. 2005. *Sacrifice and Community: Jewish Offering and Christian Eucharist*. Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Lian, Xi. 2008. "A Messianic Deliverance for Post-Dynastic China: The Launch of the True Jesus Church in the Early Twentieth Century." *Modern China* 34.4: 407-441.
- _____. 2011. *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China*. Religion in China: Survival and Revival under Communist Rule. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Link, Perry. 2015. "What It Means to Be Chinese: Nationalism and Identity in Xi's China." *Foreign Affairs* 94.3: 25-31.
- Martin, David. 2002. *Pentecostalism: The World their Parish*. Oxford, UK and Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.
- Mennell, Stephen, Anne Murcott, and Anneke H. van Otterloo. 1992. *The Sociology of Food: Eating, Diet and Culture*. London: Sage.
- Michaels, Axel. 2004. *Hinduism: Past and Present*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- Miller, Donald E. and Tetsunao Yamamori. 2007. *Global Pentecostalism: The New Face of Christian Social Engagement*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Robinson, George. 2000. *Essential Judaism: A Complete Guide to Beliefs, Customs, and Rituals*. New York: Pocket Books.

- Overmyer, Daniel L. 1986. *Religions of China: The World as a Living System*. San Francisco: Harper & Row.
- Power, D. N. 2002. "Eucharist in Contemporary Catholic Tradition," In *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, ed. Thomas Carson. Washington D. C.: The Catholic University of America Press.
- Schauss, Hayyim. 1962. **The Jewish Festivals: History and Observance**. New York: Schocken Books.
- Smith, Jonathan Z. Ed. 1995. *The HarperCollins Dictionary of Religion*. San Francisco: Harper San Francisco.
- Synan, Vinsion. 1997. *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*. Grand Rapids, MI and Cambridge, UK: Eerdmans.
- Tang, Hongbiao 唐紅飆. 2006. *A Research on the History of the True Jesus Church* 《真耶穌教會史迹考》. Beijing: Chinese Culture.
- Thompson, Stuart E. 1988. "Death, Food, and Fertility," in James L. Watson and Evelyn J. Rawski, eds. *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*. Berkeley: University of California Press. Pp. 71-108.
- True Jesus Church. 2007. *Our Basic Beliefs Explained*. Anaheim, CA: True Jesus Church Department of Literary Ministry.
- True Jesus Church. International Assembly website:
<http://members.tjc.org/sites/en/home.aspx> (accessed June 16, 2015)
- True Jesus Church. United States General Assembly website:
<http://www.tjc.org/landing.aspx> (accessed June 16, 2015)
- Tsai, Yen-zen. 2015. "Glossolalia and Church Identity: The Role of Sound in the Making of a Chinese Pentecostal-Charismatic Church." *Review of Religion and Chinese Society* 2: 87-108.
- Wandel, Lee Palmer. 2006. *The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wang, Huiji 王惠姬. 2005. *A History of the True Jesus Church* 《真耶穌教會史》. Taichung: Unpublished Manuscript.
- Yang, Fenggang. 2012. *Religion in China: Survival and Revival under Communist Rule*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Yang, John. 1970. *The Essential Doctrines in the Holy Bible*. Taichung: The General Assembly of the True Jesus Church in Taiwan.
- Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/True_Jesus_Church (accessed June 16, 2015)
- Youwei. 2015. "The End of Reform in China." *Foreign Affairs* 94.3: 2-7.

Works Cited

- Bays, Daniel H. 1995. "Indigenous Protestant Churches in China, 1900-1937: A Pentecostal Case Study." In *Indigenous Responses to Western Christianity*. Edited by Steven Kaplan, 124-43. New York: New York University Press.
- _____. 2003 "Chinese Protestant Christianity Today." *The China Quarterly* 174: 488-504.
- Cox, Harvey. 1995. *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-first Century*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Deng, Zhaoming. 2005. "Indigenous Chinese Pentecostal Denominations." In *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia*. Eds. Allan Anderson and Edmond Tang. Oxford, UK and Costa Mesa, USA: Regnum.
- Duara, Prasenjit. 2013. "The Cold War and the Imperialism of Nation-States." In *The Oxford handbook of the Cold War*. Eds. Richard H. Immerman and Petra Goedde. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 86-104.
- Immerman, Richard H. and Petra Goedde. 2013. "Introduction." In *The Oxford handbook of the Cold War*. Eds. Richard H. Immerman and Petra Goedde. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Iriye, Akira. 2013. "Historicizing the Cold War." In *The Oxford handbook of the Cold War*. Eds. Richard H. Immerman and Petra Goedde. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 15-31.
- Jenkins, Philip. 2002. *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.
- Katz, Paul R. 2003. "Religion and the State in Post-war Taiwan." In *Religion in China Today*. Ed. Daniel L. Overmyer. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Pp. 89-106.
- Kuo, Cheng-tian. 2008. *Religion and Democracy in Taiwan*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Lian, Xi. 2008. "A Messianic Deliverance for Post-Dynastic China: The Launch of the True Jesus Church in the Early Twentieth Century." *Modern China* 34.4: 407-441.
- _____. 2010. *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Lin, Benxuan 林本炫. 1990. *Taiwan de zhengjiao chongtu* 台灣的政教衝突. Taipei: Daoxiang.
- Lin, Guoxian 林果顯. 2008. *1950 niandai fangong dalu xuanchuantizhi de xingcheng* 1950 年代反攻大陸宣傳體制的形成. Taipei : PhD dissertation. Department of

- History, National Chengchi University.
- Martin, David. 1990. *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America*. Oxford, UK and Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.
- Mitter, Rana. 2013. "China and the Cold War." In *The Oxford handbook of the Cold War*. Eds. Richard H. Immerman and Petra Goedde. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 124-140.
- Rubinstein, Murray A. 1991. *The Protestant Community on Modern Taiwan: Mission, Seminary, and Church*. Armonk: M. E. Sharpe.
- _____. 1994. "The New Testament Church and the Taiwanese Protestant Community." In *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*. Ed. Murray A. Rubinstein. New York: M. E. Sharpe. Pp. 445-473.
- Sawatzky, Sheldon. 1981. "State-Church Conflict in Taiwan: Its Historical Roots and Contemporary Manifestations." *Missiology* 9.4: 449-463.
- Taylor, Jay. 2009. *The Generalissimo: Chiang Kai-shek and the Struggle for Modern China*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Tien, Hung-hao. 1989. *The Great Transition: Political and Social Change in the Republic of China*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- True Jesus Church. *Our Basic Beliefs Explained*. Anaheim, CA: True Jesus Church Department of Literary Ministry, 2007.
- Wang, Huiji 王惠姬 2005. *Zhen yesu jiaohui shi* 真耶穌教會史。Taichung: Unpublished Manuscript。
- Winckler, Edwin A. 1984. "Institutionalization and Participation on Taiwan: From Hard to Soft Authoritarianism?" *The China Quarterly* 99 (1984) 481-499.
- _____. 1994. "Cultural Policy in Postwar Taiwan," in Harrell, Stevan A. and Huang Chün-chieh, eds. *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

國科會補助專題研究計畫移地研究心得報告

日期： 105 年 10 月 12 日

計畫編號	NSC102-2410-004-082-MY2		
計畫名稱	全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討		
出國人員姓名	蔡彥仁	服務機構及職稱	國立政治大學宗教研究所教授
出國時間	104 年 7 月 29 日至 104 年 8 月 25 日	出國地點	Boston, USA

一、移地研究過程

本人進行的兩年期專題研究，主要在探討中國大陸自 1978 年改革開放以來，相對於政治、經濟、社會、文化的巨大變動，基督宗教在該地亦是蓬勃發展，在許多層面發生重大的影響。本人從 2011 年即已著手在大陸進行田野調查，累積不少一手資料，需要從不同的學術角度進行深入的分析和詮釋。客觀而言，有關中國當代基督教的研究，無論就廣度和深度而言，仍以外文的學術著作領銜，因此實有必要移地研究，親炙國外圖書館的豐富藏書，並且與相關的學者進行切磋討論，以達攻錯精進之效。職是之故，本人在多方接觸和考慮下，在今年 7 月 29 日～8 月 25 日期間，回母校哈佛大學，進行本研究計畫的移地研究，在計畫將結束之時，對於已撰寫的論文，做修改補強的工作。

二、研究成果

本人在 Boston 的時間共有三週，所進行的工作主要有兩項：一為，將本人在 7 月於澳洲所發表的論文草稿，再進一步修改補充，尤其使用 Boston 地區許多相關的圖書資料，先行費時閱讀，再融入論文內。本人希望此篇論文，題為“Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan”能因此提升品質，期冀發表在國際期刊。（論文參考附件）

本人另外完成的工作，即是趁機會蒐集和閱讀本人將持續的科技部兩年期計畫圖書：「當代中國基督教之興起與世界基督教：內涵特徵之比較研究」（2015-17）。按，此往後兩年的計畫是目前計畫的延續和擴大，目的在將現階段的研究成果，放在更廣的世界基督教的概念框架下，進行跨地區的比較。本人有幸藉此機會，整理出一些相關書目，特別是早期基督教在羅馬帝國的背景資料，皆是在台灣不易獲得者，具有珍貴的價值。

三、建議

科技部能補助學者至海外進行移地研究，可說是一大「德政」。雖然由於網路科技發達，許多資料可藉由電子網路流通，但是對於許多需要大量閱讀以及親炙圖書的人文議題研究而言，研究者親赴一流圖書館，有較多時間浸潤其中，以便整理耙梳，此是相當重要的學術過程，對於研究成果的確定，有深刻的影響。期待以後科技部能在此方面持續嘉惠學者。

四、其他

無。

國科會補助專題研究計畫出席國際學術會議心得報告

日期: 104 年 10 月 12 日

計畫編號	NSC 102-2410-H-004-MY2		
計畫名稱	全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討		
出國人員姓名	蔡彥仁	服務機構及職稱	國立政治大學宗教研究所教授
會議時間	105 年 7 月 5 日至 105 年 7 月 9 日	會議地點	Adelaide, Australia
會議名稱	The 9 th International Convention of Asia Scholars		
發表題目	Food Fellowship and the Making of a Chinese Church: Cases from Contemporary China and Taiwan		

一、參加會議經過

本人過去參加過無數次的國際研討會，但所謂的「國際」，主要以歐美地區為主，卻忽略不少世界其他地域的學術團體和活動。本人在執行本計畫的第二年期間，聞悉澳洲地區人文學界將舉辦亞洲學者聯合會議，認為機會難得，值得與會，可藉機與更多不同背景的學術圈交流互動。本次的 The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars 是同性質的第九屆年會，係由澳洲南部三所大學，以及荷蘭的 International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) 所主辦，但同時聯合 Asian Studies Association of Australia, Chinese Association of Australia, South Asian Studies Association of Australia 三個澳洲全國性學術團體，共同召開，場次達數

百，論文上千，規模盛大。本人此次前往參加，一方面在 7 月 8 日的 Religion Past and Present 場次中，發表個人的論文一篇。另一方面，本人也藉此機會，率領政大宗教研究所三位博士生，組成一個名為 From Missionary to Indigenization and Globalization: Transformation of Church-State Relationship in Modern Chinese Society 的場次，自願擔任主席，協助其在國際場合發表論文。師生合作，一舉兩得，個人增進經驗，學生亦拓展視野，有正面的學術學習和成長的意義。

二、與會心得

本人所發表的論文屬於當代中國基督教研究，此一議題在澳洲尚屬於小眾興趣，還未吸引太多學者注意。不過澳洲學界因為中國大陸的崛起，目前當代大陸的政治、經濟、社會、文化的變化，已經引發相當多人的關注和研究，而宗教的發展，亦是重要議題之一。因此在會議場合，本人引介和解釋的性質多於與專家學者的具體討論。本所三位博士生的論文，所引起的反響，性質亦是如此。因此概略言之，我們師生的出席，成果在與澳洲為主的學者們進行交流，特別有數位負責中國研究的教授主管，積極邀約日後能繼續聯繫，以便進一步學術互動。

另外，本人注意到參與本次大會的成員，由中國大陸出來，或在澳洲求學，或屬於大陸大學的博士生數量相當大。他們大都踴躍發表，積極敢言，頗讓人印象深刻，值得台灣學界比較反思年輕一輩學者的國際競爭力問題。

三、發表論文全文或摘要

Abstract

That food or eating plays an important role in religious orders, celebrations, disciplines, or believers' common life has been much discussed by many scholars, but how this dimension functions in the construction of a Chinese church is territory yet to be explored. The paper I intend to present, based on written documents, interviews, and participatory observations in church communities across the Taiwan Strait, highlights the crucial positions the kitchen and the dining hall assume in the physical setting of a Chinese church, as well as the importance of meal hours that its members cherish and observe. I argue that the Christian message of *koinōnia*, symbolized by the sacrament of the Holy Communion, is effectively materialized in food fellowship among Chinese Christians. This practice tallies well with the traditional Chinese understanding that food reigns supreme in the ordering of a community (*min yishi weitian*). I also argue that thanks to the prominence of this feature, a Chinese church becomes a family writ large. This proves especially attractive in the context of postmodernity, wherein familial ties have been quickly disintegrating, and yet some

Chinese Christian churches that manage eating well have been developing rapidly. By focusing on food fellowship, I hope to bring the contrasts between a Chinese church and its counterpart in the West into clear relief.

五、攜回資料名稱及內容

The 9th International Convention of Asia Scholars, 5-9 July 2015, Adelaide, Australia (Final Program)

六、其他

無

科技部補助計畫衍生研發成果推廣資料表

日期:2015/10/13

科技部補助計畫	計畫名稱：全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討	
	計畫主持人：蔡彥仁	
	計畫編號：102-2410-H-004-082-MY2	學門領域：宗教哲學及宗教研究
無研發成果推廣資料		

102 年度專題研究計畫研究成果彙整表

計畫主持人：蔡彥仁

計畫編號：102-2410-H-004-082-MY2

計畫名稱：全球化潮流下的當代中國基督徒：身份意識與社群建構之探討

成果項目			量化			單位	備註（質化說明：如數個計畫共同成果、成果列為該期刊之封面故事...等）
			實際已達成數（被接受或已發表）	預期總達成數（含實際已達成數）	本計畫實際貢獻百分比		
國內	論文著作	期刊論文	0	0	100%	篇	
		研究報告/技術報告	0	0	100%		
		研討會論文	0	0	100%		
		專書	0	0	100%		
	專利	申請中件數	0	0	100%	件	
		已獲得件數	0	0	100%		
	技術移轉	件數	0	0	100%	件	
		權利金	0	0	100%	千元	
	參與計畫人力（本國籍）	碩士生	0	1	100%	人次	
		博士生	0	1	100%		
		博士後研究員	0	0	100%		
		專任助理	0	0	100%		
國外	論文著作	期刊論文	0	0	100%	篇	
		研究報告/技術報告	0	0	100%		
		研討會論文	0	2	100%		一篇已被接受，將編入專書，在德國出版。另外一篇將在修改後，將投稿外國期刊。
		專書	0	0	100%	章/本	
	專利	申請中件數	0	0	100%	件	
		已獲得件數	0	0	100%		
	技術移轉	件數	0	0	100%	件	
		權利金	0	0	100%	千元	
	參與計畫人力（外國籍）	碩士生	0	0	100%	人次	
		博士生	0	0	100%		
		博士後研究員	0	0	100%		
		專任助理	0	0	100%		

<p>其他成果</p> <p>(無法以量化表達之成果如辦理學術活動、獲得獎項、重要國際合作、研究成果國際影響力及其他協助產業技術發展之具體效益事項等，請以文字敘述填列。)</p>	無。
---	----

	成果項目	量化	名稱或內容性質簡述
科 教 處 計 畫 加 填 項 目	測驗工具(含質性與量性)	0	
	課程/模組	0	
	電腦及網路系統或工具	0	
	教材	0	
	舉辦之活動/競賽	0	
	研討會/工作坊	0	
	電子報、網站	0	
	計畫成果推廣之參與（閱聽）人數	0	

科技部補助專題研究計畫成果報告自評表

請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況、研究成果之學術或應用價值（簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性）、是否適合在學術期刊發表或申請專利、主要發現或其他有關價值等，作一綜合評估。

1. 請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況作一綜合評估

☒ 達成目標

☐ 未達成目標（請說明，以 100 字為限）

☐ 實驗失敗

☐ 因故實驗中斷

☐ 其他原因

說明：

2. 研究成果在學術期刊發表或申請專利等情形：

論文：☐ 已發表 ☒ 未發表之文稿 ☐ 撰寫中 ☐ 無

專利：☐ 已獲得 ☐ 申請中 ☒ 無

技轉：☐ 已技轉 ☐ 洽談中 ☒ 無

其他：（以 100 字為限）

3. 請依學術成就、技術創新、社會影響等方面，評估研究成果之學術或應用價值（簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性）（以 500 字為限）

中國當代基督教之研究，在國際宗教學界已經成為顯學，但礙於台灣的客觀情況，特別是此領域學術人口的侷限，截至目前為止，尚未能開展出具有規模的團隊與成績以為因應。有鑑於中國大陸的崛起，以及宗教在大陸所具有的影響力，本人認為帶動國內學界，特別是有潛力的年輕學者，積極加入國際學界，並提出台灣的研究特色，應該是刻不容緩的工作。本人此兩年期的研究計畫，僅是一開端，主要在提出「什麼是具有中國特色的當代基督教？」，並試圖以「聲音」、「政教關係」、「食物」幾項具有身體與實踐意義的主題，進行反思探索。本人深知後續尚有許多仍待完成的工程，期待在這兩年之後，仍能持續相同方向，更進一步深入其他議題的研究。